



**CITY OF SCOTTSDALE  
HUMAN RELATIONS COMMISSION  
REGULAR MEETING**

**SUMMARIZED MINUTES**

**Monday, March 8, 2021**

**Meeting Held Electronically**

**PRESENT:** Janice Shimokubo, Chair  
Emily Hinchman, Vice Chair  
James Eaneman  
Marty Day  
Hannellie Mendoza  
Stuart Rhoden  
Lawdan Shojaee

**STAFF:** Sharon Cini  
Kelly Corsette  
Brent Stockwell  
Bill Hylan

**Call to Order/Roll Call**

Chair Shimokubo called the meeting to order at 5:00 p.m.

Members present as listed above.

**Public Comment**

No public comments were submitted.

**1. Approval of minutes from the January 11, 2021 meeting**

COMMISSIONER EANEMAN MOVED TO APPROVE THE JANUARY 11, 2021 HUMAN RELATIONS COMMISSION MEETING MINUTES. COMMISSIONER DAY SECONDED THE MOTION, WHICH CARRIED SEVEN (7) TO ZERO (0) BY ROLL CALL VOTE. CHAIR SHIMOKUBO, VICE-CHAIR HINCHMAN, COMMISSIONERS DAY, EANEMAN, MENDOZA,

RHODEN, AND SHOJAE VOTED IN THE AFFIRMATIVE. THERE WERE NO DISSENTING VOTES.

**2. Presentation, discussion and possible recommendation(s) to staff or City Council regarding the non-discrimination ordinance**

Ms. Cini presented the proposed anti-discrimination ordinance. Other cities who have implemented an anti-discrimination ordinance include Flagstaff, Phoenix, Sedona, Tempe, Tucson, Winslow, and Mesa. She noted that the switch from non-discrimination ordinance to “anti-discrimination ordinance” is intended to indicate that our society is taking an active stance against discrimination. The ordinance has been recommended, because federal, state and local law do not prohibit discrimination in places of public accommodation or housing based upon sexual orientation and gender identity. Ms. Cini reviewed the policy statement and complaints procedure associated with the ordinance.

Discussion ensued regarding the decision to change the language from “non-discrimination” to “anti-discrimination.” They questioned the addition of six more classes associated with veterans’ protections.

Mr. Stockwell noted that the change to use the term anti-discrimination was made at the request of Mayor Ortega. He said that the language selected about elected/appointed officials is in reference to the fact that language is included in the code of ethical behavior, which gives City Council the ability to remove someone who commits a violation from office. During their retreat, Council directed staff to compare the proposed Scottsdale ordinance to the newly enacted Mesa ordinance. It was discovered that Mesa had included veterans’ status as a category. Staff presented the ordinance to the Veterans Advisory Commission during their last meeting and the commission recommended the addition of equal protections for all military branches and levels of service as well as their spouses.

Commissioners expressed concerns about and questioned the necessity of adding veterans’ protections, because they are covered under other protections and because they are not aware of evidence of discrimination against veterans’ classes. They opined that veterans who are discriminated against for classifications listed in the ordinance would be protected. It was suggested that the six categories be eliminated and replaced with umbrella language veterans’ classes. It was noted that Chicago’s ordinance uses the term “discharge status.”

Mr. Hylan responded to a question about whether private clubs and small businesses would have to change their policies or the way they do business. He said that he does not have specific information on the topic but said that as long as they are not discriminating against individuals, it is unlikely that they would have to change any practices. The ordinance will not cause a great disruption to the way people conduct business.

VICE-CHAIR HINCHMAN MOVED TO RECOMMEND DELETION OF THE SIX NEW CLASSES AND REPLACE THEM WITH “MILITARY VETERANS’ STATUS.” COMMISSIONER EANEMAN SECONDED THE MOTION, WHICH CARRIED SEVEN (7) TO ZERO (0) BY ROLL CALL VOTE. CHAIR SHIMOKUBO, VICE-CHAIR HINCHMAN, COMMISSIONERS DAY, EANEMAN, MENDOZA, RHODEN, AND SHOJAE VOTED IN THE AFFIRMATIVE. THERE WERE NO DISSENTING VOTES.

**3. Presentation, discussion and possible recommendation(s) to staff or City Council regarding the 2020 National survey results**

James Johnson gave a presentation highlighting outcomes of the 2020 national community survey results. The return rate was approximately 21 percent, which is consistent with past surveys.

Commissioners briefly discussed the results. Mr. Stockwell suggested that a more robust discussion about the survey as it relates to the work the HRC is doing be agendized for a future meeting.

**4. Discussion and possible recommendations regarding future community Town Halls**

- Date, time, topic

Commissioner Rhoden said that the date that has been considered for the next town hall is Wednesday, April 7, 2021. Several topics have been suggested, but the one title that seems to be a favorite is "Riots, Racism, and Reconciliation."

Commissioners discussed title options, including the possibility of focusing on an anti-discrimination topic. It was agreed that "Riots, Racism, and Reconciliation" would be an appropriate title for the upcoming town hall.

COMMISSIONER SHOJAE MOVED TO APPROVE THE TOPIC "RIOTS, RACISM, AND RECONCILIATION" AS THE TOPIC FOR THE NEXT COMMUNITY TOWN HALL. CHAIR SHIMOKUBO SECONDED THE MOTION, WHICH CARRIED WITH A VOTE OF SEVEN (7) TO ZERO (0). . CHAIR SHIMOKUBO, VICE-CHAIR HINCHMAN, COMMISSIONERS DAY, EANEMAN, MENDOZA, RHODEN, AND SHOJAE VOTED IN THE AFFIRMATIVE. THERE WERE NO DISSENTING VOTES.

**5. Presentation, discussion and possible recommendation regarding the Commission's Strategic Plan and 2021 activities and updates**

Commissioners gave updates on strategic planning projects as follows:

- Increased commissioner involvement in events and campaigns

Vice-Chair Hinchman noted that Commissioner Day suggested to her that, as a tool for increasing community awareness about activities of the commission, the Scottsdale Independent be asked to publish articles highlighting the Commission. Options include either a series of articles highlighting individual commissioners and their backgrounds or one feature article, highlighting the Human Relations Commission goals and accomplishments.

VICE-CHAIR HINCHMAN MOVED TO DO A SCOTTSDALE INDEPENDENT ARTICLE ABOUT THE COMMISSION. COMMISSIONER EANEMAN SECONDED THE MOTION, WHICH CARRIED SEVEN (7) TO ZERO (0). . CHAIR SHIMOKUBO, VICE-CHAIR HINCHMAN, COMMISSIONERS DAY, EANEMAN, MENDOZA, RHODEN, AND SHOJAE VOTED IN THE AFFIRMATIVE. THERE WERE NO DISSENTING VOTES.

- Identifying the critical diversity issues in Scottsdale and using the trends to guide Commission activities

Commissioner Mendoza said that they are continuing to review data and trends outlined in the national survey results. She has created a chart of interesting trends over the years that she will provide to Commissioners. Additional discussion will be agendaized for the April meeting.

- Developing stronger ties with partners

Commissioner Shoajee suggested that the topic be tabled until next year.

COMMISSIONER EANEMAN MOVED TO TABLE THE TOPIC OF STRENGTHENING TIES WITH DIVERSITY PARTNERS UNTIL NEXT YEAR. VICE-CHAIR HINCHMAN SECONDED THE MOTION, WHICH CARRIED SEVEN (7) TO ZERO (0). CHAIR SHIMOKUBO, VICE-CHAIR HINCHMAN, COMMISSIONERS EANEMAN, DAY, MENDOZA, RHODEN, AND SHOJAEV VOTED IN THE AFFIRMATIVE. THERE WERE NO DISSENTING VOTES.

- City relationships

Chair Shimokubo reported that they recently met with the library staff. Library staff are working towards incorporating diversity and inclusion into book discussion groups beginning next fall.

Meetings are scheduled with Economic Development and Experience Scottsdale. Chair Shimokubo met with Mayor Ortega in February. She will give a report on those meetings during the April HRC meeting.

#### **6. Updates, discussion and possible recommendation(s) to staff regarding recent and upcoming diversity and inclusion related activities and incidents impacting the city of Scottsdale**

- Arizona Persian New Year Festival – March 6-7, 2021

The Persian New Year Festival on March 6-7 was a successful event. Commissioner Shoajee noted that Mayor Ortega was in attendance and Governor Ducey sent a proclamation.

- Arizona Pride Festival 2021 – postponed until November

The Arizona Pride Festival has been postponed until November 2021.

Ms. Cini noted that Arizona American Indian Festival will be scheduled. The Jazz Festival is scheduled for April 30, 2021. Information about event dates can be found on the Scottsdale website under “City events.”

## **7. Identification of Future Agenda Items**

Future agenda items include:

- Update on the National Citizen Survey
- Update on Town Hall activities
- Update on the ADO

The next meeting is scheduled for April 12, 2021.

### **Adjournment**

VICE-CHAIR HINCHMAN MOVED TO ADJOURN THE MEETING. COMMISSIONER EANEMAN SECONDED THE MOTION, WHICH CARRIED SEVEN (7) TO ZERO (0). CHAIR SHIMOKUBO, VICE-CHAIR HINCHMAN, COMMISSIONERS EANEMAN, DAY, MENDOZA, RHODEN, AND SHOJAEV VOTED IN THE AFFIRMATIVE. THERE WERE NO DISSENTING VOTES.

With no further business to discuss, being duly moved and seconded, the meeting adjourned at 7:16 p.m.

Recorded and Transcribed by eScribers, LLC.