



**City of Scottsdale  
Library Board  
Regular Meeting Minutes**  
Wednesday, December 10, 2025  
Mustang Book Discussion Room  
10101 N. 90th Street  
Scottsdale, AZ 85258

**PRESENT:** Chair Dr. Freda Hartman, Vice-Chair Enid Seiden (departed at 5:23 p.m.), Board Members Sam Campana, Roselyn O'Connell, Monica Sonnenklar, Janice Shimokubo, Leslie Totten

**ABSENT:** None

**STAFF:** Michael Beck, Library Director; Angela Calabresi, Assistant City Attorney; Raven Creech, Branch Manager; Ben Shabat, Library staff; Medina Zick, Senior Library Manager

**Call to Order**

Chair Hartman called the meeting to order at 3:00 p.m.

**Roll Call**

Members present as listed above.

**Public Comment**

There was no response to the call for public comment.

**Minutes – November 12, 2025**

Member Shimokubo requested that "Council Member Shimokubo" be changed on page 2 and that she be added to the list of Board members on page 5 who expressed they were neutral on the topic of the Board retreat. Chair Hartman wanted a line added to the end of that section, capturing the vote of all Board members. It was decided that "made" would be changed to "raised" in the third bullet point in Item 7.

Discussion ensued regarding the language in Item 6 with direction given to better reflect what Chair Hartman was requesting, a clearer tally of the Board members' votes, and removal of the sentence about a discussion on some of the Board members' term limits expiring.

VICE-CHAIR SEIDEN MOVED TO APPROVE THE NOVEMBER 12, 2025, LIBRARY BOARD MEETING MINUTES AS AMENDED. BOARD MEMBER O'CONNELL SECONDED THE MOTION, WHICH CARRIED SEVEN (7) TO ZERO (0). CHAIR HARTMAN, VICE-CHAIR SEIDEN, AND BOARD MEMBERS CAMPANA, O'CONNELL, SONNENKLAR, SHIMOKUBO, AND TOTTEN VOTED IN THE AFFIRMATIVE. THERE WERE NO DISSENTING VOTES.

## **REGULAR MEETING AGENDA**

### **1. Patron Comment Report**

Library Director Michael Beck reviewed comments 1, 2, and 3 as listed in the agenda packet and any responses made by Library staff. He clarified that each comment in the report was captured in its entirety, as were his replies. Regarding comment 3, he discussed how agendas were created and why certain topics were placed on agendas as recurring items. Chair Hartman stated there are many reasons for recurring topics, and clear minutes would help clarify the different directions that are taken on each topic. She described the process through which she and Mr. Beck, not Board leadership, create each meeting's agenda, which she thought should be made clear to constituents. She felt like the response given to the patron was somewhat misleading.

Mr. Beck continued his report by reviewing comments 6, 12, 13, 15, 17, 19, and 22. He spoke about the importance of the Library taking part in as many outreach events as it can. He said Library staff tries to ensure that everyone who patronizes the libraries has a positive experience. He recommended that people wanting to donate magazines contact thrift stores or schools. Member Totten suggested they could also be donated to senior centers.

In response to Member Shimokubo's question about the request process, Mr. Beck pointed out that certain forms of media are easier to obtain quickly, which is why some requests are purchased or obtained quicker than others. Staff tries to put requested items on reserve and notify the requestor when it is either available or if the title is rejected.

Discussion ensued about the process for triaging calls to the Library. Mr. Beck noted the Library receives 60,000 to 75,000 calls each year, and he suggested that people contact specific branches with questions. Staff can also put patrons on hold while they contact the specific branch to find out the answer. Interim Senior Manager of Public Services Medina Zick added that staff routes calls for lost items of significant value to the proper branch, but the incident described in comment 17 was for a toy.

Chair Hartman wondered whether changes had been made to the website based on previous Board member comments. Mr. Beck replied that feedback is always taken from the website, and staff will investigate the DVD search feature mentioned in comment 4. He brought up a survey about the website that was conducted, the results of which were given to the City team responsible for the website. Chair Hartman requested that he look into whether that team has updates for the website, and that topic can be included on a future Board agenda for discussion.

### **2. FY2026-27 Library Budget Update**

Library Director Michael Beck explained that staff is in the process of developing its budget. The suggestion for an additional bathroom for adults in Civic Center Library seems to be moving forward, and he will have more information next month.

Chair Hartman expressed frustration that this item was listed as "information only" and there could not be any discussion on it. She indicated she would speak with Mr. Beck after the meeting.

### **3. Mustang Library Highlights and 3-D Printer Demonstration**

Interim Senior Manager of Public Services Medina Zick provided brief updates of the following items: the completion of a noise wall in Mustang Library, its funding, and the positive response to it; the parking lot renovations; the installation of interior and exterior security cameras; the painting of the outside of the building; bathroom upgrades; the addition of new shelving in the youth area; the plan to replace an aging book sorter; conversion of an existing study room to a Lego play space; the MAX book-sharing program; and the Library's involvement in the book sale.

In response to Board member questions, Ms. Zick said the Legos will be regular sized, not Duplo blocks, though there is a Duplo play table in the youth area. Member Sonnenklar brought up the possibility of a choking hazard with smaller Lego blocks. Ms. Zick indicated that warning sign about choking hazards will be posted.

Regarding security cameras, Library Director Michael Beck said Civic Center Library has some, but staff is currently considering installing more. Appaloosa Library also has cameras to provide security during self-service hours. These cameras will help ensure that the branches are safe and properly maintained, and footage will be run by municipal security, which is part of the Police Department.

Ms. Zick said staff does not consider money when discussing possible additions or changes to the libraries. Chair Hartman urged her to call on the Library Board to advocate publicly for more space for the libraries. Mr. Beck praised Ms. Zick and Interim Mustang Library Branch Manager Raven Creech for stepping into their interim roles.

Ben Shabat, 3-D printer expert, distributed some objects that were created via 3-D printers and explained how those printers use plastic to produce final projects. The printer at the library is a fused deposition modeling machine which can print up to 250 millimeter by 250 millimeter by 250 millimeter objects. The printers are not limited only to simple projects either. He discussed the advantages of 3-D printing. He spoke about some of the applications for these printers, including crafts, STEM applications, mechanical object creation, and making objects designed by users. He acknowledged the high cost of 3-D printers, saying he felt libraries and makerspaces should be exploring 3-D printing to improve the lives of community members.

Responding to Board member questions, Mr. Shabat stated that a 3-D model is needed, either created by someone or downloaded from the internet. The models are sliced into layers and translated into tool paths, and the program creates a file containing the information needed for the printer to generate the object. Objects will likely cost users 10 cents per gram, which will be used to recover printer costs. The slicer will be able to provide an estimate of how much filament would be used.

Member Totten suggested holding a learning event to teach people how to use it. Mr. Shabat said he is putting together programming for the service and mentioned a program that allows children to print customizable Hot Wheels cars. Mr. Beck stated that Library Services and Technology Act grants will be used to promote these events, along with communication in the Scottsdale Live newsletter, and demonstrations will be scheduled once staff is ready. He offered to provide a demonstration of the printer after the meeting.

Mr. Shabat said patrons will be able to submit models and pick up their objects later as it will not be possible to print everything out during an education event. Member Sonnenklar thought this would give children the opportunity to imagine what story characters look like. Mr. Shabat said he has used his personal 3-D printer to print things that would have been too costly to purchase. He clarified that a patron could not submit a model and pick up the object the same day; printing will be limited by staff availability and building hours. Given that this is highly calibrated equipment, Mr. Beck noted, it is not advised to move it between library branches. Mr. Shabat felt that holding remote events would require a lot of planning and proper transport infrastructure.

Mr. Beck pointed out that users must sign disclosures saying they will not use the printer to print anything that could be harmful to other patrons. Not only will the models be vetted, but staff will print objects on patrons' behalf. Mr. Shabat provided the estimated time it took to print the sample objects he brought to share.

#### **4. Library Board Annual Report**

Chair Hartman compared the two documents provided for this item, the report prepared by staff and the appendix she prepared. She wondered why the three discussions of a Board retreat were numbered while other recurring topics were not. Library Director Michael Beck said the topics in the annual report were pulled directly from each agenda's actionable items. Discussion ensued about the language for the retreat discussion headers.

MEMBER SONNENKLAR MOVED THAT THE LANGUAGE "2ND DISCUSSION" AND "3RD DISCUSSION" BE REMOVED FROM THE HEADERS FOR THE LIBRARY RETREAT ITEMS FOR NOVEMBER AND DECEMBER. VICE-CHAIR SEIDEN SECONDED THE MOTION, WHICH CARRIED SEVEN (7) TO ZERO (0). CHAIR HARTMAN, VICE-CHAIR SEIDEN, AND BOARD MEMBERS CAMPANA, O'CONNELL, SONNENKLAR, SHIMOKUBO, AND TOTTEN VOTED IN THE AFFIRMATIVE. THERE WERE NO DISSENTING VOTES.

Mr. Beck indicated the Board will vote on approval of this document at the Board's January meeting. The report covers the agenda topics heard, the attendance of each Board member, future work projects, and any additional Board comments and recommendations. The report was created in the same format as the annual reports of other boards and commissions. Because this was an action item, the Board could provide feedback now or wait until discussion of the item at the next meeting.

Assistant City Attorney Angela Calabresi expressed concern about some of the items included in the appendix and offered to send her comments to Mr. Beck in the next month. She cautioned the Board against including specific positions that could be considered legislative positions, which is not in the Board's purview. If that was not the Board's intent, she suggested that the language be softened. Most boards only send reports like the one prepared by staff, she continued, and submitting more could make it seem like the Board is acting out of its purview.

Chair Hartman said the appendix was created because past reports provided updates on what the Department of Public Libraries did, not the Library Board, and she felt their volunteer efforts should be acknowledged. She compiled the contributions from the minutes of past meetings, adding that the Board did not intend to take positions on certain topics.

Ms. Calabresi recommended that the Board not include the appendix and instead submit the report in the form provided by the City. Mr. Beck reiterated that all boards and commissions use the report template. He agreed that some of the language in the appendix could seem like positions were taken, even though he was present during the meetings and did not believe any were. He provided two examples of potentially questionable language.

The Chair repeated her concern that the information provided in the report pertained to the Department, not the Library Board. Ms. Calabresi pointed out that everyone can read the minutes which capture what was discussed during each meeting. Anything discussed by the Board that is not part of the minutes could constitute an Open Meeting Law violation. She expressed concern about optics. Chair Hartman suggested changing the name of the report to the Report for the Department of Public Libraries. It was decided that Ms. Calabresi would work with Chair Hartman to address any language concerns.

Ms. Calabresi discussed some of the other boards and commissions within the City, adding that their annual reports are meant to be a snapshot. The Planning Commission is also an advisory board and makes recommendations, and each board's annual report is named after that board. These reports speak on the achievements of the department, she said, but each board and commission helps them achieve those goals. She reviewed some of the ideas recommended by the Library Board that were eventually implemented by the Library.

Further discussion ensued about the language in the appendix and the possible inclusion of it. Ms. Calabresi clarified that her offering to make suggestions to the language does not mean she advises approving it. Member Totten and Vice-Chair Seiden expressed comfort in submitting just the template report. Member Sonnenklar thought it was very important for the Board to know what language is objectionable, though she expressed disappointment that the report does not address everything the Library Board does.

Member Campana explained her method for delineating which topics Board members listened to over the past year and which they were actively involved in. She pointed out the Board did not make policy decisions, and their reactions to future work projects should be noted. Chair Hartman expressed frustration that the Board was not given the chance to help with the website design. Mr. Beck responded that the website was discussed during at least two Board meetings, and Board members can make suggestions at any time. He felt caution should be exercised regarding adding appendices when that is not the typical protocol.

Chair Hartman stated that before Mr. Beck became Library Director, the Board had approval authority on policies, but that was taken away. She said Board members were heavily engaged volunteers. She wondered whether previous boards had even greater authority. Member O'Connell wondered about the purpose of the Library Board. Member Sonnenklar opined that the appendix is meant to explain to constituents what the Board does. Vice-Chair Seiden thought the appendix would indicate the Board's advocacy. Chair Hartman noted that the Board voted last year to create an appendix.

Mr. Beck emphasized that he appreciated the Library Board's input. Members are making a difference by attending events and weighing in on policy, and she did not want them to be discouraged. Chair Hartman said topics like operations were off-limits to the Board because they seemed like the Board was trying to tell staff what to do, but that is never their intention. She stressed the importance of honesty.

## **5. Library Board Retreat**

Chair Hartman thought that a retreat should not be held unless there are valid topics that need discussion. Member Campana wanted to postpone this discussion until they receive more direction from the Council based on the annual report. Her instinct was to vote no on a retreat, but she wanted more information before making that decision.

Library Director Michael Beck explained that retreats, such as the last one held in March of 2023, are typically held to discuss larger projects. Chairs can request retreats, or they can be scheduled based on a Board vote. Member Shimokubo concurred with Member Campana's suggestion to hold off on a decision until after the annual report process is complete. It was decided that this item would be continued until next year when it could be taken up by the new Chair if so desired.

## **6. Election of Officers – Review of Positions**

Chair Hartman discussed the process for voting on nominees for the chair and vice-chair, which will take place during the January meeting. The process is laid out in the bylaws, and anyone interested in running for either position should talk to the other Board members. She said her term as chair is expiring, though she will remain on the Library Board through September.

Member Campana wanted further clarification about term lengths for the chair position, to which Chair Hartman provided a brief explanation of them. Discussion ensued regarding a scenario where someone is elected as chair in a year where their re-appointment to the Board would need to be decided by the City Council. Library Director Michael Beck brought up places where Board members can find copies of the bylaws and information about Library Board appointment dates. Chair Hartman said the Board can vote anyone as chair, even if their term is set to expire during the year. In that case, Member Shimokubo added, the vice-chair would become chair.

## **7. Director's Report**

Library Director Michael Beck provided the following updates on items listed in the Director's Report:

- The Ultimate Family Play Date
- The results of the library card design contest
- Upcoming building projects being considered at Civic Center, Arabian, and Appaloosa Libraries
- The various ways in which the Library markets its events
- The impact this Board has had through its input and by Board members attending Library events
- An upcoming Parada Del Sol event, which he noted does not require a quorum notice if a quorum of the Board wishes to attend

## **8. Board Member's Report**

Member Totten spoke about attending a Scottsdale history presentation and suggested that the presenter should have referred attendees to the Scottsdale Heritage collection at Civic Center Library to learn more. She mentioned the opportunity for the Library to hold outdoor story time events. Member Shimokubo opined Appaloosa's story time event was better than three others she attended. Member Sonnenklar spoke about attending a birds of prey event at Civic Center Library, where books related to the topic were on display.

Member Campana spoke about the Friends of the Library. She remarked that the Farmer's Market moving to the City Hall parking lot could have a large impact on the Library, and she suggested a brainstorming session to discuss ways the Board could promote the Library there. She spoke about the construction of a 2,000-foot library by a private citizen and wondered whether it could be included in the City's library plans.

Chair Hartman brought up a meeting she had with the Friends of the Library and feedback she received from staff that they appreciated being mentioned in patron comments. She spoke about how the Board's advocacy for an additional restroom at Civic Center Library directly led to Council action, and the restroom is on track to be constructed. That is a direct example of the positive impact of the Board, and members should feel good about that.

## **9. Identification of Future Agenda Items and Future Meetings**

Chair Hartman indicated the publications issue that was removed from this agenda would be agendaized in the future. She thought legal counsel should be involved in any future discussions about foundations. Member O'Connell thanked Chair Hartman for her work in preparing the appendix. Chair Hartman said members want to be recognized for doing good.

The next meeting is scheduled for January 14, 2026, at Appaloosa Library.

## **10. Adjournment**

BOARD MEMBER SHIMOKUBO MOVED TO ADJOURN THE MEETING. BOARD MEMBER O'CONNELL SECONDED THE MOTION, WHICH CARRIED SIX (6) TO ZERO (0). CHAIR HARTMAN AND BOARD MEMBERS CAMPANA, O'CONNELL, SONNENKLAR, SHIMOKUBO, AND TOTTEN VOTED IN THE AFFIRMATIVE. THERE WERE NO DISSENTING VOTES.

With no further business to discuss, being duly moved and seconded, the meeting adjourned at 5:39 p.m.

Recorded and transcribed by eScribers, LLC.