



**SCOTTSDALE HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
COMMUNITY DESIGN STUDIO
7506 E. INDIAN SCHOOL ROAD
SCOTTSDALE, ARIZONA
Thursday, January 5, 2023**

***SUMMARIZED MEETING MINUTES ***

PRESENT:

Linda Davis, Chair
Peter Hosmer, Vice Chair
Ben Brosseau, Commissioner
Brin Sherrin, Commissioner
Jon Griffin, Commissioner
Rose Smith, Commissioner
Courtney Lage, Commissioner

ABSENT:

None

STAFF:

Jesús Murillo
Ben Moriarity
Nick Carroll
Mark Kertis
Jason McWilliams

CALL TO ORDER

Chair Davis called the meeting of the Historic Preservation Commission to order at 6:03 PM.

ROLL CALL

A formal roll call was conducted confirming members present as stated above.

PUBLIC COMMENT

HP Commission did not receive any non-agendized public comment requests.

* Note: These are summary action minutes only. A complete copy of the meeting audio is available on the Historic Preservation Commission website at:

<https://www.scottsdaleaz.gov/boards/historic-preservation-commission>

ADMINISTRATIVE REPORT

Identify supplemental information, if any, related to the November 3, 2022, Historic Preservation Commission agenda items, and other correspondence.

- **ADMINISTRATIVE REPORT PROVIDED BY JESÚS MURILLO:**
- **MR. MURILLO WELCOMED THE COMMISSION BACK THIS NEW YEAR AND THANKED THE COMMISSION FOR THEIR PATIENCE WITH TECHNICAL DIFFICULTIES.**
- **MR. MURILLO AND COMMISSIONER BROSSAU INFORMED THE HP COMMISSION OF THE SCOTTSDALE PARADA DEL SOL HISTORIC PARADE AND TRAILS END FESTIVAL AND PROVIDED INVITATION TO PARTICIPATE**
- **MR MURILLO INFORMED THE COMMISSIONERS OF FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS: INCLUDING A POSSIBLE CASE FOR HEARING**
- **MR. MURILLO INFORMED THE HP COMMISSION OF THE FIRST CONSENT ITEM.**

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

1. Approval of the November 3, 2022, Historic Preservation Commission Meeting Minutes.
 - **VICE CHAIR HOSMER MOVED TO APPROVE THE NOVEMBER 3, 2022, HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION MEETING MINUTES. 2ND BY CHAIR DAVIS.**
 - **MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY IN FAVOR BY CHAIR DAVIS, VICE CHAIR HOSMER, COMMISSIONER BROSSAU, COMMISSIONER GRIFFIN, COMMISSIONER SMITH, COMMISSIONER SHERRIN, AND COMMISSIONER LAGE WITH AN AYE VOTE OF SEVEN (7) TO ZERO (0).**

CONSENT AGENDA

2. 2022 Historic Preservation Commission Annual Report
Review and possible approval of the 2022 Historic Preservation Commission Annual Report.
Staff contact person is Jesús Murillo, (480) 312-7849.
 - **VICE CHAIR HOSMER MOVED TO APPROVE THE 2022 HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION ANNUAL REPORT, 2ND BY COMMISSIONER GRIFFIN.**
 - **MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY IN FAVOR BY CHAIR DAVIS, VICE CHAIR HOSMER, COMMISSIONER BROSSAU, COMMISSIONER GRIFFIN, COMMISSIONER SMITH, COMMISSIONER SHERRIN, AND COMMISSIONER LAGE WITH AN AYE VOTE OF SEVEN (7) TO ZERO (0).**

* Note: These are summary action minutes only. A complete copy of the meeting audio is available on the Historic Preservation Commission website at:

<https://www.scottsdaleaz.gov/boards/historic-preservation-commission>

REGULAR AGENDA3. 83-HP-2022 (Bimer Residence)

Request by Owner for the approval of a Certificate of Appropriateness - Historic Resources for the conversion of an existing carport to a garage and a new carport addition, for a residence within the Village Grove 1-6 historic community, located at 6637 E Oak Street, with Single-family Residential District, Historic Property (R1-7/HP) zoning designation.

Staff contact person is Nick Carroll, (480) 312-4205.

Applicant contact person is Deanna Bimer, (602) 380-2381.

- **NICK CARROLL PRESENTED (ON BEHALF OF STAFF) CASE 83-HP-2022 BEFORE THE HP COMMISSION AND PROVIDED STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION OF APPROVAL AS PER PROVIDED STIPULATIONS.**
- **THE APPLICANT (MR AND MRS. BIMER) PROVIDED THE OWNER'S PRESENTATION BEFORE THE HP COMMISSION WHICH INCLUDED COMMENTS REGARDING OWNERSHIP HISTORY, EXSITING CONDITIONS AND THE PROPOSED REQUEST (LANDSCAPING IMPROVEMENTS, ADDITION OF PAVERS, REMOVAL OF SIDING, CARPORT, CONSTRCUTION METHODS, AND DOOR STYLE)**
- **HP COMMISSION PROVIDED COMMENTS REGARDING: THE FEELING OF OPENESS OF CARPORT STRCUTURE VERSUS GARAGES AND CHANGE IN MASSING AND PROPOSED CARPORT APPEARS LIKE AN ADD-ON, NOT AGREEING WITH PROPOSED GARAGE DOOR STYLE, CARPORT, AND PAVERS. HP COMMISSION PROVIDED COMMENTS STATING THAT PROPOSAL WAS SEEN AS MINIMIZING THE SPACE BETWEEN ADJOINING STRUCTURES, AND PROPOSED CHANGING BLOCK SIZE FOR GARAGE CONSTRUCTION.**
- **MR AND MRS. BIMER ANSWERED QUESTIONS REGARDING DRIVEWAY MATERIALS.**
- **VICE CHAIR HOSMER MOVED TO APPROVE THE CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS FOR 83-HP-2022 WITH AMENDMENT TO STIPULATIONS; 2ND BY CHAIR DAVIS.**
- **MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY IN FAVOR BY CHAIR DAVIS, VICE CHAIR HOSMER, COMMISSIONER BROSSAU, COMMISSIONER GRIFFIN, COMMISSIONER SMITH, COMMISSIONER SHERRIN, AND COMMISSIONER LAGE WITH AN AYE VOTE OF SEVEN (7) TO ZERO (0), INCLUDING MODIFICATIONS TO THE STIPULATIONS (REFERENCE ATTACHMENT "A" TO THESE MINUTES).**

* Note: These are summary action minutes only. A complete copy of the meeting audio is available on the Historic Preservation Commission website at:

<https://www.scottsdaleaz.gov/boards/historic-preservation-commission>

4. 84-HP-2022 (Lee Residence)

Request by owner for the approval of a Certificate of Appropriateness - Historic Resources for the modification to the front facade on a residence within the Villa Monterey Units 1-7 historic district, located at 7836 E Coolidge Street, with Multi-family Residence, Historic Property (R-5 HP) zoning designation.

Staff contact person is Ben Moriarity, (480) 312-2836.

Applicant contact person is Susan Lee, (602) 339-2006.

- **BEN MORIARITY PRESENTED (ON BEHALF OF STAFF) CASE 86-HP-2022 BEFORE THE HP COMMISSION AND PROVIDED STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION OF APPROVAL AS PER PROVIDED STIPULATIONS.**
- **THE HP COMMISSION RECEIVED ONE REQUEST TO SPEAK BY RESIDENT CRAIG SJODIN. MR. SJODIN SPOKE IN FAVOR OF THE REQUEST.**
- **THE APPLICANT (MS. LEE) PROVIDED THE OWNER'S PRESENTATION BEFORE THE HP COMMISSION WHICH INCLUDED COMMENTS REGARDING: FELT THAT THE HOA APPROVAL WAS THE ONLY APPROVAL REQUIRED. MET WITH CITY STAFF, REQUESTING MODIFICATION OF THE FRONT FAÇADE (REMOVAL OF WEEPING MORTAR), STUCCO ADDED TO FRONT FAÇADE, APPROVAL OF PAINT COLOR, APPROVAL OF AWNING VERSUS THE REMOVED SHED ROOF OVERHANG AND SHUTTERS, AND MODIFYING THE REQUEST OF THE PONY WALL.**
- **HP COMMISSION DISCUSSION INCLUDED: THE FRONT WINDOWSILLS POSSIBLY BEING OUT OF CHARACTER, CONFIRMATION OF HOA APPROVAL, PRACTICALITY OF RECREATING THE WEEPING MORTAR, REBUILDING THE SHED ROOF OVERHANG VERSUS THE SHADE AWNINGS, PROPOSED COLOR, SUGGESTED STAFF SEND LETTERS TO HOA REMINDING THE HOA THE REQUIREMENTS FOR C.O.N.E. AND C.O.A., AWNINGS LOCATED ON OTHER PROPERTIES, AND REVIEW OF PROPOSED UPDATED CHANGES TO PONY WALL.**
- **THE APPLICANT PROVIDED PICTURES OF PROPOSED DESIGN FOR PONY WALL AND WINDOW SHUTTERS.**
- **VICE CHAIR HOSMER MOVED TO APPROVE THE CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS FOR 86-HP-2022 WITH STIPULATIONS; 2ND BY COMMISSIONER LAGE.**
- **MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY IN FAVOR BY CHAIR DAVIS, VICE CHAIR HOSMER, COMMISSIONER BROSSAU, COMMISSIONER GRIFFIN, COMMISSIONER SMITH, COMMISSIONER SHERRIN, AND COMMISSIONER LAGE WITH AN AYE VOTE OF SEVEN (7) TO ZERO (0), INCLUDING MODIFICATIONS TO THE STIPULATIONS.**

* Note: These are summary action minutes only. A complete copy of the meeting audio is available on the Historic Preservation Commission website at:

<https://www.scottsdaleaz.gov/boards/historic-preservation-commission>

5. Approval of the Historic Preservation Commission 2023 Calendar
Review and discussion for approval of the 2023 Historic Preservation Commission Calendar.
 - **JESÚS MURILLO PRESENTED IN FRONT OF THE COMMISSION.**
 - **VICE CHAIR HOSMER MOVED TO APPROVE THE HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION 2023 CALENDAR; 2ND BY COMMISSIONER BROSSÉAU. MOTION INCLUDED MODIFICATION OF THE PROPOSED APRIL 6, 2023. HPC HEARING DATE BEING MOVED TO APRIL 4, 2023 DATE.**
 - **MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY IN FAVOR BY CHAIR DAVIS, VICE CHAIR HOSMER, COMMISSIONER BROSSÉAU, COMMISSIONER GRIFFIN, COMMISSIONER SMITH, COMMISSIONER SHERRIN, AND COMMISSIONER LAGE WITH AN AYE VOTE OF SEVEN (7) TO ZERO (0).**

6. Historic Preservation Commission Work Program
Review, discussion, and possible direction regarding the Historic Preservation Commission Work Program.
 - **JESÚS MURILLO PRESENTED IN FRONT OF THE COMMISSION.**
 - **VICE CHAIR HOSMER MOVED TO APPROVE THE HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION 2023 CALENDAR; 2ND BY CHAIR DAVIS.**
 - **MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY IN FAVOR BY CHAIR DAVIS, VICE CHAIR HOSMER, COMMISSIONER BROSSÉAU, COMMISSIONER GRIFFIN, COMMISSIONER SMITH, COMMISSIONER SHERRIN, AND COMMISSIONER LAGE WITH AN AYE VOTE OF SEVEN (7) TO ZERO (0).**

7. HPC Historic Districts Outreach Update and List
Review, discussion, and possible direction regarding the Historic Preservation Commission outreach list.
 - **JESÚS MURILLO PRESENTED IN FRONT OF THE COMMISSION.**
 - **THE COMMISSION DISCUSSED THE OUTREACH UPDATE AND LIST.**

8. McCormick-Stillman Railroad Park “Bunkhouse” Update
Presentation providing update and discussion to the future of the “bunkhouse” located at McCormick-Stillman Railroad Park.
 - **JESÚS MURILLO PRESENTED IN FRONT OF THE COMMISSION.**
 - **THE COMMISSION DISCUSSED THE MCCORMICK-STILLMAN RAILROAD PARK “BUNKHOUSE”.**

9. 2023 Election of Officers

* Note: These are summary action minutes only. A complete copy of the meeting audio is available on the Historic Preservation Commission website at:

<https://www.scottsdaleaz.gov/boards/historic-preservation-commission>

Staff requests that the Historic Preservation Commission elect the Chair and Vice Chair for 2023.

Staff contact person is Jesús Murillo, (480) 312-7849.

- **VICE CHAIR HOSMER MADE A NOMINATION FOR VICE CHAIR HOSMER TO REMAIN AS VICE CHAIR. CHAIR DAVIS MADE A NOMINATION FOR CHAIR DAVIS TO REMAIN AS CHAIR. THE MOTION FOR VICE CHAIR HOSMER AS VICE CHAIR. MOTION CARRIED IN FAVOR BY CHAIR DAVIS, VICE CHAIR HOSMER, COMMISSIONER BROSSAU, COMMISSIONER GRIFFIN, COMMISSIONER SMITH, COMMISSIONER SHERRIN, AND COMMISSIONER LAGE WITH AN AYE VOTE OF SEVEN (7) TO ZERO (0).**

ADJOURNMENT

With no further business to discuss, the regular meeting of the Historic Preservation Commission adjourned at 8:04 PM.

**Stipulations for the
Historic Preservation Commission Application:
Bimer Residence Carport Conversion to Garage and Carport
Addition
Case Number: 83-HP-2022**

The following text has been amended as per the January 5, 2023, Historic Preservation Commission (HPC) direction. "**Bold**" text, denotes text or stipulations added by the HPC; and "~~stricken~~" text denotes text removed or stipulations denied by the HPC.

These stipulations are intended to protect the public health, safety, welfare, and the City of Scottsdale.

APPLICABLE DOCUMENTS AND PLANS:

1. Except as required by the Scottsdale Revised Code (SRC), the Design Standards and Policies Manual (DSPM), and the other stipulations herein, the site design and construction shall substantially conform to the following documents:
 - a. Architectural elements, including dimensions, materials, form, color, and texture, shall be constructed to be consistent with the building elevations submitted by Deanna Bimer with a city staff date of December 8, 2022.
 - b. The location and configuration of all site improvements shall be consistent with the site plan submitted by Deanna Bimer, with a city staff date of December 8, 2022.

RELEVANT CASES:

Ordinance

- A. At the time of review, the applicable cases for the subject site were 25-ZN-2004 and 10-HP-2004.

ARCHITECTURAL DESIGN:

HPC Stipulations

1. A traditional style garage door with raised panels arranged in rows shall be used. Rectangular windows are optional.
 - c. Garage door shall not be of a "farmhouse" style with barn-like details (cross panels that resemble slats, arched/grid-pane windows, and decorative handles/hardware).
2. The height of the proposed weeping mortar located on the proposed garage enclosure shall match the height of the existing weeping mortar on the primary façade, **and the weeping mortar and block construction to be modified to provide 8"x4"x16" block instead of the proposed/existing 8"x8"x16" block.**

3. ~~The roof ridge line of the carport addition shall extend to a point where the pitch matches the existing roof.~~ **Proposed carport addition and proposed pavers, accessing the proposed carport addition, are denied, and not included as part of the Certificate of Appropriateness.**