
This document was created from the closed caption transcript of the October 1, 2019 City Council Regular Meeting and has not been checked for completeness or accuracy of content.

A copy of the agenda for this meeting, including a summary of the action taken on each agenda item, is available online at:

<https://www.scottsdaleaz.gov/Assets/ScottsdaleAZ/Council/current-agendas-minutes/2019-agendas/10-01-19-regular-agenda.pdf>

An unedited digital video recording of the meeting, which can be used in conjunction with the transcript, is available online at:

<http://www.Scottsdaleaz.gov/Scottsdale-video-network/Council-video-archives/2019-archives>

For ease of reference, included throughout the transcript are bracketed "time stamps" [Time: 00:00:00] that correspond to digital video recording time.

For more information about this transcript, please contact the City Clerk's Office at 480-312-2411.

CALL TO ORDER

[Time: 00:00:01]

Mayor Lane: I'd like to call to order our meeting tonight. Thanks to everyone for being here. It is nice to have you here. I apologize for the Council and a little bit of delay, but it sounds like everyone was enjoying themselves. In any case, I will call to order the October 1st, 2019 City Council Meeting. It is a Regular Meeting.

ROLL CALL

[Time: 00:00:22]

Mayor Lane: I'll start with a roll call please.

City Clerk Carolyn Jagger: Mayor Jim Lane.

Mayor Lane: Present.

Carolyn Jagger: Vice Mayor Kathy Littlefield.

Vice Mayor Littlefield: Present.

Carolyn Jagger: Councilmembers Suzanne Klapp.

Councilwoman Klapp: Here.

Carolyn Jagger: Virginia Korte.

Councilmember Korte: Here.

Carolyn Jagger: Linda Milhaven.

Councilwoman Milhaven: Here.

Carolyn Jagger: Guy Phillips.

Councilman Phillips: Here.

Carolyn Jagger: And Solange Whitehead.

Councilwoman Whitehead: Here.

Carolyn Jagger: City Manager Jim Thompson.

Jim Thompson: Here.

Carolyn Jagger: Acting City Attorney Joe Padilla.

Joe Padilla: Here.

Carolyn Jagger: City Treasurer Jeff Nichols.

Jeff Nichols: Here.

Carolyn Jagger: City Auditor Sharron Walker.

Sharron Walker: Here.

Carolyn Jagger: And the Clerk is present.

[Time: 00:00:50]

Mayor Lane: Thank you. A couple... Yeah. A couple items of business we do have to attend to, and we do have cards if you would like to speak on any items or for Public Comment, those are the white cards that the City Clerk is holding over her head and if you'd like to give us some written comments on any of the agenda items, the yellow she currently has over her head and we will read those cards during the proceedings. We have police officers Dustin Patrick and Tony Wells here with their hands waving, if you have need of their assistance, they are there for you. We have Kevin Hubbard from the Scottsdale Fire Department here to assist if needed in that area. I believe he is right over there. Right behind the

monitor. He's right close to the front door, in case you have a need for his assistance. The areas behind the Council dais are reserved for staff and Council. The bathroom facilities are over here to my left under the exit sign. If you are having difficulty hearing the proceedings of our meeting there are hearing assisted headsets available, please check with the clerk's staff and they'll be able to get that to you.

We did try to get the word out a little bit. Nevertheless agenda Item 7 on the Regular Agenda, 7 and 8, and this is the Sunday Goods rezoning and Conditional Use Permit, they are entitled for one continuance without a vote from the Council. That has been withdrawn and will not an item to be attended to in tonight's meeting. And there will not be any Public Comment taken on that item. We will be voting to continue those items following the agenda No. Six item. If you are here for Items 7 or 8, you are welcome to stay, if not, please leave quietly.

PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

[Time: 00:03:19]

Mayor Lane: Tonight, for the Pledge of Allegiance, by Pack 848, the Cub Scouts. I think they are poking their heads out from the back median there. Gentlemen, if you would like to come forward, please? Some of them were totally hidden. If you can, please rise for the Pledge of Allegiance.

Cub Scout Troop 848: I pledge allegiance to the Flag of the United States of America, and to the Republic for which it stands, one Nation under God, indivisible, with liberty and justice for all.

Mayor Lane: Very good, gentlemen. Please give us your name, your school, and maybe what your favorite subject is.

[Time: 00:04:24]

Cub Scout Troop 848: I'm Jackson. I go to Desert Canyon Elementary School. I'm in third grade. I'm eight years old. And my favorite subject is science. My name is Jack. I go to Cheyenne. My favorite subject is jumping in the pool. Hello. My name is Jacob. I go to Cheyenne Traditional school and my favorite subject is science and math. Hello. My name is Parker. I go to Cheyenne Traditional School. My favorite subject is P.E. I am Jonah and I go to Cheyenne, and my favorite subject is P.E. Hi, I'm Dominic, I go to Cheyenne and my favorite subject is math. My name is Jacob, no, hi, my name is Jacob, I go to Great Hearts and my favorite subject is history. Hello. My name is Jeffrey and my favorite subject in school is P.E. My name is Sam and I go to Cheyenne and my favorite subject is math.

Mayor Lane: Very good. Thank you, gentlemen.

INVOCATION

[Time: 00:06:17]

Mayor Lane: The invocation this evening is by Pastor David Joynt.

Pastor Joynt: My name is David and I finished school. My favorite subject is theology. Let's pray.

Heavenly Father, we thank you for everybody inside these walls who listens, leads, and legislates, who decides and delegates. We also thank you for those outside the walls tonight. Those who create and exhibit, those who preserve and enhance the natural environment. Those who build and repair. Those who teach and parent. Those who encourage and bless those less fortunate. Heavenly Father, we thank you for those who work inside and outside these walls and we ask you to bless each of them individually with your special grace and your energy and love. And also all of us together, that Scottsdale may continue to be a place of joy and justice where citizens thrive together in community. We ask in your great name. And all of God's people said amen.

MAYOR'S REPORT

[Time: 00:07:38]

Mayor Lane: Thank you. We've got a very special occasion to report in tonight's meeting. It is the 25th anniversary of Scottsdale's McDowell Sonoran Preserve and I think there's a fair number of folks here to represent that issue. We're glad to have them all. Specifically, what we did hours ago was to have a get together of the Pioneers who were behind the initial efforts to make, to create this project, develop the support, and to promote the citizen raise, work to pass the necessary sales taxes to pay for necessary sales taxes and also, to establish the boundaries of the Preserve that we have today. It's a great effort on the front end and has been for the last 25 years.

Tonight, I have a proclamation for simply Preserve month, but in special recognition of the 25th anniversary. Whereas, on October 3, 1994, the Scottsdale City Council adopted Resolution #4103 that formally established the Scottsdale McDowell Sonoran Preserve; and Whereas, the citizens of Scottsdale have consistently and strongly expressed that the preservation of the McDowell Mountains and the surrounding Sonoran Desert is a high priority; and Whereas, twelve individuals recognized today as "Preserve Pioneers" gave tirelessly and selflessly of themselves to achieve the vision of the community to create a preserve; and Whereas, these individuals include Dr. Art DeCaboote, Bill Ensign, Bob Cafarella, Carla, Honorable Carolyn Allen, Chet Andrews, Christine Kovach, Honorable Herb Drinkwater, Jane Rau, Honorable Mary Manross, Honorable Sam Campana, and Virginia Korte; and Whereas, the vision of the Preserve Pioneers is now a reality as Scottsdale's McDowell Sonoran Preserve has grown to over 30,500 acres of protected natural open space; and Whereas, it is with pride that City of Scottsdale and its citizens commemorate the 25th anniversary of the creation of the Scottsdale McDowell Sonoran Preserve, and the achievement of enhancing and protecting it; Therefore, I, W.J. "Jim" Lane, Mayor of the City of Scottsdale, Arizona, do hereby proclaim the month of October, 2019 as Scottsdale McDowell Sonoran Preserve Month in Scottsdale and invite our community to join in celebration of the 25th anniversary of the creation of the Preserve, recognize the Preserve Pioneers and all those who have and continue to volunteer their time and efforts in service to Scottsdale's crowning jewel.

With that, I'd like to also say that we, that we have some of those individuals here with us tonight. I'd like to ask them to come forward as I call your name. Carla. Christine Kovach. I just heard. Somebody couldn't hear. Mary Manross. And Sam Campana. And Councilwoman Virginia Korte. If you come down here, we'll stand in front of the screen, we will make the presentation. Thank you to the Pioneers once again, please. We'll go ahead and continue, but that was a very special occasion. Historic.

I have another announcement that I would like to make. I'm sure that this Councilmember is aware, and the transition occurred today. I'd like to announce that Councilwoman Kathy Littlefield is our Vice Mayor as of today and we look forward to her service in that role. Nice to have you here. In addition, I'd like to thank now Councilwoman Milhaven for her service as Vice Mayor. So thank you very much.

PRESENTATIONS/INFORMATION UPDATES

[Time: 00:15:30]

Mayor Lane: We have a couple of presentations this evening and we'll start, well in fact it's only one actually as Scottsdale Sister Cities and we have Lisa White, the President of Scottsdale Sister Cities here to make that presentation. Lisa, welcome.

[Time: 00:15:52]

Lisa White, Scottsdale Sister Cities President: Hello. I'm Lisa White. President of Scottsdale Sister Cities and this is Maeve, a senior at Saguaro High School. And we are here today to talk to you about some very exciting things. We have lots of good news about Scottsdale Sister Cities. Our mission is to be an arm and promote the City of Scottsdale as an ambassador of goodwill and friendship throughout the world. We do that through cultural exchanges, student exchanges, sports exchanges, economic, and medical. All sorts of things that we coordinate and exchange throughout the world. We are happy and here today to talk about our 50th anniversary. 1969 was a very important year in Scottsdale as you can imagine.

The City Council had to make some big decisions about possibly promoting Eisenhower's program and developing a Sister City in Mexico. So the City Council and the City Manager took trips to Mexico to make a decision. Would it be Armissijo? Alamos? Or Cuernavaca? What a trip that must have been, right? We are here, of course, because they chose Alamos as their Sister City. We have an extended year that the Mayor signed in December of 1969 and the Council approved in 1970, so we are enjoying a very long year of celebration for Alamos. So far we have had quite a few things; for example, we have had students come here from Mexico for the Scottsdale Library's ESL program. We are trying to collect 50 bikes for 50 years for the rural students to be able to attend high school. They don't have school buses or any way to get to school, so we are providing 24 twenty-six-inch bikes for them to get there. We had 11 artists that brought artworks to Scottsdale at the Mexican consulate and we had a great festival. We are having continuing, ongoing celebrations.

We are going to be bringing up a musician from the International Music Festival that Alamos has. That will be January 30 at the Carr Center. We are a partnership with Doc Jones that puts on the Alamos jazz festival every year and we're going to have a membership trip to Alamos and San Carlos in March of next year. Lots of exciting things going on. We have had fireman exchanges, police exchanges, and took down medical equipment through SOS. Water treatment programs or implements, I guess, for some of the rural areas through rotaries. We continue to do as much as we can for Alamos. This is the students who were visiting here last year. When we go, it is not as a tourist. The students go as guests. They are home-hosted, they visit schools, have school-to-school programs that are usually a about a week-long rather than some other Sister Cities that do more extended programs.

We also celebrated 25 years with Kingston, Canada with a member trip, 12 of us went to Kingston. Kingston was started in 1994 with Herb Drinkwater's summer home up there. The relationship fizzled a little bit, but we reinvigorated it and made a trip there to walk in their Canada Day parade. And we also celebrated 20 years with Interlaken Switzerland, so that was just in 1999 and we had an official delegation come here last April. So we have been very busy. We are happy to have and be promoting a more recent Sister City. We have four Sister Cities for the first forty years and then in the last ten years we've added four Sister Cities. Many of you have probably been involved with some of the Sister Cities that we have added and we're very happy to have added Uasin Gishu, Kenya. So Maeve actually had a chance to go there last June so she's going to speak a few minutes about her experience.

[Time: 00:20:24]

Sister Cities Youth Ambassador Maeve: Hello, Mr. Mayor, Ms. Vice Mayor, and Councilmembers. My name is Maeve and I am a Scottsdale Sister Cities Youth Ambassador. I have been fortunate enough to travel with Scottsdale Sister Cities on three different exchanges: one to Marrakech, Morocco, one to Interlaken, Switzerland, and most recently to Uasin Gishu, Kenya. Since my time here is so short, I would like to highlight you a few points of our trip to Kenya. To begin with, of course, we were able to stay with host families, which is a very heart warming and fulfilling experience all on its own because we are able to connect person-to-person and with a family as a whole in a very personal and loving way. We were also able to have an environmental impact by planting the trees in their tree park with their Mayor. We visited many schools which was an eye-opening experience because we got to experience and learn about a different education system. We were also welcomed into the house of Moses Kiptanui, the famous Kenyan marathon runner. He hosted a party and we got to converse with him what it was like to be a Kenyan marathon runner. I would like to thank you all for giving me the opportunity to speak today, and of course I would like to thank Scottsdale Sister Cities for making me a more culturally minded person. Thank you.

[Time: 00:21:59]

Lisa White: Our most recent Sister City was, is actually a Twin City, Killarney. They had a situation where Ireland did away with their municipal governments and so when it came time to sign a Sister City agreement, there was no Mayor to sign, so we signed as Twin Cities. After 5 years, they came to their senses and they now have a city government and Mayor back. We are hoping that sometime in the next year we can make Killarney an official Sister City. You'll notice here, there is a golf tournament October 2 and 3 and we were not able to send anyone from the City of Scottsdale, believe it or not with all of the golfers that we have. We sent four of these golf shirts. They are going to have a team that will represent Scottsdale and I will let everybody know if we win the tournament.

Some more things coming up. We are hosting the Arizona Sister Cities Conference this weekend at Scottsdale Community College and at Talking Stick Golf Resort. That's going to be very exciting. We are looking forward to that. Cairns, Australia, the President of Australia's Sister City, Sim Hayward, is coming October 15-17. We invite everyone in this room to meet her at the Mesquite Grill at McDowell Mountain Ranch October 16 from 4-6. Marrakech is going to be having their student exchange in November. Their students will be here, our students will go there during spring break. Marrakech is I'd say one of our most impactful Sister City relationships. The students really develop relationships with people in Morocco, which is a modern Islamic nation and they break stereotypes on both sides, it's

really an amazing experience so we're so thankful for that.

On November 6th, we are celebrating our 50th anniversary of Sister Cities with a big birthday party. George Hartz is going to talk a little bit about some of those early times and the decisions they had to make and some of those trips that were reported in the Scottsdale Progress at the time with Mayor Bud Tims, Vice Mayor Ken Murray and City Manager Bill Donaldson. There are some funny stories and anecdotes to be told, so come, if you are interested, check our website and again you're all invited to this wonderful dinner at the Scottsdale Culinary Arts Department. February 6th is our annual meeting, student recognition and that will be at Scottsdale Community College too. And stay tuned, 2020 is going to include our 10th anniversary with Haiku, China.

We have eight Sister Cities on five different continents. And it was suggested by Mayor Lane that if we consider another Sister City, it should probably be in South America. We have started to put feelers out for a possible Sister City and we will be consulting you if this is a viable plan and if this is the direction to go because we are stewards of the City Council and want to do what you consider to be in our best interest as a city. We do so much here to build bridges, between the countries and especially, between the people within the cities as we take students from north Scottsdale, south Scottsdale, public schools, private schools, charter schools, everyone is involved in these programs. We are happy to unite Scottsdale and make it a better community and share that with the world. And I have five seconds left.

Mayor Lane: That was well timed. Very nicely done. Very nice presentation. Thank you very much. Congratulations on all of the history and all of the things that have been accomplished.

Lisa White: Thank you so much. We really appreciate your support and continued support. We appreciate when you come to our events, all of you, it is very meaningful to us. And of course, we appreciate the financial support that makes it all possible.

Mayor Lane: Very good. Thank you so much.

PUBLIC COMMENT

[Time: 00:26:23]

Mayor Lane: Next order of business is our Public Comment. It is reserved for citizen's comments regarding non-agendized items with no official Council action taken on these items. Comments are limited to issues within the jurisdiction of the City Council. Speakers are limited to three minutes each with a maximum of up to five speakers. There will be another opportunity for Public Comment at the end of the session if there is a need or a call for it. So, I do have some Public Comment cards. Four in total. We are going to start with David Ortega.

[Time: 00:27:11]

David Ortega: Hello Mayor and Council. I'm David Ortega and thank you for your service. Several of us had expected to speak on Items 7 and 8 and understand that you are going to forego that because it was continued by the applicant. Is that true?

Mayor Lane: Yes.

David Ortega: Okay, so I will speak generically about the importance of our General Plan, adherence to downtown zoning, and the fact that the city has not had a General Plan in effect. Updates are required every 10 years. It failed in 2011 and there's another election for the General Plan. The concern I have is called spot zoning. Spot zoning is when the special interest may request zoning that is out of the area where it would be illegal. For instance, in the downtown C-1, C-2, and C-3 districts, what's called a central business zone. Certain uses are prohibited. Any applicant can come in on the subject, but once it becomes very clear that that would break the General Plan that is in place and that has been adopted, it becomes very troublesome to the people that surround that proposed use.

The other thing that I want to mention about the General Plan is the protections that Scottsdale writes into our General Plan and ordinances. We protect schools, churches and parks from certain uses and especially, from controlled substances. The State statutory limits are certain buffering distances. Sometimes, the city has applied this to tattoo parlors and dispensaries and liquor, and certain uses such as those are prohibited within the range of schools and churches. That begins at the state level and written in at the City level. Scottsdale has been more demanding than the state has been in many cases. For instance, the state requirement for certain controlled substances may be 500-feet and the City of Scottsdale requires 1500-feet because they are taking in particular into the interest of a safe environment for the children coming and going to school. I hope that we are cognizant of that. The cases in point that there were other people prepared to speak and this was a last-minute cancellation so many people were prepared to defend their neighborhood and that's really the topic of the General Plan. Thank you very much.

Mayor Lane: Thank you very much. Thank you, David, who I should have announced is a former Councilmember here in Scottsdale. Next.

[Time: 00:30:46]

Gary Bohall: Mr. Mayor and Council. I'm a downtown property owner. I came prepared for the cancelled item, so I will just say that the property owners have a great deal to offer in the way of information for future consideration and so, I will defer to a later time. I don't know that I will be here when it is heard, but just to make a face with the argument that there's plenty of things to be said on our behalf. Thank you.

Mayor Lane: Thank you. Next. Please correct me if I have got that wrong and just announce your name if you would.

[Time: 00:31:49]

Bahvik Rajaboina: I'm a senior at Basis Scottsdale. I would like to thank the Mayor, the Councilmembers, and Ms. Kelly for giving me an opportunity to speak about something that I really care about. Becoming a member of speech and debate really changed my life, and I believe the same can be said for many historical figures. Take for example Abraham Lincoln. He was a local figure who turned into a nationally celebrated hero as he spoke at conventions and debated individuals. Today, I am here to advocate for a stronger debating presence at our middle schools and high schools to benefit our

youth and future generations. Speech and debate helps our youth in two major ways: First, leadership qualities. A Forbes Article from 2009 clearly explained that debaters are the best-suited individuals to run companies and lead organizations. The reason why is because they develop communication skills. Any CEO will clearly tell you that communication was key to fostering a collaborative environment while also fostering innovation. The second benefit is having an open mind. Luckily all of us here today are open-minded. We are all open to listening to each other's problems, but more importantly, listening to each other's solutions and coming up with the best ones to help us. It is important that we continue this strong tradition in our City Councils, and debate can prepare that for a future generation.

Let me tell you how this is possible. At tournaments debaters must prepare for both sides of the argument and because this is the case, they get a more holistic view of an issue. They're not biased, they care more about the issue overall. Because they know the issue more heartily, they can make a more informed decision. It is important that our future youth continue to be open minded as it will have repercussions on future Council meetings and the course of Scottsdale. I have one main proposition for the community. I believe we as a community should go to schools and libraries and encourage kids to join speech and debate. And if there is no club, maybe they should join one. Scottsdale is in a really bright future and I believe that it can go even further. The only thing that I ask all of you is to give our future generations and give our youth a skill, a fundamental skill can will change the course of their lives and the lives of people around them. Thank you for your time and I hope that you consider my message.

Mayor Lane: I'm sorry, but we don't applaud, unless the Boy Scouts. This is a slight matter, but we don't have jurisdiction over the schools. I give a little license there if that's all right. I just wanted to mention that. Next we have is Michael Templeton.

[Time: 00:34:47]

Michael Templeton: Good evening, Mr. Mayor and Council people. I'm a general dentist in Downtown Scottsdale. I have been a business owner for 25 years plus in Downtown Scottsdale and a property owner for a little over 20. I'm here to speak about the Downtown Plan and exceptions to what was already approved negatively effecting my business. Parking in Old Town Scottsdale is at a premium at best. I know that you have made great strides in trying to keep on-street parking on a rotating basis with the electronic monitoring and such as that, but the exceptions, proposed exceptions to that downtown plan will only increase the difficulty that my patients have in finding a parking place to visit my establishment and receive dental care.

I'm on a corner. And I have six parking places on one side and four on the other. And I have people from Yelp at the Galleria and Marriott down the street parking in my spots. I see them park, walk down the street, and my patients circle the block trying to find a parking place for an hour-long appointment. Please seriously consider not changing the overall downtown alignment and proposed C-2 designation for the redevelopment of downtown because it has a very negative effect on my ability to treat my patients and thank you very much for listening.

Mayor Lane: Thank you, Mr. Templeton. That completes the Public Comment for this point in our meeting.

CONSENT AGENDA

[Time: 00:37:12]

Mayor Lane: And so, we'll move on to our Consent Items 1 through 5. And we do not have any public testimony on any of those items. If there is any questions or otherwise from the Council. I'm seeing none. With that, I would ask for a motion for Consent Items 1 through 5.

Councilmember Korte: Mayor?

Mayor Lane: Yes, go ahead.

Councilmember Korte: I move to approve Consent Agenda Items 1 through 5.

Mayor Lane: Moved and seconded. We are ready to vote on Consent Agenda Item 1 through five. Please vote aye if you approve. It is unanimous on Consent Items 1 through 5.

REGULAR AGENDA

ITEM 6 – SANDS NORTH TOWNHOUSES HISTORIC DISTRICT REZONING (9-ZN-2018)

[Time: 00:39:12]

Mayor Lane: Okay, we're moving on to our Regular Agenda items. For those who missed the earlier announcement, agenda Items 7 and 8 for Sunday Goods Conditional Use Permit have been continued. There is no need for a vote because there is a one-time request for the applicants to continue their item. It is at their request and there is no Public Comment on that item because it was completed with the Public Comment that was already provided. Council is going to vote to continue that item and going to Item 6. That's the historic rezoning 9-ZN-2018. Welcome Ms. McClay.

[Time: 00:39:27]

Senior Planner Doris McClay: Doris McClay with the Planning Department. Sands North is zoned Resort/Townhouse Residential. This application is requesting a rezoning to the Resort/Townhouse Residential Historic Property zoning designation. There are 20 lots within the subdivision that are not included within this rezoning request. The General Plan recognizes the need to identify and protect historic resources within the City of Scottsdale. The historic preservation commission recommended approval of this rezoning and planning request. The applicant is here to make a presentation. That concludes staff's presentation.

Mayor Lane: Thank you. Is there a representative from, that would like to step forward? Yes?

[Time: 00:40:59]

Applicant Representative Sandra Price: Mayor Lane, Vice Mayor Kathleen Littlefield and Councilmembers. Thank you for considering our application.

Mayor Lane: For the record, can you tell us who you are.

Sandra Price: I'm President of the Sands North Homeowners Association. It is a real gem. They are reminiscent of the 1970s Scottsdale. A couple of people recognized the need to preserve the architecture and we hired a preservation architect, Bob Graham, who will make a presentation in a few minutes. And we got the ball rolling with that. I'm hopeful that each one of you will vote in favor of this zoning overlay. I urge you to vote in favor of this. If you have any questions, I'm happy to answer those. Otherwise, I will turn it over to architect, Bob Graham.

Mayor Lane: Any questions of the applicant at this point? Thank you.

[Time: 00:42:49]

Applicant Representative Bob Graham: Good evening, Mayor and Councilmembers. My name is Bob Graham. Our firm has been working with the Sands North community for several years now. They contacted us a while back to see how they could preserve their neighborhood. And now, a formal, local designation of their historical status. We are the authors of the design guidelines and preservation plan that would be adopted as part of this rezoning. We found that Sands North is a very interesting little enclave. As you can see, it is a very tight knit community of little homes. There are really only five floor plans in here, but somehow, the original developer was able to make every property unique. That's different from a lot of other town home communities where it is much more repetitive. In Sands North, we have a lot of continuity and materials and things like that, but each property really is unique.

You can see that the property is entered off of Joshua Tree Lane or off Scottsdale Road. First, I'm going to go a little bit into why this is an important area. Townhouses in Scottsdale were a trend that peaked around 1970, 1975. Sands North was developed in 1972 by a gentleman by the name of Emron Wright that had several companies. He had a development company and a construction company. So, it was kind of an umbrella organization. He did develop five Sands developments around metropolitan Phoenix. Several of them in Scottsdale, so you have probably seen some of those. We did find that Sands North is the best preserved of all of those. It is iconic to Scottsdale in a lot of ways. You hear about mid-century modern architecture and what that is. Sands North is a great example of mid-century modernism and in 1972, there is a contemporary version.

You can see on the screen, there is a streetscape, it has a very unified streetscape which is important for historic districts the historic district gives you feeling like you are in a place in time. These wide setbacks, not wide, but 20-feet or so, have nice landscaping. You can see that the homes have a lot of variety and continuity at the same time. As you come in the main entry, the first thing that you focus on is the clubhouse. There are 51 properties in the subdivision, but not all designated in this action. Fifty-one properties, plus the common ownership, the clubhouse is in the common ownership. This alone is a really cool piece of architecture. Look around here at Benny Gonzalez' work, which is sort of at the same period. This has a lot of the same feeling to it.

To take a closer look at just a few of the units. Every unit has a carport and an entry. It has these common features, but each expressed differently. Here is a one-story version, this is actually two of them side by side, on the left side is a one-story. It is completely different from the first slide, but still, it

fits all together. There are also some two-story units. Not very many but were able to put a lot of variety in the five floor plans and they are five very different plans. These are the things that in sum total, kind of identify this district is that by the use of changing just the iron screens that are used on it, there is no two that are the same. There are some models that are similar, and it happens in the same place, but it is different.

At each of the corner intersections, they have these wall features that is the second photograph, that accent that intersection. Some of the properties have ceramic tile accents to make them a little bit different. The ironwork is repeated in the window screens, lots of wood beams. So the kind of unifying features are the plainer stucco surfaces and not a lot of ornament in the stucco like Benny Gonzalez. Light fixtures...somebody must have gone shopping because the light fixtures on every property are different. Skylights at the entries, you can see on the right there, the entry doors are always an accent and a little unique in each case. And then, the two-story unit looks like the door is two stories tall, even though, it is just the first part. These are the elements in the design guidelines that we have written, which are summarized in the table in the back of this document.

We are focusing on the things that we are trying to preserve the continuity of, so that in future design reviews, hopefully, homeowners are encouraged to keep the same feel throughout. In summary, we feel and did find this was a very significant piece of architecture. I think that it is very iconic to Scottsdale. You don't find this quality in a lot of the other municipalities around town. And it is part and parcel of the history of Scottsdale and so, that's why our clients have moved to designate. Thank you. I will take any questions.

[Time: 00:49:35]

Mayor Lane: Thank you, Mr. Graham. I just had a quick question for staff. And that is what was the participation in the vote for this designation?

Planning and Development Area Manager Steve Venker: Mayor Lane, Councilmembers. Mayor, are you requesting information on how the votes went at the Planning Commission and the Historic Preservation Commission?

Mayor Lane: No, the residential vote. The residents within the community. Are they required to vote?

Steve Venker: The properties represented in the proposal all voted in favor of having a district designated.

Mayor Lane: OK, but that wasn't all the properties in the area.

Steve Venker: Correct. What we have is 100% of the owners in the district and that represents 100% of that group. There is no outstanding district owners. The properties outside of the boundary have not submitted their waivers and are not participating.

Mayor Lane: So, there are some in the community that have not.....

Steve Venker: That's correct. There are 20 units that are not participating at this time.

Mayor Lane : Out of the 51?

Steve Venker: Correct.

Mayor Lane: So, they are not either entitled and/or restricted by any designation to be voted on here.

Steve Venker: That's correct. They still have to abide by the HOA, CC&Rs and architectural guidelines, which in turn are part of the Historic Preservation Plan and still have to deal with the HOA for alterations to the exterior of the townhouses.

Mayor Lane: And understandably that's that's pretty consistent with what we're talking about for the district?

Steve Venker: Yes, sir.

Mayor Lane: Any questions or comments from Council? Hearing none, we are ready to vote. Thank you for the presentation.

Councilwoman Klapp: We have to have a motion first.

Mayor Lane: I'm sorry, I didn't mean a vote, I meant a motion. We have a need for a motion.

Mayor Lane: I'm sorry, we have a couple of comment cards and people would like to speak on it beyond what we have here. We will start with Ken Mann.

[Time: 00:52:20]

Ken Mann: Yes, I'm Ken Mann. I live in Scottsdale in Sands North. We did not sign on. A family disagreement on that. Anyway, I'm not objecting per se to the decision that has been made by the 34 members, I think that he said that we had 27 people who had not voted. I think that the count is 34. It is 34 people that didn't. I'm sorry. 51 units. And 31 people signed on. It means that it was a, correct? Are my numbers correct?

Mayor Lane: Sir, if you could just give us your comment.

Ken Mann: I have a legal question or concern. I'm an attorney, don't hold it against me. It is an occupational hazard. They got 31 votes and I think that they needed 34. In my personal opinion, this constitutes an amendment to our declaration originally that requires a two-thirds vote of the members for amendments to the declaration of covenants and there is not two-thirds. Now, at the last meeting, somebody represented that you have to use square-footage and they calculated it and so forth and I didn't get a chance because of other commitments to look at it until today because I thought that the number was off. So, I looked. And there is nothing in our covenants and declaration from the HOA that says anything about square-footage determining how you make amendments. I would turn it over to legal counsel for the City to determine whether the fact they have less than 34 owners of the Sands North lots, does that make it a valid adoption?

Mayor Lane: I think that is something if I were, I realize that we don't try to respond on some of this because it is for comments only at this point in time. It is an HOA thing and you are going to have to deal with the HOA as far as that is concerned.

Ken Mann: Except if the City is adopting what the HOA with 31 members want and it becomes a legal decision by the City and if it is contrary to what our covenants require, I'm suggesting that it may be invalid preservation of a historic district.

Mayor Lane: Thank you, Mr. Mann. Next is Margaret Wheeler.

[Time: 00:55:58]

Margaret Wheeler: My name is Margaret Wheeler. I'm here to ask you as a resident of Sands North to designate us as a historic district. Besides what we modestly say is the best location in Scottsdale, our community is exceptionally attractive. Built in 1972, its homes are white, with dark brown posts and beams and black wrought iron gates and lamps and decorative features. The carports make for an open street scrape as opposed to the closed in look a street of garage doors can give. I would call us an exceptionally friendly, welcoming local community with people who take a lot of pride in our residences. I grew up in Chandler when it was still a community of fewer than 5,000 and Sands North reminds me a little of the atmosphere I took for granted then.

As our cities in Arizona continue to grow, they can sadly become more anonymous, impersonal places. I think that it is all the more important for us to preserve a feeling of community closeness and pride, which can sometimes be lacking in today's world where people have been known to text, instead of talking face-to-face to a person across the room. Please help us preserve the sense of community we all value so much and keep Sands North a beautiful and welcoming place for future generations. Thank you so much.

Mayor Lane: Thank you, Ms. Wheeler. Next is Richard Beamer.

[Time: 00:58:12]

Richard Beamer: Good evening Mayor and Councilpersons. It is exciting for me to be here. My primary home is in Washington, but my heart is in Scottsdale, Arizona, and a member and owner of Sands North since 1994. I first came to Scottsdale as a visitor from the northwest to watch the Washington Huskies play ASU. We were successful that day. But more so, I was successful in loving what I saw in Scottsdale and Old Town and visited far and wide and was impressed with many features that I had never really seen before. And those features were welcoming.

And, so consequently, when I got married, my wife is from the Phoenix area, and we actually went into Founder Way, into Sands North to view this community and fell in love with it right then. Fortunately, in about a year's time, I was able to purchase. A home became available and was able to purchase that home and have lived probably 5 to 6 months a year each year since then. What is significant to me is the style, the architectural style and the way that it brings neighbors together. There is a comradery and there is a pride in ownership and it's unique. And consequently, I just love coming back and love

being there. And I'm just really encouraged that you're considering this historical designation and I would welcome that very much as an owner. And I just encourage you to give us a positive result in your jurisdiction. Thank you very much.

Mayor Lane: Thank you, Mr. Beamer. Next is Patricia Beamer.

[Time: 01:01:01]

Patricia Beamer: Mayor Lane and city Councilmembers. My name is Patricia Beamer. I came from Seattle, Washington to attend this important meeting conserving the Sands North community. My family moved to Phoenix in 1951. Growing up I attended Kachina, Arcadia and Phoenix college. I even marched in the Parada del Sol. My husband and I bought a home in Sands North in 1994. We have spent winters here the last 25 years. Sands North old Scottsdale style captured my heart when I first discovered it and my wishes to encourage your approval of Ordinance 4426 to preserve this very special oasis called Sands North. Thank you.

Mayor Lane: Thank you, Mrs. Beamer. Next Gregory Raupp and Jude Smith.

[Time: 01:02:18]

Gregory Raupp: Good evening. I'm one of the luckiest men in the world because 11 years ago, I met my lovely wife, golden hair here and 10 years ago I became a resident of Sands North when I moved into her lovely house. Your time is short and valuable. Let me get to the heart of the matter, by telling a bit of a story however, first. I say that I'm a lucky man and one of the things that I'm lucky about is right now, I'm in conversations with a major philanthropic donor from overseas. Their foundation is considering making a donation to this region for Smart Cities Initiative. I know that the City of Scottsdale is deeply involved in that with GPEC and a number of partners as well. Talking about moving cities forward. I think I clinched the deal. I think we'll have an announcement in a few weeks. When we had a conversation when the lead guy said, "why should we give you the money? There are so many people doing Smart Cities." And I said, "Like who?" And he said, "let's look at what University College London, Imperial College London is doing." Sure, let's bring it up on the web. It was great stuff, all kinds of technology, gleaming and fun exciting stuff. We looked at 3 or 4 websites and all wonderful and beautiful technology for the future of a city.

I said, we looked at all of those and there was a word missing in all of those that I didn't see. The word was people. Aren't people a city? That's really the heart of the matter. What we are talking about is not preserving buildings, architecture, we're talking about preserving a community. We are talking about preserving pride, passion, and shared values. So, that's what Sands North could be as an historic district. It could be that visual, living, active link to our past as we move forward to our future. You have heard the love. It is there in all of our hearts. All that we are asking for from you is for you to be partners in preserving that which is essential and dear to our hearts. Thank you very much.

Mayor Lane: Thank you. Next would be Leila Tehrani.

[Time: 01:04:53]

Leila Tehrani: Good evening. I live at North 73rd Street in Sands North. I serve on the Board of Directors and have been a resident of this community since 2003. Mayor, Councilmembers, please help us protect and preserve the unique architecture of Sands North. The facades of the homes have detached planes and they come in various geometric shapes and sizes and they float horizontally and vertically. They not only create lovely visual effects, they create usable, livable spaces. A covered balcony, a courtyard garden, a grand tall entrance. It is difficult to find anything quite like this. The fact that it is so well preserved is a testament to the love and the care that this community's members have provided over the years to preserve this unique architecture. Thank you for helping us to preserve and protect this.

Mayor Lane: Thank you. Next is, pardon me. I'm not quite sure.

Adrienne Knauer: No, close though.

Mayor Lane: Not really.

[Time: 01:06:25]

Adrienne Knauer: I live here in Scottsdale. Mayor Lane, Vice Mayor, and Councilmembers, thank you for your service and time today. I live in a Stags-built home in Scottsdale and I hope that one day to be representing my community and motioning for it to be a historic district to preserve its character. But today, I'm here in support of making Sands North Scottsdale's newest historic district. I feel this motion is vital to preserve Scottsdale's character and integrity. I'm a recent transplant to Scottsdale, having only lived here for three years, but I have already bought a house and put roots down because I have fallen in love with this city and Arizona. However, I have noticed a trend in Scottsdale where developers have a lot of influence and interest in specific areas and the prime location of Sands North, I believe, makes it a target for development. And I fear without the historic preservation designation, it could leave the door open and potentially destroy this iconic community. Sands North is a somewhat hidden gem in Scottsdale. It is tucked away on Scottsdale Road. Many of you who haven't been there have probably driven past and never realized it was there. If you have ever had the pleasure of entering the community, you can see they take great care and pride in it and preserving its character. If we don't preserve iconic architecture in Scottsdale we are essentially erasing its history. I would love to see more communities with iconic architecture like Sands North preserved rather than just torn down. I learned that it has been over eight years since we have created a residential historic district in Scottsdale and I know this could be rewarding for both the residents who are applying for this historic designation, as well as the City. A city's history is what gives it its unique character and Sands North is no exception. 100% of the owners on the application are for it. I hope that the Council will consider approving this historic designation. Thank you for your time.

Mayor Lane: Thank you. Next, Sandy Schenkat.

[Time: 01:08:46]

Sandy Schenkat: I'm a ways away, but I have heard about this project and getting this group together and seeing Sandra Price work so diligently for almost five years to make this happen, I just got on board with it. I have already written to you and asked you to support this. But to have such a great

community, I think that it would be horrible if this doesn't go through as historical preserved area. So, thank you.

Mayor Lane: Thank you. Next.

[Time: 01:09:44]

Christie Lee Kinchen: Good evening Mayor, Vice Mayor, and City Council. Thank you for the opportunity to speak tonight. My address is redacted. I'm here to speak in support of Sands North historic district. I must state that I'm not speaking on behalf of the Historic Preservation Commission, I'm here as a citizen advocate for the Sands North homeowners. These are my own views. These townhomes are a shining example of the contemporary townhome style that makes Scottsdale an iconic mid-century city and thus worth the historic designation. Historic preservation at its core is the movement and planning and zoning designed to conserve old buildings and areas in an effort to tie a piece of history to its population and culture. In a world where we are increasingly feeling climate change, historic preservation and adaptive reuse are essential components to green building practice. They reuse the structures that are already present as opposed to new construction. It is environmental and practical and can be equated to large scale recycling. We need more of this.

We need to continue to change the conversation about historic preservation. Preservation is about so much more than saying what color you can paint your home and what kind of windows you can install. Cities must be regarded as more than engines of wealth and viewed as systems that should shape to improve our very well-being. By continuing to protect and preserve and enhance our historic and cultural resources, we will ensure a healthy and vibrant future for Scottsdale. I can cheerlead for that. The Sands North application is so strong that I have heard that there are additional homeowners that missed the initial application and are begging to be added on now. That's pretty cool in telling about the broad support of this project. The homeowners in this room have been waiting five years for this moment to ask you guys to vote in favor of their historic district. This place matters. A sense of place is priceless and the time is to act now. For the same reason that Proposition 420 riled up our citizens for so many to protect our McDowell Sonoran Preserve from development, we proved the Preserve is a special place and truly worth telling of Scottsdale's story as it relates to our collective quality of living.

For the same reason my twin sister up there and I were so passionate about saving the Polynesian Dairy Queen on McDowell Road from complete demolition. These are more than just buildings, they hold memories and create community. Jennie and I have heard countless stories of support from folks that grew up getting ice cream cones with their families back in the day, had their first date there, etc. So when folks feel a strong connection to a place that's pretty magical. So many people remember more than just a building, they remember how a place makes them feel and the memories it invokes. Your approval of the historic designation for Sands North will instantly give homeowners a pedigree on their homes. It also allows owner occupants to reduce their property taxes in exchange for continued care of their cultural resources. I know that I need to finish up. These owners have an opportunity to apply for HRER funding from the city to continue to care for their homes. And that can be pretty huge as there are a lot of original residents on fixed incomes aging in place in Sands North. It's really an incredible program that has done some pretty neat things for our city, so I thank you for your consideration of Sands North as our next historic district.

Mayor Lane: Thank you. Next and last.

[Time: 01:13:20]

Rozer Brevoort: Thank you, Mr. Mayor. I live in Scottsdale. I'm a professional preservation consultant and I have been and around town in many capacities for the last 35 years dealing with historical preservation issues and working with some of the folks we've seen here tonight including the City of Scottsdale and my long-term colleague Bob Graham, who did some homework on this. Many years ago I also was active in the Town and Country neighborhood and I wrote the guidelines for Town and Country that have proved well in terms of a long-term functioning as a historic district that is very successful. I'm also the co-chair of the Post-War Architecture Task Force of greater Phoenix, which is an advocacy group supporting the preservation of mid-century architecture. Mid-century is a buzzword in historic preservation now because it is so prominent in the Phoenix and general valley area of Phoenix, Scottsdale, Mesa, Tempe. It is interesting because it is the bell curve of the architectural stock in the valley, is not the 1920s bungalows, it is the '50s and the '60s, 70s mid-century modern. We often talk about in historic preservation who built it and designed it, but the question about integrity comes up, which is really summed up as would the guy who built it recognize it. And in this case of Sands North the answer is resoundingly yes.

We hear a lot of testimony from citizens to who speak to the character of living in the neighborhood and the community character they aspire to retain. That's what it is all about. People want to be there. And when you tie that down together you realize that also proven out is designation increases, enhances, and creates value. And in the long-term, that's a very important consideration. So, I hope that you will support this motion and move forward for Sands North to be the next historic district in the City of Scottsdale. Thank you.

Mayor Lane: Thank you. That concludes the request for public testimony or request to speak on that topic. I want to thank everybody for responding or giving their opinion on it one way or another. I'm going to go back to the original question that I asked the staff and it responds to Mr. Mann's comments that were made. This is for a specific segment of Sands North and not Sands North in its entirety. If they are outside of this district, there is really no impact to them. Is that correct?

Steve Venker: Mayor, Councilmembers, that is correct.

Mayor Lane: You mentioned before, certainly, the HOAs and CCRs, they stand as far as the designation and what is impacted and those homes that have voted to be in this district and that's where it begins and ends. If they are in the district, but everyone outside of it is not affected?

Steve Venker: That's correct, Mayor.

Mayor Lane: And I don't know as far as how that's working with the HOA but that's something that HOA needs to deal with it. Is that reasonable to assume?

Acting City Attorney Joe Padilla: That is correct. The issue raises an HOA issue, not a City issue.

Mayor Lane: Any Councilmember questions? Councilwoman Klapp.

[Time: 01:17:03]

Councilwoman Klapp: I think that this is a great piece of architecture in the middle of the city that really reflects that the city started in 1951. Mid-century modern architecture is what this city is basically about. This is not an old city. Having talked to the HOA president and learned more about their intentions, I feel that it is a great designation for this neighborhood, yet it's a point of pride for the people here, to be called historic. I have lived in historic homes myself and I understand the pride in living in an historic home and how much it means to the individual homeowners. With that, I'd like to make a motion to adopt Resolution 11589 declaring Sands North as a historic neighborhood.

Mayor Lane: Motion was made by Councilwoman Klapp and seconded by the Vice Mayor. Do you have any questions?

Vice Mayor Littlefield: I originally had some questions regarding this. I spoke to some representatives from the HOA and they answered my questions to my satisfaction, and I support this as something that the residents of Sands North want.

Mayor Lane: Thank you, Councilwoman. We have a motion and a second on table. Those in favor indicate by "aye" and register your vote and nay if you oppose. It is unanimous 7-0 on the passage of Sands North historic district rezoning. Thank you everyone for your input on that.

ITEM 7 – SUNDAY GOODS REZONING (5-ZN-2019)

ITEM 8 – SUNDAY GOODS CONDITIONAL USE PERMIT (2-UP-2019)

[Time: 01:19:09]

Mayor Lane: So, I already have mentioned that Items 7 and 8 have been moved. What I would need right now is that the applicant certainly had the right to pull them from the agenda tonight, but we do need a motion to continue Item 7, Sunday Goods rezoning and Item 8, Sunday Goods Conditional Use Permit 2-UP-2019 to November 12th. Do I have a motion?

Councilmember Korte: Mayor, I move to continue Items 7 and 8 to November 12th.

Councilwoman Klapp: Second.

Mayor Lane: Motion has been made by Councilwoman Korte and seconded by Councilwoman Klapp. Any further comment? Hearing none. I think that we are ready to vote. All those in favor indicate by "aye" and nay if you oppose. It is unanimous to continue these two items until November 12th.

ITEM 9 – BOARDS AND COMMISSIONS

[Time: 01:20:28]

Mayor Lane: Item 9 was the Board and Commissions and that item will be rescheduled for a future Council meeting at the request of staff. I'm hoping that I, I didn't get a notice to announce that earlier. I

hope that all parties were notified. I apologize if they didn't get that notification.

ADJOURNMENT

[Time: 01:20:57]

Mayor Lane: With all that being cleared, I would ask for a motion to adjourn.

Councilwoman Klapp: Move to adjourn.

Councilmember Korte: Second.

Mayor Lane: Motion made and seconded. All those in favor to adjourn indicate by "aye." We are adjourned. Thank you very much.