



**SCOTTSDALE HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
COMMUNITY DESIGN STUDIO
7506 E. INDIAN SCHOOL ROAD
SCOTTSDALE, ARIZONA
THURSDAY, JUNE 5, 2025**

SUMMARIZED MEETING MINUTES

PRESENT:

Jay Panzer, Commissioner
Rose Smith, Vice Chair
Brin Sherrin, Commissioner
Mark Estes, Commissioner
Brandon Fadden, Commissioner
Ryan Hilbun, Commissioner

STAFF:

Adam Yaron
Jesús Murillo
Ben Moriarity
Nick Carroll
Taylor Reynolds
Lorraine Castro

CALL TO ORDER

Chair Panzer called the meeting of the Historic Preservation Commission to order at 6:01 PM.

ROLL CALL

A formal roll call was conducted confirming members present as stated above.

PUBLIC COMMENT

HPC received zero (0) request to speak cards for non-agendized items.

ADMINISTRATIVE REPORT

1. Identify supplemental information, related to the June 5, 2025 Historic Preservation Commission agenda items, and other correspondence.

Administrative Report provided by Adam Yaron.

APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES

2. Approval of the May 1, 2025 Historic Preservation Commission Agenda Meeting Minutes.

Commissioner Estes made a motion to approve the May 1, 2025 Historic Preservation Regular Meeting Minutes, seconded by Vice Chair Smith. The Motion passed unanimously in favor by Chair Panzer, Vice Chair Smith, Commissioners Sherrin, Estes, Fadden and Hilbun with a vote of six (6) to zero (0).

REGULAR ITEMS

3. 23-HP-2025: Young Patio Screening
Request for approval of a Certificate of Appropriateness to screen in balcony patio at a residence within the Villa Monterey Unit Seven historic district with Multiple-family Residential, Historic Property (R-5 HP) zoning.
Staff Contact: Ben Moriarity, Senior Planner, bmoriarity@scottsdaleaz.gov
480-312-2836

Commissioner Hilbun motioned to approve with stipulations, seconded by Commissioner Fadden. Motion failed, case denied, by a vote of three (3) to three (3), with Commissioners Estes, Fadden, and Hilbun in the affirmative, and Chair Panzer, Vice Chair Smith, and Commissioner Sherrin dissenting.

Commissioner Hilbun motioned to continue, seconded by Commissioner Estes, then rescinded his motion after Commission discussion.

4. 32-HP-2025: Currier Front Trellis
Request for a Certificate of Appropriateness to install a trellis on the front of a residence within the Villa Monterey Unit Four historic district with Townhouse Residential, Historic Property (R-4 HP) zoning.
Staff Contact: Nick Carroll, AICP, Planner, ncarroll@scottsdaleaz.gov, 480-312-4205

John Baughn and Mike Flamini provided public comments in support of the item.

Vice Chair Smith motioned to approve with stipulation that the top of the trellis must be square-top (flat, no arch) and must not exceed the height of the existing window or top of the carport to maintain a consistent horizontal design/geometry, seconded by Commissioner Estes. Motion carried by a vote of five (5) to one (1), with Chair Panzer, Vice Chair Smith, Commissioners Estes, Fadden, and Hilbun in the affirmative, and Commissioner Sherrin dissenting.

5. 33-HP-2025: Hodson Residence Arched Doorway
Request for a Certificate of Appropriateness to allow existing improvements—including an arched doorway with gate and lighting element and two attached trellis structures and trim painted to match the body of the home on the front façade—to remain at a residence within Villa Monterey Unit Three, Townhouse Residential, Historic Property (R-4 HP) zoning designation.

* Note: These are summary action minutes only. A complete copy of the meeting audio is available on the Historic Preservation Commission website at:

<https://www.scottsdaleaz.gov/boards/historic-preservation-commission>

Staff Contact: Taylor Reynolds, Principal Planner, treynolds@scottsdaleaz.gov,
480-312-4205

Mike Flamini, John Baughn, and Wayne DeBus provided public comment in support of the item.

The Commission reached consensus to discuss and take separate action on the individual components of the applicant's request, including:

- **Applicant Request #1 – Arched doorway with gate and lighting element**
- **Applicant Request #2 – Two attached trellis structures**
- **Applicant Request #3 – Trim painted to match the body of the home on the front façade**

Vice Chair Smith motioned to approve Applicant Request #2, two attached trellis structures, seconded by Commissioner Fadden. Motion failed by a vote of three (3) to three (3), with Vice Chair Smith, Commissioners Fadden and Hilbun in the affirmative, and Chair Panzer, Commissioners Sherrin and Estes dissenting.

Chair Panzer motioned to continue applicant request #2 to a future meeting, seconded by Commissioner Fadden. Chair Panzer suggested, with Commission agreement, to table the motion until such time the Commission discussed and voted on requests #1 and #3 of the Owner's application.

Commissioner Hilbun motioned to approve Applicant Request #1, arched doorway with gate and lighting element, with a stipulation to bring the height into conformance with the R-4 district development standards, seconded by Commissioner Estes. Motion carried by a vote of five (5) to one (1), with Vice Chair Smith, Commissioners Sherrin Estes, Fadden, and Hilbun in the affirmative, and Chair Panzer dissenting.

Commissioner Hilbun made a motion to approve Applicant Request #3, trim painted to match the body of the home on the front façade, seconded by Commissioner Fadden. Motion failed by a vote of three (3) to three (3), with Vice Chair Smith, Commissioners Fadden and Hilbun in the affirmative, and Chair Panzer, Commissioners Sherrin and Estes dissenting.

Commissioner Hilbun motioned to continue applicant request #3 to a future meeting, seconded by Commissioner Fadden. Motion carried with a vote of four (4) to two (2), with Vice Chair Smith, Commissioners Sherrin, Fadden, and Hilbun in the affirmative, and Chair Panzer and Commissioner Estes dissenting.

The Commission considered the tabled motion by Chair Panzer and seconded by Commissioner Panzer to continue applicant request #2 to a future meeting. Motion carried by a vote of five (5) to one (1), with Chair Panzer, Vice Chair Smith, Commissioners Estes, Fadden, and Hilbun in the affirmative, and Commissioner Sherrin dissenting.

* Note: These are summary action minutes only. A complete copy of the meeting audio is available on the Historic Preservation Commission website at:
<https://www.scottsdaleaz.gov/boards/historic-preservation-commission>

NON-ACTION ITEMS

6. Commissioner Items

Per Section 211 of the Bylaws of the Historic Preservation Commission, this item provides the Commission the opportunity to consider the following Commissioner-submitted items:

- A request by Commissioner Sherrin to agendize a presentation on House Bill 2721 relating to middle housing at a future meeting of the Historic Preservation Commission.

Consideration of such item includes: 1) request that the Commission Liaison agendize the item for a future meeting; 2) request that the Commission Liaison investigate the matter and prepare a written response to the Commission; or 3) take no further action. Per Arizona State law, the Commission shall not discuss or take action with respect to any matter not specifically listed on the agenda.

Commissioner Sherrin made a motion to agendize a presentation on House Bill 2721 to a future meeting, seconded by Vice Chair Smith. The Motion passed unanimously in favor by Chair Panzer, Vice Chair Smith, Commissioners Sherrin, Estes, Fadden and Hilbun with a vote of six (6) to zero (0).

ADJOURNMENT

With no further business to discuss, the regular meeting of the Historic Preservation Commission adjourned at 8:18 PM.