



APPROVED 10/20/2021 (sb)

SUMMARIZED MEETING MINUTES

**City of Scottsdale
Environmental Advisory Commission
Regular Meeting**

5:30 p.m.; Wednesday, September 22, 2021

Community Design Studio

7506 E. Indian School Road, Scottsdale, 85251

CALL TO ORDER: 5:31 p.m.

PRESENT: Chair Natalie Chrisman Lazarr, Vice Chair Anthony Coletta; Commission Members: Tammy Bosse (attended electronically at 5:35 p.m.), Walter Cuculic, Ryan Johnson, Steven Schlosser

ABSENT: Commission Member David Abranovic

STAFF PRESENT: Tim Conner, Manager, and Sam Brown - the Office of Environmental Initiatives; Brent Stockwell, Assistant City Manager; Michael Burrell and Amanda Willis, IT/Video Support

PUBLIC COMMENT: Meeting was live streamed on Scottsdale You Tube channel to the public. One member of the public was present; no public comment was received.

1. Approval of Regular Meeting Minutes for July 21, 2021:

Vice Chair Coletta made a motion to approve the Summarized Meeting Minutes from August 18, 2021 with Commissioner Schlosser providing a Second for the motion. This motion carried 5-0, with Chair Chrisman Lazarr, Vice Chair Coletta and Commissioners Cuculic, Johnson and Schlosser voting for APPROVAL.



Persons with a disability may request a reasonable accommodation by contacting the Office of Environmental Initiatives at 480-312-7833 (if any)]. Requests should be made 24 hours in advance, or as early as possible, to allow time to arrange the accommodation. For TTY users, the Arizona Relay Service (1-800-367-8939) may contact the Office of Environmental Initiatives at 480-312-7833.

- 2. Personal address to the Commission:** Commissioner (and former chair) Steven Schlosser addressed the Commission during his final meeting as a member. Assist City Manager Stockwell informed the Commission that Commissioner Schlosser could still retain his position until the City Council appoints his replacement (after the October 20 meeting).

No Action

- 3. Update, discussion, and possible Commission recommendations to staff regarding the Scope of Work for the *Scottsdale Sustainability Plan*.** Dr. Mark Roseland from ASU's Rob and Melani Walton Sustainability Solutions Services provided an update on the content and timeline for the rollout and presentation of the proposed Scope of Work to the Scottsdale City Council at the City Council Work Study Session on October 5, 2021. Chair Chrisman Lazarr requested that the proposed rollout have calendar dates to focus the effort. Commissioner Cuculic initially expressed disappointment with the thought that it would take two years to accomplish the Sustainability Plan when so many cities have already laid down the footprint. Mr. Stockwell emphasized that Scottsdale's aggressive efforts to seek sustainability were pressing forward on many fronts, and that nothing was statically waiting for the Plan to be finished first. He stressed the importance of strategic and thoughtful planning.

No Action

- 4. Discussion and possible Commission recommendations to staff and/or City Council regarding the Urban Heat Island Study - *Strategies for a Cooler Scottsdale*:** The Commission discussed aspects of the ASU study that they wanted Chair Chrisman Lazarr and Commissioner Schlosser (as the Commission's authorized representatives) to publicly address at the City Council Work Study Session on October 5, 2021. During this discussion, Commissioner Schlosser emphasized the economic and social consequences of elevated ambient temperatures (as published in a Science News article) and preserving the overall quality of Scottsdale life.

No Action

- 5. Discussion and possible Commission recommendations to staff on promoting public awareness on water conservation measures, incentives and messaging in response to the formal drought announcement from the Bureau of Reclamation.** Chair Chrisman Lazarr opened the topic by discussing the attached memorandum from the Scottsdale Water Policy Manager, Gretchen Baumgardner, to the Commission. The memo suggested a series of water conservation video ideas, proposed working with the Commission on a *Water Warrior Recognition Award*. The Chair, Vice-Chair Coletta and Commissioner Cuculic agreed to work together with Ms. Baumgardner on these messaging promotions. Commissioner Cuculic inquired about the most effective way to promote "turf removal" as a water conservation measure for commercial properties. He suggested focusing on the large property management firms instead of diluting the effort with the multitude of individual homeowners associations (HOAs).

No Action

- 6. Discussion and possible Commission recommendations regarding the draft letter to City Council (attached) in support of, and education about, the protection of bees as plant pollinators.**

Commissioner Bosse made a motion to approve the draft letter to City Council without amendments or edits; Commissioner Johnson provided a Second for the motion, which carried 6-0, with Chair Chrisman Lazarr, Vice Chair Coletta and Commissioners Bosse, Cuculic, Johnson and Schlosser voting for APPROVAL.

- 7. Discussion and possible Commission recommendations to staff on Public Outreach Strategies for sustainability topics currently under consideration by the Commission or matters of environmental concern submitted to the City or Commission through public forums.** Commissioner Johnson initiated the discussion with a question about how the City proceeded at first with the development of a Sustainability Plan instead of a Climate Action Plan, such as put forward by the City of Tempe. Mr. Stockwell explained that the Sustainability Plan was deemed to be the broader-based approach that would ultimately lay the footprint for the Climate Action Plan. Many of the latter's components are currently under consideration for development (e.g., the ASU Urban Heat Island Study's recommendation for a tree canopy assessment. Chair Chrisman Lazarr discussed the "public outreach" aspect of including citizens in the gathering and reporting of private property tree inventories.

No Action

- 8. Discussion and possible Commission recommendations to staff on promoting public awareness of green events and sustainable practices during the *Canal Convergence* public art event.** The event organizers have recommended that the Commission not be involved in this year's event, due to Covid-19 management decisions for volunteers. The Commission is strongly encouraged to participate in next year's planning process. The Chair tabled this item until February 2022.

No Action

- 9. Discussion and possible Commission recommendations to staff regarding written supplemental information to be provided to the Audit Committee for the *Sunset Review of the Scottsdale Environmental Advisory Commission on October 18, 2021.*** Staff Liaison, Tim Conner, advised the Commission that the *Sunset Review* process has been pushed back to either the November 8th or 15th. Chair Chrisman Lazarr will have a letter prepared for the Commission to review at the October 20 Commission meeting.

No Action

10. Staff Updates:

- General updates – Tim Conner
- Green Building updates - Anthony Floyd
- Sustainable Scottsdale Steering Team updates – Brent Stockwell

No Action

- 11. Review of anticipated items for the October 2021 Commission agenda, including requests by Commission Members for items to be included on future agendas.**

- **Commission *Sunset Review* discussion & possible action**
- **Collection of compostable yard waste in residential green bins**
- **Recyclable construction materials - market conditions and constraints**
- **City tree inventory utilizing citizen participation**
- **Energy Savings Performance Contract and community solar projects update**

Adjournment: 7:03 p.m.

Agenda Item #5

From: [Baumgaertner, Gretchen](#)
To: [Conner, Tim](#)
Cc: [Brown, Sam](#); [Schneider, Valerie](#)
Subject: RE: 9/22 SEAC Meeting
Date: Wednesday, September 22, 2021 9:12:03 AM

Hi Tim/Sam,

The two items that were mentioned at last month's SEAC meeting were:

1. **Series of conservation video tips** – The mayor is also interested in being a part of an effort like this and it would be helpful to have input/assistance from SEAC commissioners. As a reminder a few of the video ideas that were presented last month were:
 - a. How to use the WaterSmart portal
 - b. What is a Residential Outdoor Efficiency Check
 - c. Tips on Converting to a Desert Adaptive landscape
 - d. How to efficiently water your functional grass area and seasonal irrigation scheduling
 - e. Checking for leaks
2. **Water Warrior recognition award** – In searching our website I found a past award: EQAB Environmental Achievement Recognition Award. It looks like it hasn't been used since 2019. This system could be revitalized and amended with respects to the water conservation aspect and maybe other elements depending on the SEAC's desire to revamp this award. This could be a collaborative process with the commissioners and staff to update criteria and how the awardee is recognized. <https://www.scottsdaleaz.gov/planning-development/environmental-initiatives-compliance/environmental-achievement-award>

Please let me know if you need additional information and how the meeting goes.

~Gretchen

Agenda Item #6

August 2021

DRAFT

Re: Protection of Bees and Pollinators

Dear Mayor and Council:

One of our commissioners recently had a bee experience at his home that has brought a new awareness on the Scottsdale Environmental Advisory Commission regarding pollinators. This letter shares the new awareness, and proposes support for Scottsdale to become Arizona's first "Bee City USA" city.

Background

On a recent weekend afternoon, a swarm of bees descended on the backyard of one of our Commissioners. Alarmed by the site, his first instinct was to do a simple Google search for bee removal. The first bid he received over the phone was a few hundred dollars, and the company could arrive within an hour. In the second phone call he made, the cost quoted was almost twice as much ... and the service couldn't send anyone for several days. The second service suggested that the lower-cost first service was probably an exterminator that would kill the hive; the second service guaranteed they would relocate the hive without destroying it.

The bees voluntarily left our Commissioner's yard within a day. But this situation led to the realization that the cheapest and fastest option to resolve a bee issue in or around a residence in Scottsdale is extermination. We understand that human safety should always be a concern around bees, but we, as a commission, would like to do something about the un-regulated destruction of pollinators which are vital to our natural ecosystem.

A quote that is often attributed to Albert Einstein is: "If the bee disappeared off the surface of the globe, man would only have four years of life left. No more bees, no more pollination, no more plants, no more animals, no more man."

Action Taken in Scottsdale

After this backyard bee story was shared with the Commission, both city staff and Commissioners began to take inventory of what was being communicated regarding pollinators on our public websites.

Some internal research by Commission staff indicated that during the first six months of 2021, the city placed 116 calls for bee removal. The majority were exterminated. Most city departments indicated that they will leave bees that are not threatening humans. However, bees swarms and hives that are threatening to humans are frequently destroyed.

The Scottsdale Fire Department responds to homeowner calls to 911 for bee attacks, or to mitigate the potential for attacks. SFD does not spray or exterminate a hive or swarm. They advise the homeowner on bee safety (do not provoke; pet care, etc.), and they may advise the homeowner to contact a bee removal service.

Despite this reasonable approach by SFD, we noticed that the language regarding bees on the City's Fire Department webpage emphasized that bees were potentially dangerous to human health, with no mention of their importance to the ecosystem. Working with a bee scholar at the University of Arizona College of Agriculture and Life Sciences and the City's Communication staff, we have added language to