
This document was created from the closed caption transcript of the January 7, 2026 City Council Special Meeting has not been checked for completeness or accuracy of content.

A copy of the agenda for this meeting, including a summary of the action taken on each agenda item, can be accessed through the City Clerk Archived Documents Search at:

<https://eservices.scottsdaleaz.gov/cityclerk/DocumentSearch>

An unedited digital video recording of the meeting, which can be used in conjunction with the transcript, is available online at:

<https://ww2.scottsdaleaz.gov/scottsdale-video-network/council-video-archives/2026-archives>

For ease of reference, included throughout the transcript are bracketed "time stamps" [Time: 00:00:00] that correspond to digital video recording time.

For more information about this transcript, please contact the City Clerk's Office at 480-312-2411.

CALL TO ORDER

[Time: 00:00:02]

Mayor Borowsky: Calling all Councilmembers to the dais, please. Good afternoon. I'd like to call the January 7, 2026 Special Meeting of the Scottsdale City Council to order. City Clerk, Ben Lane, may I please have our first roll call of 2026.

ROLL CALL

[Time: 00:00:18]

City Clerk Ben Lane: Thank you, Mayor. Mayor Lisa Borowsky.

Mayor Lisa Borowsky: Present.

Ben Lane: Vice Mayor Adam Kwasman.

Vice Mayor Kwasman: Here.

Ben Lane: Councilmembers Jan Dubauskas.

Councilwoman Dubauskas: Here.

**CITY OF SCOTTSDALE
JANUARY 7, 2026 SPECIAL MEETING
CLOSED CAPTION TRANSCRIPT**

PAGE 2 OF 45

Ben Lane: Barry Graham.

Councilman Graham: Here.

Ben Lane: Kathy Littlefield.

Councilwoman Littlefield: Here.

Ben Lane: Maryann McAllen.

Councilwoman McAllen: Present.

Ben Lane: And Solange Whitehead.

Councilwoman Whitehead: Here.

Ben Lane: City Manager Greg Caton.

City Manager Greg Caton: Here.

Ben Lane: Interim City Attorney Luis Santaella.

Interim City Attorney Luis Santaella: Here.

Ben Lane: City Treasurer Sonia Andrews.

City Treasurer Sonia Andrews: Here.

Ben Lane: Acting City Auditor Lai Cluff.

Acting City Auditor Lai Cluff: Here.

Ben Lane: And the Clerk is present. Thank you, Mayor.

[Time: 00:00:47]

Mayor Borowsky: Thank you, Clerk Lane and thank you all for being here. I would like to express my sincere thank you to my Council colleagues for being at this meeting. As many of you know, this is a Special Meeting. It wasn't on our Regular Agenda. I'm thrilled to see everyone could attend and I'm thrilled to see all of you here tonight. Happy new year, and we're off to a great 2026 here at City Hall. And I'm excited about what the future holds.

And let's get started for the Pledge of Allegiance, I would like to ask Councilwoman McAllen to lead us.

PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

I pledge allegiance to the flag of the United States of America, and to the Republic for which it stands:
One nation under God, indivisible, with liberty and justice for all.

Mayor Borowsky: Thank you very much.

EXECUTIVE SESSION

As is always the case, during tonight's meeting, the Council may make a motion to recess into Executive Session in order to obtain legal advice on any applicable item on the agenda, and if authorized by Council, the Executive Session would be held immediately and would not be open to the public. The public meeting would, of course, resume following that Executive Session if it happened.

MAYOR'S OPENING REMARKS

[Time: 00:02:14]

Like I said, thank you all for being here. Welcome to City Hall 2026 and welcome to the Special Meeting where we are discussing all things Old Town and downtown Scottsdale. When I was elected, by the residents of Scottsdale and prior to that, I promised to throw my full support behind a revitalization effort in Old Town and to support Old Town and the merchants and the property owners that do business there.

We encountered some struggles over the last year that indicate to us or at least to me, that Old Town proprietors and downtown business owners feel like the city, we at City Hall are not listening to them and they are not being adequately informed of what's going on in downtown either before or after it happens. So, this meeting is to let you know, rest assured that I'm listening to all of you and I'm committed along with my Council colleagues to focusing on Old Town and downtown, to make it the best downtown core in the country. And there's a lot of work we can do, and I would like to do that together with the stakeholders.

This summit is meant to well, recently I should add, there was a marketing contract that came up before us, and it was voted down and that was for the P.R. efforts directly tied to Old Town and downtown marketing. And we heard a lot of disappointment about that, but let's use that as a blessing in disguise and work together to really strengthen the bonds between City Hall, city staff and the people that really do business in Old Town, and our residents who visit and enjoy Old Town. And together, I think we can make magical things happen in our Old Town area.

This summit is meant to address those ideas to bring city leaders, merchants and tourism experts together for a conversation about our collective future. Tonight, you are going to hear insights and ideas from knowledgeable and respected voices in this space. We're going to start with Joan Fudala, of course our Scottsdale Historian, followed by tourism innovator Michael Lee, and parking solutions expert Chris

Mielke. So, I'm excited to hear from them tonight. I think you will be too.

And following those presentations, City Council will be asked to consider forming a Downtown Scottsdale Task Force, which would be a representative group of stakeholders of the four key districts of Old Town. And this task force will help us refine, ideally, the Downtown Character Area Plan and strengthen marketing efforts that keep Scottsdale very competitive and cutting edge.

The time has come to start listening to the residents and property owners and business owners who make this city the best in the nation. This is about developing and strengthening partnerships. It's about ensuring businesses and cultural assets that define our city continue to flourish. If you care about the future of downtown Scottsdale, I encourage you to share your ideas with us and city staff and consider joining, becoming a part of hopefully the task force that we will put together. Together, we will keep Old Town Scottsdale vibrant and thriving, not just for today, but for generations to come.

And before we begin, I'm going to share a video message from a prominent Old Town Scottsdale business owner who unfortunately could not be here, but I'm sure many of you, if not all of you, know who she is. Sam, if you wouldn't mind teeing up that video for us, it's very brief.

[Time: 00:06:19]

Barbara Peters: I'm Barbara Peters, the owner of the Poison Pen Bookstore. I established it in 1989, moved it here on Goldwater in 1999 because some of the reasons to have the store originally Main Street had gone away unfortunately to a remodel of Main Street which turned it from western to some version of Miami but eradicated a considerable amount of parking. At that time, we were told as tenants that we had no voice at all in what happened. So, I am a supporter of a Downtown Task Force that will allow tenants, not just landlords and small businesses to have a say in the direction that Scottsdale is moving.

Mayor Borowsky: Thank you. And I show you that video because it represents the information and feedback that I personally have been receiving from a wide swath of business operators and owners in Old Town. And so given all the feedback that we've heard from me and my staff have heard and I'm sure many others on this dais and also throughout city staff, given all the information we have received, I think it's time to bring us together so we can hear voices like Jones and those that will speak to us tonight and consider them and take action. So, without further ado, I'm going to move right to the presentations.

PRESENTATIONS

[Time: 00:07:44]

We've got a lot of information to share, and I would like to call upon historian Scottsdale historian Joan Fudala to kick us off. Thank you, Joan, and welcome.

[Time: 00:07:51]

Joan Fudala: Thank you so much, Mayor, Council. My friends and neighbors, and Swifties, because I'm about to take you on the eras tour of Old Town Scottsdale.

So, over the next few minutes, I want to talk a little bit about how Old Town Scottsdale specifically has evolved from a farm-supporting, desert crossroads in the middle of nowhere to a global tourist, business, culinary, arts and residential destination that the world is coming to.

There's always a beginning and the beginning dates back almost 2,000 years and it was all about water. The Hohokam people lived in the area of Old Town, as much as 2,000 years ago, disappeared around 1450 A.D. and really our modern beginnings started in 1885 when W.J. Murphy built the Arizona Canal and provided water for the development that initially then became a small tiny settlement called Scottsdale.

We really kicked off a couple of years later when Army Chaplain Major Winfield Scott and his wife Helen. Winfield had just visited Phoenix, the Salt River Valley in February of 1888 and liked what he saw and talked Helen into using their meager savings to homestead about 640 acres at the corner of what is now Indian School and Scottsdale Road. They paid \$2.40 an acre and that was really a hard sell for them because times were tough, but they had access to the Arizona Canal. And since he grew up as a farmer before he was in the Army, he started the valley citrus industry. He grew all kinds of crops, both food crops, as well as raising a few types of livestock and really tried to emphasize other people to come here for the agricultural opportunities that were available along the Arizona Canal.

So, my first era on our eras tour is the founding era of Old Town, and that's basically the 1890s to the 1920s. Again, we were a very modest community of hard-working people. We had, again, farm dairy farms. We grew alfalfa and then 1914, at the beginning of World War I, when Egyptian Cotton was hard to come by, Pima Cotton became our main cash crop, and we even had a cotton gin located at Brown and Second Street in downtown Scottsdale. Again, we were very quiet community and no paved streets and really no infrastructure.

But we did have a few firsts in those years. We had our first school open in 1896, adjacent to you can see in the lower in the middle left photo, in 1909, we needed a bigger school and so the Little Red Schoolhouse was built. The bottom photo is our first business, which was the first general store and post office, which is at the corner of Brown and Main, right where Bischoffs is now. We had our first church building 1918, and, of course, we had other farm-supporting businesses like the Cavalliere's Blacksmith Shop. We were a real dry community and I'm not talking about the climate. I'm talking about the fact that the Arizona Anti-Saloon League was founded in downtown Scottsdale and many of the business and property owners actually put deed restrictions on their properties that alcohol would never be sold in Scottsdale. So, if you are heading to happy hour after this meeting, remember that's one of the things that hasn't prevailed in Old Town Scottsdale.

And we also had our first cars since we'll be talking about parking tonight, showed up sometime in the

1910s. But really, this was no designated parking in downtown in Old Town Scottsdale. You just kind of parked willy-nilly.

[Time: 00:12:41]

We also had the seeds sown for some of our most important industries today. We had our first tourism, our first healthcare and our first arts come to Scottsdale. We had our first boarding house open in 1897, which morphed a few years later into Graves Guest Ranch which was actually a three-for. It was a guest ranch for tourism. People would come for the whole season and stay there in those little cottages that you see. They also would come to restore their health in the dry climate with a lot of access to fresh foods here, and we also accommodated people that were moving here, and they used the Graves Guest Ranch as that as a temporary lodging facility. I always say too if I were ill and my doctor told me to move to a warm, dry climate, I'm not sure I would pick a place called Graves Guest Ranch, but they did.

We also had the Adobe House which opened in the '20s, again, most of the accommodations for tourists were very small guest ranches and only open usually November through April, because, again, this was before air conditioning. We also had our first artists come and the beginnings of our art community. Marjorie Thomas came here from Boston. She set up the first artist studio here and she was followed a few years later by an accomplished artist by Chicago, Jesse Benton Evans and more artists followed. They had a hard go at the beginning because we had no museums or galleries or any art event. The only art event in the whole Arizona territory was at the State Fair.

Then we move a little bit forward to the next era, the depression and wartime era. We did lose some farms. Our one and only bank closed during the depression. You see the aerial view of about 1936 of what Old Town Scottsdale looked like, and it was mainly three streets, Scottsdale Road, Main Street and Brown Avenue. And it was a mixture, if you can see it at all, of houses and small businesses. Again, mostly directed towards supporting our farm and agricultural industry.

But we also added a few things in Old Town. Certainly, one of our points of pride is the Old Adobe Mission, now listed on the National Register of Historic places and we had our first cafes and bars because we finally allowed alcohol after prohibition had been repealed.

So then came the war years, kind of a transitional period for Scottsdale. The little bit of tourism that we had really died down because of rationing, as well as so many people concentrated on war duties. We accommodated war workers and military that were stationed at what's now Scottsdale Airport, Thunderbird Two Airfield at a housing development, which is right now where the Museum of the West is and that was culled thunder called Thunderbird Homes and that's the picture in the lower right.

The people of Scottsdale, really, as always, were very engaged in the community and helping each other, both during the depression and wartime. In fact, we set a national record for War Bond purchases here in Scottsdale.

But as some would call it, the golden age, I call it the post-war, the west's most western town era. It was

a brainstorm that merchant and future Mayor Malcolm White had. He and other merchants in Old Town thought that they had so much opportunity once the war was over, people were so hungry to travel, they spent the war years watching western movies, and they the whole country was clamoring for western experience. So, Malcolm White decided that we needed a slogan to help jump start tourism, and he came up with the West's Most Western Town. The merchants voluntarily, not only redesigned their buildings in the western motif. The gas station became an auto livery stable. And things like that, the businesses took on kitschy names. We had cattle ranches and cattle drives and whatnot. So, we were truly an authentic western town ever since the Browns Ranch and D.C. Ranch opened in the 1910s. But we didn't look like Hollywood west.

And so that's why we came up with the slogan with the cowboy sign that still stands on the corner of Scottsdale and main since 1952. And we also, thanks to the brand-new Chamber of Commerce that started in 1947, they acted as a pseudo government because we didn't have paved streets. We didn't have events. We didn't have tourism promotion, and also, we needed a body to start having public meetings to talk about maybe incorporating so that we would have infrastructure available to people who were moving here thanks to the G.I. Bill and their thirst for becoming a western.

[Time: 00:18:35]

I also with more and more people driving here rather and spending shorter times here, or finally being able to buy a car, when cars were produced again after World War II, we suddenly went from that willy-nilly parking situation to needing designated parking spaces and one the first places to implement parking spaces was Pima Plaza, when that was first built in the early 1950s. And I might say and this is from my residents' perspective, not necessarily from my historian's perspective, I think a decision was made early on never to have parking meters in Scottsdale, and I surely hope that continues. I hope you all agree.

So, moving on, again, we really were desperate for some infrastructure. And so finally, a petition drive was held in early 1951. We'll be celebrating this throughout this year, our 75th anniversary of incorporation. And the petition drive among the property owners was so successful, that the Maricopa County Board of Supervisors declared Scottsdale, which was Old Town officially incorporated on June 25, 1951. Our population was on less than a half a square mile, which is the nucleus of Old Town now with a population of just over 2,000 people. And the Town Council was actually appointed by the Maricopa County Board of Supervisors, and they got to work right away.

One the first things they did was get fire service through a contract with Rural Fire. And also, in that map in the lower right, they put together a zoning map and zoning for the small space that was downtown Scottsdale. They implemented a street paving plan, and as they were looking at the zoning, they were realizing that as every year passed since the end of the war, we were having less farming and ranching, and we were turning those farming and ranching areas in Old Town and around Old Town into subdivisions and business locations.

This west's most western town era also provided a lot of fun. This was when some of our events

happened but also the first attraction, really, for tourists, as well as new residents was the fact that we were the arts, crafts and fashion center of the entire southwestern United States. We had working artist studios throughout the Old Town area, in fact, the Arizona Craftsman building which is now where Bischoffs is, at Scottsdale and Main, that had working artists in it, that even attracted former First Lady Eleanor Roosevelt who then put us on the national radar when she wrote about how wonderful the arts and crafts were in Old Town Scottsdale after she visited both in 1946, 1947, wrote about it in her national column "My Day."

We had fashion shows. The one in the lower left is one of my favorite all-time photos. This happened 75 years ago this week, when Goldwater's Department Store brought Harper's Bazaar models out on a train from New York City and premiered the latest fashions of that year, which were called Sunset Pinks. And that runway ran all the way from Scottsdale Road to Brown Avenue, and you could see people were even sitting on the rooftops enjoying that fashion show. And we had fashion shows almost every week during the 1950s in downtown Scottsdale. And other than the Sunset Pinks one, almost all the fashion shows were featuring fashions that were being made in the arts and crafts studios in Old Town Scottsdale.

And there on the upper right, you can see some of those craftsmen at the Kiva Craft Center that had opened on Fifth Avenue. Lloyd Kiva and many others that were, again, producing art and pottery, jewelry, leather goods, et cetera.

And also to further our art image, we started opening galleries that featured not only the things being made or produced artistically here in Scottsdale but elsewhere. In the lower corner you see Leo and Buck Saunders who opened one the first galleries, The Trading Post on Brown. They featured Ted DeGrazia who came up from Tucson, and 1,500 people attended his art premier at that gallery, which, again, for little old Scottsdale was a heck of a lot of people!

[Time: 00:23:41]

During that golden era of the west's most western town, tourism also got a big jump. We went from a scattering of guest ranches to having our first two year-round resorts, the Valley Ho which is still very much a great location in Old Town Scottsdale, but the Safari Resort as well. Because these were car-oriented, short stay hotels rather than having somebody come and stay at a guest ranch for an entire season, people wanted something off property to go to. So, this really spurred our restaurant industry as well and restaurants opened throughout the Old Town area, many with the western theme like Lulu Belle, and others with a sports theme, like the Pink Pony and many others.

And then we started our most beloved events. The Sunshine Festival started in 1951 and was the kickoff to the tourist season. A couple of years later, the name was changed to the Parada Del Sol and we look forward to that every year. It started out and morphed into the world's longest horse-drawn parade. And again, it's such a beloved event. We used to have the Miracle of the Roses Pageant every year and that has been revived in recent years in early December.

And of course, we landed a spring training team when the Baltimore Orioles started playing their spring training games here in 1956 at a brand-new ballpark that we had opened.

We also had Western Week. We had art shows and we had the National Indian Arts Exhibition that took place in Scottsdale in Old Town, throughout those years.

We also then had so many new residents moving into Old Town and the surrounding areas that it really drove the need for not just tourism businesses and not so much those farm-oriented businesses anymore, but a whole different type of need. We started having franchises and chains come to Scottsdale rather than just the you know, the one-off merchants and art galleries and art studios downtown. In fact, we opened the first Woolworths in 1959 at the corner of Scottsdale and Main and you will recognize that building as the Legacy Gallery today. With all of those new residents, they needed even more shopping. So, Fashion Square opened in 1961. You will see that at the lower left. We finally got a hospital in 1962 when City Hospital of Scottsdale opened on Osborn, quickly became Scottsdale Baptist Hospital, then Scottsdale Memorial Hospital, Scottsdale Healthcare, and now, of course, HonorHealth.

And then believe it or not, from the 1910s all the way up to the 1960s, we had a number of car dealerships and car lots all throughout the Old Town area, but they when Gray Madison went to move expand his car dealership, at Camelback and Scottsdale Road, the new City Council did not approve the zoning. So that started the exodus of car dealerships away from the Old Town area to the McDowell corridor, and that, again, had an impact on downtown Scottsdale.

[Time: 00:27:22]

The 1970s and '80s were the infrastructure and growth era. We had in the late 1960s, a Scottsdale town enrichment program and one of its big initiatives was to create a purpose-built Civic Center that would include City Hall, the Civic Center library, eventually the center for the arts and other buildings, as well as commercial properties. And throughout the early '70s, that continued to expand. It also spawned the Fine Art Commission, our public art program as they wanted sculptures to be on the new Civic Center and also, it it also created a need for parking garages. And one the first parking garages to open was the Civic Center garage, right behind the Little Red Schoolhouse on the west side of the mall, which opened in 1974.

Throughout the '80s, again the Osborn campus in the '70s and '80s expanded not just outward but upward. In fact, that was I think the first elevator installed in Scottsdale when they opened their towers. The Fashion Square area greatly expanded, and also, we had the east and west sides of the Civic Center were merged with the underpass of Civic Center Boulevard. And then we also started the first iteration of the downtown plan in the mid-80s, as well as the City Council adopting a Canal Bank study which really was going to revitalize what had been the back door to so many businesses downtown, the Arizona Canal and making it a destination. It took a few years to happen, but it did. We also added Old Town events such as the Art Walk, Scottsdale Arts Festival and the Culinary Festival.

I might quickly mention that during the '70s and '80s some of the attention was drawn away from Old Town because we started annexing like crazy. From the time that we incorporated in 1951, until we did our final huge annexation to the north in 1984. And so suddenly there were places like the Airpark and the McDowell Corridor and other places that were trying that were also diluting the attention away from much of what was happening in Old Town, and some might say some of the features in Old Town were kind of neglected from a lot of the attention directed elsewhere.

[Time: 00:30:05]

In the 1990s and 2000s, I call this the urban and global area era, because certainly with the advent of the worldwide web, suddenly merchants and businesses in downtown, Old Town Scottsdale had global access through being able to market and sell over the Internet and also with the advent in the early 1990s slowly but surely there were more exits along the loop 101 that gave the entire valley access, quick access to Old Town to our events, to our retailers, to our restaurants and so many of the features also giving employers opportunities to bring employees from all over the valley to work in Old Town Scottsdale.

Our waterfront certainly was a huge leap forward from that original Canal Bank study, finally then resulting in the north bank of the Arizona Canal opening in 2006 and the following year in 2007 south bridge. In 2008, ESPN throughout the week leading up to Super Bowl broadcast right there from the Marshall Way Bridge, which was, again, another national feather in feather in our cap. And although some called it a white elephant when the Galleria opened in the early 1990s and only operated about 18 months and sat vacant. Fortunately, we turned that lemon into lemonade and brought about the Galleria Corporate Center which was important for the merchants and the restaurants and other businesses' standpoint because it was giving them built-in customers that needed to eat lunch or dinner or shop. Again, we have a habit of turning lemons into lemonade.

We also during that period of being global and urban realized that it was important to not forget our history and start preserving things. We started the Scottsdale Historic Preservation Program in 1997. Currently, there are 28 properties on the list. 16 of which are our most beloved properties in Old Town Scottsdale and many of those same properties are also listed on the National Register of Historic Places. We started implementing a public art program, mostly funded by private funds to honor Scottsdale history makers like Winfield and Helen Scott and Herb Drinkwater and even nonhuman things like the Yearling Statue that greets people as they come on to Civic Center Mall.

And we thanks to a youth standing right here in 1996 and lobbying the City Council, we started curbside recycling, and we also started a Green Building program. We have a number of them in Old Town Scottsdale from the fire department on Indian School Road to the Museum of the West that are LEED-certified buildings.

Now we come to the present. Again, this is the redevelopment and the rebirth era. We've realized so many exciting things for Old Town, whether it's western spirit, the Museum of the West, a revitalized and revamped Civic Center that debuted a couple of years ago. We built the new hotels like Caesars, the

Canopy, Senna House, Remy and several others on the books. We have Canal Convergence, and we have a lot of beloved Old Town treasures that we still are so happy to patronize whether it's Los Olivos, the Sugar Bowl, Parada del Sol, our wonderful gallery, and spring training games and many others that stood the test of time.

I hope this gives you an idea of how Old Town has evolved as an arts, a residential, sports, cultural, just so many retail, just so many aspects of Old Town Scottsdale. And this year, our 75th anniversary of Scottsdale gives us so many reasons to celebrate Old Town Scottsdale. Thank you.

Mayor Borowsky: Thank you very much, Joan. That's a wonderful retrospective of what we have had and what we can move forward using. So next I'm going to ask Michael Lee to come up and talk to us about all things tourism. Welcome, Mike.

[Time: 00:34:50]

Mike Lee – MLD Worldwide: Thank you, Mayor and Council and everybody else that came. Yeah, everything I know about tourism, Lamar asked me to do in seven minutes. And so shouldn't be a problem. Experiences have always been at the heart of entertainment, but are now at the heart of our economy, so said Joseph Pine in a book written about 25 years ago now, called "The Experience Economy." I recommend that highly to you if you are interested in tourism. If you are interested in retail, if you are interested in why experiences are important, that is what you are selling when you are in the tourism business. You are selling experiences and that's what I do. I plan, design and produce the guest experience. And I have done that with entertainment projects, with learning projects and hospitality, shopping projects and I have done it in those places around the world. About as many outside the country as inside the country. When you are doing this kind of thing, you have to think about business and you have to think about, well, all the kind of things and business that makes it a business.

In addition to that, you gotta have a place for the business like a facility and that's easy, compared to some things. Building area, enclosures, waterproofing types of materials, you know, all of those kind of things. But the part that's always left out and the part that's talked about as though it's frosting on the cake is the show! And what is the show? Well, it's all the things that the guest sees and feels and walks away thinking or singing, and they don't sing the architecture. If we take away the facility, in fact, you have show business. And that's what I've done in fact, Joan, thank you, for the history lesson. I used to not like history at all, but now that I got some of it, I like it better.

Years ago, well, let's go back, in 1805, the world changed. I don't know if you know what happened in 1805. It wasn't here, but in Rosia Bay at the entrance to the Mediterranean, some folks there approached me and said, we have a little area that we'd like to attract tourists to. In fact, almost everybody that talks to me says, how do we increase tourism? And that's a pretty common thing to think, but then I began to say, do they really want to? Do they really want more people or is it just the money that they want?

The town of Moab in Utah asked me that about 15 or 20 years ago. And today, they've got lots of people

and if you ask them, they say, we love the tourism, but it's just the people that we don't like. Well, back to Rosia Bay, they said what can you do? I said do you have enough for them to do? And they said, well, yeah. They walk around see all the shops there are. In fact, at the time this was taken, they were building more you know, more facilities. And I said, well, more facilities means more shops but what kind of story do people understand about this place? They said story? Story? Oh, that's right. We have a pamphlet that we hand to them, and it tells the story. Do they read the pamphlet? Well, no, a lot of people don't read the pamphlet. I said, what about if we do something and they had about a comparable number to the people who come to Scottsdale. I think it was in those days about between 9 and 12 million people came to Rosia Bay. And why did they come? Well, they weren't coming because of the buildings. They came because they wanted a show.

[Time: 00:39:43]

So, this is what we proposed. A show that would take place in Rosia Bay and tell the story of maybe some of you know it Joan is gonna know it because she's a history buff. The battle of Trafalgar was fought off the coast of Rosia Bay in 1805, and as you recall, the British fought the French and Spanish who ruled the world at the time, but the British won. And from that point on, in the early 1800s until this little start-up country came along, called the U.S., the British ruled the seas. And that's the day it happened October 21st, I think it was of 1805. If you put on a show, you don't just hand out a pamphlet, but you make people understand the importance of what happened here, and you do it in a way that is heart pounding, so that people are saying, yeah! Yeah! You've been in shows like that. You have been at concerts like that, where you can feel the music. You can see the lights, and that's what people are paying for. They are paying for an experience. And that's what they want.

Nothing happened, however at Rosia Bay. And last year I'm sorry, in 2024, almost last year ago, they issued a report. It was done by their Chamber of Commerce that said, the key to unlocking tourism's full potential is transport. And I thought, okay. Well, they're coming along, it only took a few years for them to understand how important it was. I had hoped that they would say "show is the most important thing." A lot of times before the show, they think about facilities and physical things. So, they're thinking about that. And eventually, mark my words, they pull a show on in Rosia Bay. They did a plan like this that shows where vehicles can move people because it's too big to walk. You can't walk around the mountain called Gibraltar and have any energy at the end of the day. It's way too much.

And we proposed things like this, the trolley on the upper left-hand side was built by an old friend of mine who had been the chief structural engineer at Disney during the EPCOT days. And the various other trolleys. I like the one on the top left-hand side because I think it's more authentic. I kind of don't like the look and feel, although they are very practical and some of them run on electricity. So, they are environmentally sound. Anyway, we can talk about that kind of thing.

What's the takeaway from this story? Well, offering stories that are unique, the story at Rosia Bay is definitely a unique story, but the information alone is not sufficient. If you can present the story of your community and perhaps even a larger story of the region, then more people will be interested in being here. Story is at the heart of what you are doing, and information is not sufficient. When guests

are away from their cars, they are able to think differently. When they are in their car, they are a different person but if you can get them out of their car, they become the the person the real people are the ones who are outside their car. And lastly, emotional experiences drive the economics. Well, and vice versa. Numbers inform ideas but ideas also inform numbers.

So, as we think about as you think about this going forward, modeling these ideas with numbers and then having those numbers inform how big, how long, how much a show can be you can model the show much better. You can model the numbers much better, you will be able to know are more about the numbers if you know that it's a show.

Another project I have done a lot of work for the Polynesian Cultural Center in Hawaii and this is the IMAX theater. I don't know why they allowed them to do this, but it looked like an old gray battleship to me. They said can you do something with that, because, you know, we like the show that plays inside but the building is not exactly Polynesian. I said no, it's not. Let us do something and that's what we did. Maybe some of you have been there. It's very different. The whole front end of Polynesian cultural center has changed over the last since 2006 or '07 is when we began.

The takeaway from that, I think, is don't be inconsistent with your story, saying one thing and building another. It's confusing for your guests. You can't be the best western town in the west and have confusing architecture at the same time. Now, I'm not suggesting you become Santa Fe. I know lots of towns that are like Santa Fe. And I'm not asking the architects, I am an architect. I'm not asking the architects to curtail what they are doing in creative ways but I'm just pointing to some cautionary things that have happened in other places that have lost their message. They have lost their ability to communicate because people understand the guest is getting confused by what they're saying and doing.

[Time: 00:46:33]

Another project, this one also is from the Polynesian Cultural Center and I'm sorry I meant to put in here the what this building looked like beforehand but Polynesians, for the most part are big and proud people. And the doors on this building used to be aluminum and about that you know, this big. Well, some Polynesians are, you know, families can't get through that door without going one by one. So, we put in a door that was 12 feet wide and 12 feet tall and we had to have it specially made. And then we put this as the portico outside that door, and on the inside, we did this. Some of you have been in the building. It's called the Gateway Building. And we built a mural designed and had painted a mural. It's one the biggest murals now in the world. At times it's 20 feet tall. You can see over on the right-hand side, and this is the close-up of it, it tells the story of Waya. About the time that we had finished that, they said, wow! We're getting a lot more people now. And it was not a surprise that that would happen.

So, we this is the last thing we did for them and completed in 2016. The entire retail front end has changed. This is a sketch up model of it, and there I am pretending to smile about having worked on the project. This is what it looks like at nighttime with people coming. There's as many people now that come there. We recommended to them that they not have an entry fee on that side of the project and

they don't. So, guess what, lots of people go there! And they're making I won't tell you the dollars per square foot, but people here would be very happy with the dollars per square foot.

And I spent all day yesterday walking around, looking at things, talking to people, and I said, I'm kind of tired of walking around here. It's I wasn't tired of being there, but I was tired my legs were tired. So, I said, you know what I'm going to do, I will take Disneyland and impose it on the top of this because I know when I walk around Disney, I'm walking a minimum 3 to 5 miles and at a maximum if I go to everything, I'm walking about 15 miles. Well, there's Main Street Disneyland on top of your Main Street from what is that? From the roundabout east over to what is that street? Yeah. Yeah. Is the Old Town comparable? In some ways it is.

I will leave you with this thought. Artfulness leads to good experience and good experience is good business. When experience is the guest's purchase intent and it is then artistry is the essential element. Art is not just hung on the walls. It's in and through everything that you do, including the clothes that people wear and the way that they talk to other people who they know are guests. Facilities are only the stage upon which the show takes place, and I'm sorry to my architect friends to say that, because most architects don't believe, but I do. It's not the facilities for which the for which the people come. That's simply the theater within which the show takes place. So don't make the facilities different than the message.

Guests want to be moved physically and emotionally. Have you ever been in a place where the kids are jumping around. If you don't move them, they will move themselves and they get tired very quickly, especially when they are old like me. So, try a mixture of storytelling, music, acting, dance, visual tickles we will call them and you do much better. Those of you who are retailers know what I'm talking about. But it's not icing on a cake. It's got to be in and around and through what you are doing. Full immersion experiences promote a suspension of disbelief. We can talk at length about that but look it up and I think you will find some interest there. And amusement parks are not theme parks. Why? Because stories are the most important part of theme parks and there are a lot of times nowhere to be found in an amusement park. The businesses that you are in and the business of running the community is show business. Thank you.

[Time: 00:52:21]

Mayor Borowsky: Thank you, Michael. Sounds like we should have a much longer conversation about all those great ideas. So, thank you for that presentation. Next and last of the presentations we have Chris Mielke and he is of SoniPark LLC and Chris is a long-time resident of Scottsdale, right, Chris.

Chris Mielke - SoniPark LLC: Yes, I have been a resident in Scottsdale since 1992 . I'm also a degreed mechanical engineer, a former rocket scientist, a plasma expert, laser expert, a licensed contractor in two states...

Mayor Borowsky: And you are here to talk about the parking.

Chris Mielke: And a parking expert, I've been in the parking business for 21 years.

Mayor Borowsky: All right. Take it away Chris, thanks.

[Time: 00:53:07]

Chris Mielke: So, we know that parking is an issue and kind of a Mercurial issue. I think we could use what is already here and maximize it and making Scottsdale come into the 21st century while keeping the motif of Old Town. Next slide.

Okay. So, a couple of things for the motorists. One of the things that we do with parking guidance, the first touchpoint that any city has with a motorist is the traffic. Once you get past the traffic, the second touchpoint is parking. It's you want to have a good parking experience for your customers, for your citizens, because you don't want them pissed off. Happy people spend money. Happy people talk about their great experience. That's why Walmart has greeters.

So, one thing that we can do with what is already here, with the parking lots that are here and there's the lots and the garages is that we can have dynamic sign counts. One of the keys is accurate sign counts, when you go to Sky Harbor Airport and you see the horrible signs their system is beyond horrid and you go there, oh, there's 132 spaces on this level and you go in there and it's none. And you go to the level that says full and there's 200 spaces. We don't do that. We are the inventor of the technology. We easily have the world's largest install base. Every time we come out with new technology, all of our competitors are chasing our tail and they can never get it right because they can't compare. There are seven handicapped spaces. And there are three EV spaces. We can also put emergency fire spaces and so those people can know that there are spaces for them to park in these different garages. We can change the detector colors of any of our detectors to any color on the color wheel. So, let's say there is a whole row that you want to change from standard spaces to ADA spaces. You repaint the spaces and make them a bit wider so there's ADA loading and we change it to blue, you're off and going.

What this does for the municipality, the parking data can be collected for the garage. Our system is from the minute a vehicle parks it tells you how long it parked, the time it parked. We can offload the dynamic information for the entire garage. These are the peak hours. This is the average stay. This is the peak day, like, one of our clients Rockville Town Square. They thought Friday was their busiest day. And it turns out it was Thursday during happy hour because they had two hours of free parking, people would come in and drink for two hours and leave. The nice thing about this to is this is exportable to excel and you can make all type of unique graphs and do whatever you want with it. Then you know whether you need parking. If you need more parking, our system will tell you, and it's not some guy sitting in a beach chair counting cars going in. I think that car has been here 20 minutes. You know exactly how long the vehicle has been there.

Also to, for most the garages, they are three-hour maximum parking. You pull into a space, and the detector is red. The minute someone is there for three hours and one second, you get a yellow light. We can have it flash or alert. It shows up on the screen, on the computer screen and the control screen.

Okay.

Also, one other thing is that we have 20 different types of databases already built into our software and with our software, you pay for it one time and what it will do is you can use it to tie into pay on foot systems. You can use it to maybe summon a trolley, hey 20 people just parked in the Civic Center garage, get a trolley over there and drive them around.

Next, couple things that I notice about the garages here in Scottsdale, they're all hidden which is a good thing because we want to keep the motif of Scottsdale of Old Town. Parking garages are usually very utilitarian. They are not very the aesthetics of them is not very good. And we're playing where's Waldo with parking is not good because people who aren't from here come down and they want to go to art galleries and they're like, okay, I can't find any on-street parking. Where am I gonna go?

This slide shows you the signage that's there for the Museum of the West parking. I went to the Museum of the West parking lot this last Saturday night at 8:08 p.m. and there were six cars in 125 spaces available, but the problem is if you look at these pictures, nobody can find the garage. There's similar problem with the parking corral and where the farmers market is. If you look at the signage and the entrance to that garage, it's terrible. And people don't know there are including the ramp, there are 122 spaces below there. The only people who know that those spaces are there, are the people for the farmers market. Dynamic signage is key. Here some of the signs available for the Civic Center garage. The Civic Center is the only one-way garage that I have seen in 21 years. It's a very strange 21 years. It's a very strange garage. If you locate on the northwest corner, you have 59 spaces and then it spits you out in the alley by Los Olivos. They think that's a one way alley they don't know to make a left and reenter the garage where there's another 250 spaces. If you had an individual space count technology within the garage, and you had signage there that said if you make a left here, there's another 134 spaces and 16 handicapped spots, you would get people parked out of their vehicles and happy as a clam and ready to spend money and have fun.

[Time: 00:59:21]

The only garage that does have a lot of signage is the South Bridge garage, which is under the Barrio Queen but most people don't even know it's there. If you look, there's four signs and they are all within 20 feet of one another. I superimposed and by the way, I'm not a graphics design artist. You will see some of this stuff and it will look like somebody's third grader did this. You get the point. In the middle, there if you had a dynamic sign that said 110 spaces and six handicapped spaces and three E.V. spaces, people would know that they're not just talking you see that sign and people think it's signage for that lot right there, that goes right up to the waterfront, let alone if you go around and then underneath that there's a whole bunch of parking.

Here are a couple examples that I put in. I think the signage needs to look old. It needs to be rusted it needs to look rusted or rustic. The city of Scottsdale could mimic the cowboy on Main and Scottsdale Road or put cowboy hats on top of the signs or whatever, anything to kind of make it old, but keep the dynamic signage and one of the key is anybody can have dynamic signage. You see it at Sky Harbor

Airport but it's got to be accurate. That's one the key things.

I did a couple other eighth grade drawings, maybe put a cowboy hat at the top of the signs. Right once you get to the stop sign around the roundabout over around the Museum of the West in the art gallery area. If you make a left, there's 76 spaces and three I think I counted six handicapped spaces in that garage. Oh, back one more.

Also too, the little sign on the right, those are called blade signs. We have a lot of blade signs that we have on garages back east because they don't want something obstructing people walking. So, they have them up on their building and then they have arrows but they do have the dynamic display in there. This is up with the only wild cards with our systems is we don't make...

[Time: 01:01:37]

Vice Mayor Kwasman: Can I have a point of order just real fast. I'm so sorry. Chris is a neighbor of mine and full disclosure and wonderful human being and we see each other weekly. But Mr. City Attorney, can we confirm about procurement issues, that because I see SoniPark right there. There's a lot of we in our systems. I want to make sure with any potential RFP or anything like that, that we are in the clear here.

Interim City Attorney Luis Santaella: Mayor and City Council. Vice Mayor Kwasman, you raise some interesting questions. I believe the Purchasing Director is present and would be the best person to answer those questions.

Purchasing Director Jen Myers: Hello. So, I do think that we would want to do a competitive process, an RFP for a system like this, if that is what the city was interested in doing.

Vice Mayor Kwasman: If that's true, Mr. City Attorney I want to make sure that we're not breaking the Charter right now.

Luis Santaella: So, Vice Mayor Kwasman and Mayor Borowsky and members of the City Council, it's the issue is that this particular potential vendor is giving a presentation before the City Council, and that I don't know if he's going to bid on any sort of project or not. Perhaps we could ask him, but it potentially does give him a competitive advantage in an RFP process.

Vice Mayor Kwasman: This is absolutely no disrespect for the gentleman who I'm standing across from right now who is, again, a friend, I see him on a weekly basis. This is not any disrespect but I'm if we I don't find this appropriate with all due respect. I would like to have a vote on whether we can continue with this presentation, but I for one, I'm going to make a motion that we discontinue this for procurement purposes and the Charter.

Chris Mielke: Can I state one thing, that I'm not going to give any numbers, just what our technology does.

Councilwoman Dubauskas: Second.

Mayor Borowsky: So, I'm going to chime in. We got a legal opinion. I would like to hear a little more expanded based on the purchasing director because I think Councilman Kwasman, Vice Mayor Kwasman has raised a legal issue. I would like to have a more expanded. Obviously, if there was a violation of an ethical rule, I would assume that our acting city attorney would point that out and it would not be necessary to take a vote on such an item. So, it's easier a violation of the ethics procurement code or it's not. I mean, if you are taking a vote to terminate the presentation. I want to hear from the city attorney. Obviously if there's a violation of any procurement code or ethics, which, you know, we have presentations from people in business all the time up here that might, in fact, be submitting on some future proposal. We don't even have let me, for the record, we don't even have an RFP. We haven't given direction for an RFP. We may never have an RFP. So, can you expand on this for us, legal advice, please?

Luis Santaella: Mayor and members of the City Council, I provide legal advice and it's up to you, the Council, this body to decide whether to continue with the presentation.

Vice Mayor Kwasman: I withdraw my motion and would like to go into Executive Session.

Mayor Borowsky: I would still like to hear legal advice. Excuse me, we were hearing from the city attorney and you don't have the floor Vice Mayor Kwasman. So, if you wouldn't mind giving us legal...

[Time: 01:05:55]

Luis Santaella: I would prefer to give my advice in private, to attorney client privilege. I think it would be appropriate to go into Executive Session to discuss this matter fully.

Councilwoman McAllen: I will second the motion.

Mayor Borowsky: Was there a motion.

Councilwoman McAllen: Didn't you just motion it.

Vice Mayor Kwasman: If the motion was timely, then I did motion.

Mayor Borowsky: Sure.

Vice Mayor Kwasman: Sure, I move to go into Executive Session just for the sake of legal advice.

Councilwoman McAllen: And I will second that motion.

Mayor Borowsky: Well, it appears we're going to move into Executive Session, and we'll be back to resume the meeting. Thank you.

Mayor Borowsky: Sorry, we will take a vote. Pardon me. All those in favor.

Mayor Borowsky: Thank you for your patience. Thank you for your patience and we're back on the record, resuming the general excuse me, Regular City Council meeting and we have concluded our Executive Session. And I am due to the concerns that were raised about potential procurement advantages, we are going to suspend the presentation on the parking, just for the record, there has been no RFP. It's not agendized for an RFP and to alleviate any concerns, we will move forward. That will conclude the presentations. Thank you for the presenters who are here. And I apologize for the disruption. Yeah. Thank you.

ITEM 1 AND ITEM 1A – PUBLIC COMMENT

[Time: 01:08:54]

And then we will move on to public comment on item one and we will go ahead and take all the speakers in the order, starting with the ones that are listed under 1A and everyone will be entitled to three minutes. So, I'm just going to go down the list and you can come over here to the podium. Starting with Tom Silverman. And then followed by Hong Bischoff, and George Cavalliere.

Former Councilmember Tom Silverman: Thank you, Mayor. I'll be brief. I served on the Council, and I know when you don't really want to hear too much from me. So, I will be brief, I promise. Just quickly some history, my family was in the tourism business for 60 years in Scottsdale, we moved here from Chicago in 1953. We opened the Paradise Valley Guest Ranch with a wrangler and riding sources located on north Scottsdale Road, about a half mile north of Camelback Road. And by the way Scottsdale Road when we moved here was a little two-lane road and also there was no air conditioning. We moved here, it was just swamp coolers, but you know what, we got along with it. The north side border of the town of Scottsdale was Camelback Road. And we were actually in the county. We were not even in Scottsdale. And I believe Scottsdale had a population, at that time of around 2,500 people. Very small town. We closed the guest ranch in 1977 and built Chaparral Suites which was an all-suite hotel. During that time, we donated our land on the south side of our property to the city, so that Chaparral Road could continue through to Scottsdale Road.

Over the years I have learned how important Old Town is to our local tourism. We cannot afford to lose the cache and the warmth that it displays to all that experience it. That's really why I'm here tonight. I'm very concerned about Old Town. I think we need to continue to work with Experience Scottsdale and others that have worked with us over the years to promote Scottsdale.

Our General Plan 2035, which had much input from the citizens of Scottsdale, should be referred to as much as possible. Just another interesting note, the last fiscal year for the city, the bed tax raise was \$34 million to promote Scottsdale, which I think is impressive. What really worries me again is how the older shopping areas are all being torn down in the valley. And I dread that could happen to Old Town, because it makes us different, you know, than Mesa and Tempe and all the other towns around. It's very special. It has a great feeling to visitors. I know, because I dealt with them and they loved it and to this

day, you can go to just recently, I was in Old Town and it's packed! People love it. Fashion Square is beautiful, but so is our Old Town. We need both experiences. So please, whatever we can do to keep Old Town around, it's very important and keeps us so different and so unique in Scottsdale. Thank you for your time.

Mayor Borowsky: Thank you for being here, Tom. Appreciate it. Next, we have Hong Bischoff.

[Time: 01:12:47]

Hong Bischoff - Bischoff's Gallery and Bischoff's Shades of the West: Hi, everybody. Just by surprise. I didn't know I was going to speak. Just when I got here. Actually, we have been in Old Town for 54 years. And the same locations. We see the Old Town changes so much, and business changes so much, dynamically, and last year, I guess, everybody was talking about it was so bad a year, and sort of everybody was thinking, what are we going to do? Since after pandemic, shopping experiences start changing. So even with promoting all the fun, whatever it is, we need to shift the mind, find a different point how we can create a new energy and experience adding on the old one.

So basically, that's what I'm thinking all the time and try adding something more interesting to guests in Old Town. Everybody tell me coming here talking about the parking things and just look at the commotion just a few minutes ago. And I was like, okay. I don't know to I should say.

Anyway, I have lots of parking. I never had problem with parking and besides on the March and very busy time. So parking is always good for business. So, adding or not adding on, but how you're adding on, how you make that look good for the Old Town Scottsdale, it's very important. So that's very big subject for the farmers market, building a three-story parking structure there. And visually, I think maybe it's a little destructive, because the church has been there, the Old Mission there, and the Cavalliere is right across the street. It's a very low structure. If you build a very concrete box in the middle of town, and the surrounding, where look just a little shattered. So, the hallway can do this as a structure and it's challenging. It's not just put a cowboy hat will change the look. Because I'm training as an architect. I care how the structure look. If you travel the world, New York, England, whatever, every time you walk into the very dynamic park, people keep the green in the park and a lot of people have amenities, art. So that's what I did for the Old Town. I did lots of flower gardens and everybody think it's a city garden but that's okay. Everybody enjoyed.

And so, I think if you want to do the parking structure there, you have to think about not just three stories, how you can make a little more friendly and think about the farmers market and do something find somebody very intelligent, interesting. Like in New York, you are walking on the subways with the green walking and it's beautiful and what Scottsdale can do, we can think just put a cowboy hat, it will not change anything. Nothing will happen.

Mayor Borowsky: Thank you so much Hong. Next, we have George Cavalliere who has donated his time to his wife Liz. I will welcome her down and Brian Raab has donated his time to Matt Carter.

[Time: 00:16:38]

Elizabeth Cavalliere – Cavalliere's Blacksmith Shop: Thank you, Mayor and Councilwomen and men. My name is Elizabeth Cavalliere and my husband George was supposed to be behind me, but he stayed behind. We have the Cavalliere Blacksmith Shop on the corner of Second Street and Brown. It's been there since 1909. His grandfather was the 17th citizen of Scottsdale. So, we do have a little bit of history here in Scottsdale and so I would like to thank Joan for actually bringing up my father-in-law. He was the creator of the west most western town's brand and the creator of the Sunshine Parade and he has had Greasewood Flats and so the Blacksmith Shop due to COVID. We would love to be open but we can't find people to work with us, not at a price we can afford being in Old Town.

Our concern is the parking garage on multiple levels. One, it's gonna affect our tenant The Mission. When the parking garage was built the first time, it took double the time that they said it would. It actually closed the restaurant at that time, The Union, the dust, the noise and the closure of the streets and that's our concern. If we go with this new garage or whether they are building it up high or redoing it, we are losing Old Town. As people were talking. If you walk around Old Town, the arts and crafts, there's a lot of jewelry stores now, but the Blacksmith Shop is really the most western part of Old Town. If you really think about it, unfortunately, it's not open. We are trying to do things to get it opened but if this parking garage hinders people from coming in, we are not going to be able to make it and our concern is The Mission will not be able to make it as well.

I used to work with Marilyn Atkinson. I'm sure many of you know her. And her main purpose was to preserve historic Old Town Scottsdale. And that's what we, the Cavallieres would like to see. Preservation of historic Old Town, not a parking garage. There's a bigger one behind us. It could suffice for the lack of parking that the city feels that there is. That's all I have to say, Matt, if you want to come consume the other minutes, thank you for your time.

Mayor Borowsky: Thank you, Liz appreciate it. Next, we have Matt Carter, followed by Todd Bankofier.

[Time: 01:19:56]

Matt Carter – Mission Restaurant: Hello, how are y'all doing tonight? Good, I hope. My name is Matt Carter. I'm a chef here in Scottsdale. Born and raised in Scottsdale, Arizona. I have lived and worked here my whole life. I really enjoyed the history lesson. Actually, reminded me of a silly story I will tell really fast. I worked at the Brown Derby back in 1984, and I forged my birth certificate to get the job. That's really where I started my culinary career. I'm the chef at Mission in Old Town and I'm in the hospitality business. I try to teach that to my staff, right? I'm a chef. I care about my food. I care about cocktails, decor and everything else, at the end of the day we're there to take care of customers. I field a lot of complaints. We serve a couple thousand people a day, the food is too hot, the food is too spicy, so on and so forth. The one complaint that I never hear is there's not enough parking.

I cannot tell you that I...And I say that with Mission specifically, but I do have another restaurant north Scottsdale called the Zinc Bistro, and that's in Kierland Commons. That's in Phoenix, by the way. And I

have parking problems there. So, I'm familiar with the subject but I do not hear it in Scottsdale. And, you know, I do have concerns about the shutting down and the blockage of our business, not only from the finished project being height and everything else, but kind of ruining the skyline but also shutting down our business for a period of time. I really like the ideas about technology and being able to make Scottsdale the way it is, being able to keep the structure and the billing design and everything else. It is a tourist hub. We are. We live and die by tourism. I have joked for years that if my all my clients were just locals, I would probably my restaurants would be half the size. So, we want them to be down here. Tourists aren't parking. They are taking Uber and Waymo and to get that locked in and loaded would be the proper direction for us to take.

I think that's all I've got for tonight. I wanted to say please, this coming fall, vote for my business partner Brian Raab for City Council. Cheers, guys. Thank you.

Mayor Borowsky: Wow! All right, thank you, Matt. Great food there at the Mission. Todd Bankofier, followed by Steve Sutton and finally Carmen Fallen.

[Time: 01:22:54]

Todd Bankofier, Chief Executive Officer – Western Spirit Museum: Thank you, Mayor and members of the Council, my name is Todd Bankofier, and I'm the C.E.O. at the Western Spirit Museum. Western spirit, Museum of the West is not just a building in Old Town Scottsdale filled with art and artifacts. It is a vibrant gateway to our history, culture and community identity. Western Spirit plays a crucial role in serving both as an attraction and a hub of engagement. As a Smithsonian affiliate, it represents the 19 western states of the United States, along with southern Canada and northern Mexico, all comprising the North American west. In the last year alone, 50,000 people came through the doors at western spirit and 48% of them visited us from outside of Arizona. They are coming to Scottsdale looking for something authentic. Something that they can only experience here. The Museum of the West helps to give them that cultural anchor point in the middle of our art galleries, our shopping and dining and entertainment. They want to feel something. They want to connect with Scottsdale in a meaningful way.

The Museum of the West is one of the few places where visitors come see face to face with the stories that actually made this region. Through western art, culture, voices and the many perspectives that shaped the modern west. Tourism plays such a crucial role in breathing life into our city, allowing it to thrive and serve as a beacon of inspiration and enjoyment. As we engage with our guests, we share what also makes us unique, the stories, the traditions, and the values that define us in our community.

Another key aspect of tourism is the ability to unite us, when we welcome visitors we open our hearts, our homes, our businesses offering a glimpse into our way of life. This great exchange creates a strong sense of pride amongst our residents. Having the museum in the west in the west's most western town has become a wonderful gift for our city and the citizens. And when Joan was up here, I couldn't help but think of Paul Messinger who told me so many stories about how this museum got started and the meetings he had in the back of his mortuary on Indian School, just to get this museum started. It took visionaries like Paul Messinger and I just had a moment there.

We are very proud of the partnership that we is with the city of Scottsdale to showcase this iconic asset. So, as we celebrate our 75 anniversary this year, let's remind ourselves that we need to continue to promote and improve upon this very vital and important characteristics of our city. Thank you very much.

Mayor Borowsky: Thank you, Todd. I appreciate you coming down. Next, we have Steve Sutton.

PUBLIC COMMENT

[Time: 01:26:36]

Steve Sutton address on record. Mayor Borowsky, before I start, I would like to point something out. When the agenda was set and posted online, there were four separate items on the agenda. And citizens and residents were able to sign up to speak on all four items and that's exactly what I did as I prepared to speak on item one, which was Presentations, item 1A, item 2 and item 3. And I have done quite a bit of preparation for this and I'm more than happy to combine what I was going to say on presentations and then on the downtown merchants which appears to be a separate agendized items. They were not really in public comment but preplanned. I can't do that in three minutes on those two items. I need to have more time. I've prepared to do a little less than three on the first one and just a little bit more than two on the second one.

Mayor Borowsky: So, Steve, we just, as the Chair, I moved the Presentations to just public speakers and just decreased their times. They are both related matters own Old Town and downtown. I'm not sure what the issue is, except are you asking for a little bit more time.

Steve Sutton: I definitely need more time.

Mayor Borowsky: Can we do it in four minutes. Will that be okay.

Steve Sutton: I don't think I can do it in four. I worked to put this a lot of effort into this, specifically on the things that were mentioned, what people will be talking to, starting with an amplification of what Joan said.

Mayor Borowsky: Let's see what you can do. Steve, I have all the faith and confidence and sorry for the confusion. I really appreciate you working with us. And, you know, just go ahead and say what you were going to say.

Steve Sutton: All right. Honorable Mayor Borowsky and Councilmembers. The Old Adobe Mission history was talked about briefly by Joan and I spoke to Joan on Veterans Day about the Old Adobe Mission to confirm some of the things I'm going to say right now and after listening to Mike Lee, it reinforces things I believed for a while. The story of the Old Adobe Mission and how it came to be is partially a story of how Scottsdale evolved from a socially discriminant against Hispanics communities to acceptance of

Hispanics in city leadership, over decades. And yet, I have seen very little official recognition of the Hispanic contribution to the development of Scottsdale. The Little Red Schoolhouse Historical Museum has a single sentence mentioning the Mexican Cotton workers who came here to Scottsdale, and who actually built that mission. And there's a couple of pictures and perhaps on Bennie Gonzalez who designed the building that we are now in. The Old Adobe Mission is more than just an old church. It was the de facto civic center of Scottsdale for decades, that legacy should be respected. Old Adobe Mission is still a church where many people get married because of its beauty and historical significance. Building a garage in front of Old Adobe Mission is disrespectful for what it represents.

Since May of 2025, I have spoken to thousands of people in front of the parking corral and other Scottsdale locations tourists are almost universally opposed to have a parking garage. They have all but begged me to sign the petition I have opposing the building of a garage. Many tourists tell stories of how their city government has ruined historical areas with inappropriate buildings. We need to preserve, as Mike Lee says, the show and the story, and the story of historic Old Town is it's an Old Town and the low building heights and things that fit in with the motif and the mystique that has been built since it became a city in 1951.

[Time: 01:31:03]

Video and slide presentations earlier this year at Council meetings have complained that we have less parking spaces own tell us one thing, we have less parking spaces not many less but some. That's not evidence that we need more parking spaces. Only a parking study is sufficient to determine needs. Anecdotal evidence is not necessary for justifying a 15 to \$20 million expenditure in tax dollars to add 183 new parking spaces and it may not be that many because one of the plans is 170. If anecdotal evidence then my observation of over the last three months of standing in front of the farmers market and looking over my shoulder at the garage would clearly indicate it's under-utilized and not enough action is being taken by the city to ensure it is welcome probably utilized.

I have been here since I was a boy in Scottsdale. People complaining about parking is from the '60s and '70s. They are complaining about not being able to park in front of the building directly in front of where they want to patronize. We need to do a better job of doing a better job of telling people where they can park. I have seen some places show a QR code where the public restrooms are. Why doesn't the city have better signs showing people where parking is? Thank you, Mayor.

Mayor Borowsky: Thank you very much. And you will go ahead and talk about your next comments, is that right, Steve?

Steve Sutton: Sure. In regards to the task force...

Mayor Borowsky: Let's wait until we get there.

Steve Sutton: I prefer to speak after that.

Mayor Borowsky: Thank you so much. Finally, Carmen Fallen. If you wouldn't mind going over to that one. I should have pointed that out to the other speakers earlier. Thank you.

[Time: 01:32:54]

Carmen Fallen: Hello, everybody, my name is Carmen Fallen. I was born and raised here in Scottsdale, Arizona. Mayor, thank you. Council, thank you for giving me the time to speak. I am here to speak about the proposed parking garage that would force relocation of the Old Town farmers market. The Old Town Scottsdale farmers market is more than just a weekend event. It's a part of the culture, history and heartbeat of this neighborhood. Keeping it where it is matters, because this space represents community, tradition, and connection. And any downtown city, you expect to walk a few blocks. That's part of the beauty. Downtowns are meant for walking, sightseeing and discovering the businesses that surround you. This is what makes our market's location so special. It sits at the heart of the historic small businesses, inviting people to explore, connect, and experience the city as it was meant to be experienced. Building a parking garage here is not sensible.

It's the beginning of new development which erases the historic part of our city. Once spaces like this are gone, they cannot be truly replaced. This market brings people together in ways that other places don't. It supports local farmers, artisans, small business owners by providing direct face-to-face connections with customers. It offers families a healthy outing and a place for parents to bring their children and pets and a welcoming environment for people who want to experience Old Town as it's always been. Loved by residents and farmer's alike, this is a true community staple and it deserves to be preserved as is, where it is. Thank you.

Mayor Borowsky: Thank you, Carmen. So, we're going to move on to the task force conversation.

Mayor Borowsky: Okay. Sorry about that. Did I overlook you? My apologies. Patty Badenoch and Yvonne Cahill and Crystal Carroll.

[Time: 01:35:15]

Patty Badenoch: Good evening, Mayor and Council, 40-year resident. So, build or not to build the Brown garage. Several months ago, I visited and kept a list of the shops and made copies of their no to the garage. Update just finished a second visit and added a few more that I had missed. Here is a copy of what I call hot historic Old Town acronym, shops including names, addresses, emails, phone numbers and no is still their answer. Steve Sutton collected around over 3,000 signatures from the citizens would professed no as their answer, as I went around to the holiday parties over Christmas, it was an easy sell as well. Could have, would have gotten numerous signatures but in the spirit of the occasion, I refrained.

Conclusion, like the Axon referendum fiasco. This City Council body major city does not represent the merchants or the citizens of Scottsdale, period. Moving the farmers market does not support the historic Old Town either.

Further and finally bringing them back to an enclosed parking garage to the preferred open air market garage which was ideal of selling produce of fruits and vegetables does not even remotely represent an ideal improvement. And then I wrote after listening to Mr. Lee, that you can't have a dismiss the western effect that can be bring a confusing architect to really support and honor and represent the historic Old Town of which we cherish and wish to keep. Thank you.

Mayor Borowsky: Thank you, Patty and sorry about the oversight there. Next we have Yvonne Cahill and finally, Crystal Carroll.

[Time: 01:37:37]

Yvonne Cahill: Good evening, Council, Mayor Borowsky, my name is Yvonne Cahill, address is on record. I would like to talk about a couple of things tonight and one the questions I have is do we need more parking in Old Town or do we need more people in Old Town? Is the parking utilized? Well, we know it's not being utilized to its fullest content. I have never had a problem parking in Old Town, and I go there a lot. And I'm very disappointed that the Council shut down the most productive presentation we had tonight over a supposed RFP which is not even being discussed. You didn't even discuss any money. He wasn't discussing hire me. He was giving a solution and you guys shut him down. Shame on you.

And I want to tell the merchants here...I want to tell every Old Town merchant here, I hope you contact Mr. Chris Mielke after this meeting, get his number and you can contact him direct. There's nothing the Council can do as a resident to stop you from going direct to him to learn about solutions.

The other thing is when I was on staff here the Mayor asked me to ask the staff if she could have a list of downtown merchants so she could start communicating with them. And you know what I got back? I got back, we don't have a list. You don't have a list of downtown merchants. You run the licensing department. How do you have the list of merchants? So, what is it, you did not have it or you did not want to give it to the Mayor? I have personally experienced staff members telling me that Greg Caton is telling staff members that he's not able to work with the Mayor or her staff and that's disgusting.

The other thing I want to say is we need creative solutions. We need to get into the new era, when the parking garage study was done, it was 2015. Uber was just starting. You guys have no idea. There's no data on how much Uber drops off, a Waymo drops off the people. You need to find safe areas in Old Town for these ride companies to drop people off. Right now, it's dangerous and when they stop to drop somebody off, there's traffic backed up. So, I think that's really something you need to work for. I'm really glad that you are trying to form a task force, and I hope you are not undermined on that too.

As far as the marketing, I was just so disappointed. You have a marketing a professional marketing company that goes through the process of their RFP, they come and present, and you shut them down because you want a cheaper solution. I managed a marketing budget of \$250,000, a quarter for a Fortune 50 company and I will tell you creativity costs money. If you don't want to pay for it, you will get the same old crap as you had before. Thank you.

Mayor Borowsky: Thank you, Yvonne. Crystal Carroll.

[Time: 01:41:09]

Crystal Carroll: My name is Crystal Carroll. I'm an owner of a cafe in Old Town at 7077 E. Fifth, Simply Shroom Cafe, we have been open since August of 2024, and I think we have a couple of issues here that are major issues. I of anybody would like, if anybody is going to be for a parking garage, it would be me because I need customers to come in, get their product and park and leave. I don't think the solution is to fix it with money. We need to do adequate studies for the existing parking garages. Council, listen up! I'm in Old Town every day. People do not know about the four how many ever garages. There's no signage before you go and spend money, what \$20 million for 200 parking spaces, which is ludicrous! If you operated a small business like that, would you go bankrupt, FYI. Okay?

We need to start standing up for Scottsdale, guys and not letting a couple people on our up here that obviously there's other incentives going on behind the scenes. I'm livid sitting here listening to this. We need to know if those parking garages are being utilized. And the only way to know that is to do what Chris is talking about. If you don't want to use Chris, use somebody else. I didn't know about the parking. I'm there every day. And I don't know about all the parking that exists. My employees didn't know. I guarantee a bunch of business owners don't know. We need signage. I'm disappointed in you. I'm disappointed that you would stop Chris from speaking. We need education. This was nothing else about educating us on our parking situation. Shame on you and anybody else over there who doesn't want to educate the public. Okay? Thank you.

We used to have a trolley that ran through town. The trolley needs to come back. It is about the feeling. We want the trolley back. And I guarantee if you talk to any small business down there, they want it. Let's bring that back.

Another issue is sorry, guys, I just did notes. I don't understand where our marketing budget has gone. They say that we spend millions of dollars on marketing, I don't see it as a small business. I feel like we need better marketing for Old Town. Listen, guys, if we don't actually address the solution a solution, instead of a Band-Aid which that is what this \$20 million cement block is, if we don't address the problem in Scottsdale, we will no longer be Old Town. We will be ghost town. Okay? And that's not what I want. So, as somebody would loves Scottsdale, I hope that you guys at least listen to what people want and just use common sense. Thanks.

Mayor Borowsky: Thank you, Crystal.

Vice Mayor Kwasman: Madam Mayor.

Mayor Borowsky: If you wouldn't mind holding your thoughts there Adam and as is always the case, if someone is directly spoken to, or about on the Council by a speaker, you have the opportunity to make a statement. And I just want to thank Crystal for speaking and I was the one, remember, that told you about the parking garage across from your business a year after you opened. So, I'm glad you know

where it is now. Thank you. Go ahead, Vice Mayor Kwasman.

[Time: 01:45:13]

Vice Mayor Kwasman: Thank you, Madam Mayor. I want to reiterate that my concerns with Mr. Mielke are not of a political nature. They are not of a disagreement at all about knowledge of parking availability in Scottsdale. I think there's a lot to be done. I actually agree with everything he said up there. There's nothing I disagree with. The difference is, is that we have very specific rules in the city of Scottsdale and when it comes to any potential contractual relationship with the city of Scottsdale, and any potential vendor, we have to be very careful or else we expose the city to seven figure lawsuits, right? So it's my job as a fiduciary of the city of Scottsdale to do what I can to protect the city, even when it's with somebody who I care about deeply on a personal level and I see him every week. I don't know how to explain it any differently without breaching the admonition Mr. City Attorney breaching the admonition of the Executive Session. Can you help with my reasoning without me breaking accidentally breaking admonition?

Mayor Borowsky: I'm sorry, I'm going to interrupt. You had the opportunity to address the speaker and can we just...

Vice Mayor Kwasman: I wanted to make sure that I did not break admonition.

Luis Santaella: You did not.

Mayor Borowsky: Thank you, Vice Mayor Kwasman and thank you to all the speakers. I think it's important to fill in the gaps here. We resumed into Executive Session because of a point of order that Vice Mayor Kwasman made and it was well taken. I just want to explain to the public, and all of you for being here, thank first of all, thank you for being here. So, this was a Special Meeting I called. I should know that as such, I might be under much higher level of scrutiny with some of my colleagues here, but we do go through the process in scheduling this meeting. We were very thorough. Our City Attorney, we worked with our City Manager, we worked with our City Clerk to they knew who the speakers were. They knew that Mr. Mielke was exactly what he was going to speak on. They knew he had spoken to us here before. He's actually talked about this exact same content previously before this Council. So, to have this big uproar now is disappointing because everyone knew what we were talking about tonight.

The agenda was published, and was disseminated but out of an abundance of caution, I am well received the comment from Vice Mayor and given the confusion, I want to apologize to Mr. Mielke for putting you in that position and we'll have, I'm sure, plenty of dialogue after all that and also apologize to my colleagues who appear to be caught off guard by that, even though, again Mr. Mielke has been here before and spoke to us. And parking solutions are on the agenda as number three to discuss agendizing that in the future. We'll see how that goes.

In any event, I wanted to fill in the blanks for the public so that you are not left wondering what the heck is going on. So, moving right along to, oh, there's some speakers. City Clerk would like to say something.

Ben Lane: Mayor, Rosemary Preisel would like to speak on item 1A, rather than item 3.

Mayor Borowsky: Okay, why don't we have her speak. Sorry, I must have missed you communicating that earlier. Thank you.

[Time: 01:49:16]

Rosemary Preisel: Sorry about that. I wasn't sure what category I should be in. So, I have a totally different subject that has to do with the parking garage. We talk about the pride of Scottsdale and my landlord, who is here tonight, has spent a lot of money on the Kiva center and I have been on Fifth Avenue for thirty years. I open the business on Fifth Avenue and the parking garage on Third Avenue which was not even mentioned tonight. So maybe there isn't enough signage for that. I was here when it was built. And it's a very busy garage. And my concern is that it's very dirty. The elevators do not work. They have not worked for two years. I have had clients that have knee problems. I've had pregnant women who cannot do the stairs and I'm just asking for them to be cleaned and the elevators to be working order and maybe a paint job. The stairs are dirty. There's gum. There's throw up. It's just disgusting. The trash bins are right outside of Third Avenue, and they do get cleaned. They get dumped every day but it's awful around there. It's unacceptable.

Old Town people come from all over the country to come visit Old Town and from Third Avenue to Chop Shop is a main thoroughfare. It's not a back alley. It's a main walk area and it is very disgusting. So, I'm just asking for it to be cleaned and beautified. The lighting also in the garage is not working. So that's kind of dangerous. And they did a great job before COVID to do the monitoring of the three-hour parking. I would like the three-hour parking. I would like to see with what's coming up with the ballpark and Phoenix Open, and all the tourism we have coming the three-hour parking is very beneficial if you could instill that again, that would help a lot because otherwise we end up having employees park there and not the tourists and not our clients. So that's all I'm asking for.

Mayor Borowsky: Thank you very much, Rosemary. Thank you for bringing that to our attention and reminding us about those items. Councilwoman Whitehead.

[Time: 01:51:51]

Councilwoman Whitehead: Thank you Mayor. I want to thank the Mayor to having this meeting and all of you for being here and speaking. And I want to do a special thanks to Joan for the history. Actually, what I want to do is fill in some more modern history because serving on my eighth year, it's gone fast, on this City Council and I spent the first six, especially, working on all the issues you brought up tonight and that's the preservation of Old Town. I want to fill in where we are and what's already done.

As we move forward, we want to build on what's already been done and move forward, not you know, not start over. So, in 2019 for the first time in 19 years, we put bonds out to the voters and they passed and that's where we have the Civic Center Plaza that's been redone and is incredible. I cannot believe the number of people that use Civic Center Plaza today as opposed to prior to that projecting finished.

I really had questions whether we needed to do that, but I was wrong and the city experts were right and great job.

Then in 2020, I spent an enormous amount of time with my colleagues working on a General Plan, General Plan 2035, thousands of hours of Council, staff, resident input, and that was overwhelmingly approved by and ratified by our voters. What does that tell you? It tells you that the Council was aligned with the community and that's how we got it passed. And that should not be taken for granted. It was the first time in 20 years. It was ten years late, but we got the job done. In that plan, we referenced pretty much all the things you guys mentioned tonight. We referenced Old Town specifically. I think I wrote some of the in the vision statement, we say "Scottsdale will respect and be sensitive to our history and legacy found in the heart of Old Town." And again, and again, we reference the need to protect Old Town. So that is a guiding document.

[Time: 01:54:28]

But while we were working on finalizing the General Plan and sending it to the voters, we were working on more the action document. And that's the Old Town area the Old Town Character Area Plan. And this is really important, and this is the part that we don't want to redo with a task force. We want to build on. And I just want to say that what has made Scottsdale a world-class city is Council's move they use what was done in the past to move forward and sometimes when the past Councils make a mistake, we're not there to berate them, we're there to make some corrections. So, the Old Town Area Character Plan is a great example. In 2018, a version was passed that said boldly looking to its metropolitan future. So, and that came with an awful lot of 150-foot buildings. And really what we found in 2022 and with a lot of community input and with our own opinions personally, myself and most of the us on Council, was that wasn't the vision we wanted for Old Town. So, the 2022 let me make sure I got the years right. I think we passed it in February '23. We passed a new revised Old Town plan that substantially reduced heights.

So, the heights that you see getting built today those were projects that were approved prior to the new plan. You will not see you will not see more 150-foot buildings being built. What else did we do? We made a requirement for public open space. Some of the people mentioned, we want people walking. You expect to walk in Old Town. You expect to walk in a downtown. So, we have required pedestrian access. We required public open space. We required more robust landscaping. We also required quality development, quality development standards that preserved our western heritage. So, the way government works is we do a whole lot of things for you, but you don't see the results for a few years.

So I just want to make sure that everybody is up to date with what Councils have done to get us for moving forward into this the direction that you all want which is preserving the character that makes us a world-class destination, but taking advantage of technologies or ways of doing things more efficiently and better to save money and make our experience here in Scottsdale better.

So, on the parking, I want to mention that since 2021, so we had a lot of successes on my watch that I'm really proud of, but one of the failures is the parking study. Since 2021, I have been pushing for a parking

study which was denied and if it was approved in 2021, it wouldn't have cost that much money and we wouldn't be here debating today. This is about do we need parking or do we not? I don't know. It's about the financial responsibility we have to using the dollars you guys provide through taxes responsibly. And we have to do that with accurate data. So, I absolutely support the need for a parking study. I have all along.

I also want to talk about that marketing contract. For ten years, we have had an outside marketing company, a very good one that has helped make our downtown more vibrant. I mean, I have been here for 30 years. I remember bringing people downtown and there was nobody around. Boy, that's not true anymore. It just makes me proud. I'm at the waterfront. Sometimes at 6:30 in the morning, on Saturdays, it's vibrant, runners everywhere. Every time of the day, the concerts that Gerd has been bringing in. I mean, we are a vibrant downtown and we didn't do that alone and we should not reverse that which is working.

[Time: 01:59:12]

So, I really next week, I'm gonna be asking my colleagues to go ahead and bring back the agenda item to consider a local 21-year business that went through our RFP process only to be denied a contract for reasons that didn't even match what we were supposed to be voting on. So, a little plug for that.

And I do want to also talk about the farmers market. And I want to thank the Mayor and Councilwoman Maryann McAllen because the three of us were really proactive on that, parking garage, no parking garage, that's not really relevant here. That farmers market has moved several times and we wanted to solve a couple of problems and I'm really excited about the new location, which is also in Old Town, just right here by City Hall. We solved a couple of problems. One is the farmers market was landlocked and now it has room to grow, and they have been turning down vendors and that's not a good thing. We want it to grow. And to be honest, it's not greatest location if you buy some of the delicious pastries and coffee for sitting around because it's an asphalt parking lot. We have grass. We have benches. It's beautiful. Kids can run around and play while their parents are shopping.

Right now, the vendors have to put the pop-up tents and generators. That will go away because what we're doing is we're providing shade through our solar parking lot covers and electricity. So, no more generators and there will be ample parking for the we're being very efficient with our parking. We have ample parking for the vendors underground. That's where staff parks. But guess what, staff doesn't work on Saturday mornings. And our city staff have agreed to move all the city trucks underground Fridays so that there's you know, no problems with parking for the people who want to now come and shop. And I'm told a club is also going to have a bike valet so we'll see if this happens where people can bike to the farmers market, leave their bikes safely and then shop. And they can coordinate functions with Saturday morning farmers market. I'm very enthusiastic about that and I consider it a separate subject.

But I can tell you the value of this community from the get go and Joan mentioned this in her talk is the fact that people choose Scottsdale and by God, they get involved. And it's your voices that have always made Scottsdale better and we are certainly the best city I have ever lived in in the country. We will

keep it that way. So, thank you for being here and thank you for the time.

Mayor Borowsky: Thank you very much. Maryann, sorry, Councilwoman McAllen. You're up.

[Time: 02:02:07]

Councilwoman McAllen: Thank you, Mayor. Thank you, Councilwoman Whitehead. I agree with many of the things you said. It's really important, especially if you are a Scottsdale resident. I have been a Scottsdale resident 61 years, my entire life, minus six months to know the history. When I grow up, I want to be Joan Fudala. And everybody has many different points of why they love Scottsdale, but one of the things that also Vice Mayor Kwasman said is that up here, we're creating ordinances, we are following rules. There are things we have to live by on Council. One of them is the General Plan, which overwhelmingly passed by the citizens of Scottsdale. This is our directive in it, all of these points talk about Old Town, every single one of these talks about Old Town. We have a direction from the citizens on what you want for Old Town. We need to follow it. We voted on it.

I have been reviewing it and reviewing it based on things that people said, even Tom Silverman who got up and spoke and former City Councilman and lifelong resident and the family and the business. And he said, use your General Plan. It's not yours. It's our General Plan. It's the city's. And I just want to remind everyone that this is a guiding document that tells us what the citizens voted for and what they want. Yes, it can change. And that's the other half of our leadership is to listen to what you say. A lot of information goes out because people become passionate and information is not always accurate. We need to make sure that we're making decisions based on the best and most recent accurate figures and facts. I would support a parking study. I didn't in the past. I do believe we need the parking structure on Brown. I will say that. We already invested. It will go up much faster because of how much we invested in it. The farmers market is going to move. They signed the contract. They are happy to move. They will be able to grow and we are helping them grow.

So, there's a lot of things changing in Old Town but what is not changing is the interest by all of you, by us to make sure that we're doing right by our businesses and that we are getting those tourists and we need to invest in them. I was very disappointed that we did not have the contract by the James Agency. We have a brand-new Economic Development Director. He's out there. I'm waving him. We have not met formally, I recognize his face from his picture. We have someone who will help captain this ship. And work towards what you're asking. So, I'm encouraged. I would support a parking study, and I'm very interested in us following the General Plan. Those are my comments.

Mayor Borowsky: Thank you, Councilwoman McAllen. Thank you, Councilwoman Whitehead, for the kind words. But for the record, I do not want the farmers market to relocate. I want them to stay right where they are and I know you have all heard me say that before but I just didn't want there to be any confusion. But having said that, I did support if they had to move to relocate them to a reasonable alternative. So just for clarity.

All right, moving right along, I think that's everything. Did I miss anybody that wanted to say anything?

No? All right.

ITEM 2

[Time: 02:06:21]

Next, we have the downtown item number two, the creation of a Downtown Task Force. We've touched on that. I think there's overwhelming input and support to contribute to ideas in Old Town and downtown. And it would be great to harness that in the format of a task force and I think a great plan for that would be to have each Councilmember appoint two individuals from that do business or are stakeholders in Old Town downtown area and then have a Chair as well. So, 15 members in total.

And so I'm going to read the agenda item as stated this item asks the majority of Scottsdale City Council to adopt Resolution 13583 forming a Downtown Task Force to provide recommendations on improving the Downtown Character Area Plan and the downtown marketing effort directing the City Manager to provide support for that task force and providing for the dissolution as well of the task force upon completion of the goals. And I'm going to motion to approve that but before we do, we have some public comments before I do that, I should say. We have public comments on this item. So, starting with Steve Sutton, then I have Dan Ishac and Tommy Plato.

Steve Sutton: Mayor Borowsky, I mentioned I had two things I was going to combine. I actually realized it may be better to combine the second item with the task force item. And I'll, we'll go through it as fast as I possible can. With regards to the task force, the person appointed to the task force, should be carefully vetted to ensure it doesn't include people that support building a garage at the parking corral. The majority should be current owners operating brick and mortar businesses. Former business owners in Old Town no longer have any skin in the game and should not be on this task force. If this task force is primarily staffed with known donors to the political campaigns of Councilmembers, the public will know the fix is in.

Now, since October, I circulated a petition which has gone before 3,220 residents. 99% of the residents I speak to not want you to build this garage. I have a petition I started last week among business owners and just business owners down in Old Town. I keep hearing people say that oh, the business owners want this garage. Yeah, some of them do. I met one tonight would is very vehemently vocal about that. But yet my petition shows that of the 32 I have pardon me, the 33 I talked to 28 absolutely do not want this garage built. They want the farmers market to stay there. They benefit financially from having the farmers market there. Using a bigger hammer instead of a skillful use and appropriate hammer often results in damage to whatever is being around it being hammered. Building a new, bigger garage, versus management tools is not going to solve the problems of business owners in Old Town. Building a new bigger garage will damage the ambience and character of historic Old Town and that attracts customers to businesses.

No matter what garage the garage contractor promises in the form of mitigation, the months of construction will financially harm businesses. The moving of the farmers market to the City Hall parking

lot will financially harm many brick and mortar businesses. That price is too high to justify building a 15 to \$20 million at most, 183-parking space garage in front of Scottsdale's most historic building.

Now in regards to the farmers market, what Councilwoman Solange Whitehead just said is not true. I spoke to the managers the farmers market since May. They don't want to go here. You all but took them in the back room and beat them with rubber hoses. That lot is logistically terrible for them. It's 1,500 feet away from the customers they share with the whole town. People are not going to be seeing that, people who come to visit Scottsdale stumble upon the farmers market on Saturdays. I speak to these managers and owners of the farmers market every Saturday. They do not want to go to this location.

Your shade structure you are bragging about is going to cause a problem in that you are covering half of the parking lot and nobody who cooks in the farmers market will be allowed to be under it. You have two vehicle entrances instead of four. That an ideal location. They can approach setup from multiple directions. You created a narrow I-shaped trap for them and they don't want to go there. And if anybody says otherwise, they are not really talking to the owners I will assure you, residents are going to remember anybody who moves this farmers market and builds this garage. They are absolutely remember this. This is a very simple to understand issue and this will be in the minds of voters, I guarantee it right up to November.

[Time: 02:11:50]

Mayor Borowsky: Thank you, Steve. Did you have another comment that you wanted to talk about.

Steve Sutton: That was item number three. I can talk about that right now.

Mayor Borowsky: Can you do it in one minute.

Steve Sutton: One minute. I don't need you to agendize immediately is what you should have done in February of 2020 after the 2019 Bond issue. The Bond issue which nobody voted to build a garage. Question two was not specifying building a garage. That was an option. It included modifying parking structures. It was not specified that a parking garage was to be built. I think we finally convinced certain people that we are smarter than that. You need to agendize what should have been agendized six years ago. You need to do a parking study and figure out what is really going on down there until you spend 15 to \$20 million on a ridiculously small amount of parking spaces for a garage that I look at every Saturday which is only 90% occupancy on two Saturdays since October.

We will hold you accountable. You need to wake up and realize I don't care what your General Plan says. Today is today and we are going to hold you accountable.

Mayor Borowsky: Thank you, Steve. All right, Dan Ishac.

[Time: 02:13:24]

Dan Ishac: Dan Ishac, address on record. I'm here to speak in support of the concept of the downtown task force. If any of you visited Palm Springs 20, 25 years ago, you saw what happened when business owners and residents were not listened to and you saw Palm Springs become a row of empty storefronts and you were lucky to buy either a T-shirt or a refrigerator magnet. The city rightfully got out of the way and allowed businesses to thrive. I'm hoping some of the recommendations of this task force do that.

I do not know about running a single proprietor commercial enterprise, but I know a lot about task forces and committees. I have some concerns about the proposed structure. 15 is neither nimble nor efficient and I think the Council should actually rethink the size and separate the task force to be a steering committee of seven people or eight and then have an input, an advisory group whether it be through focus groups or solicitation of surveys that would allow a much broader input from residents and business owners. I think that would serve the city much better than an unwieldily 15-person task force.

Secondly, I have concerns about the requirements of who is on this. I think you're unnecessarily precluding this with significant experience, expertise and success in revitalizing a commercial district because they might not currently own a business or haven't owned a business specifically in Scottsdale. There are a whole lot of people that can provide significant expertise in this area.

And then lastly, to Vice Mayor Kwasman's concern about violating rules of order, ethics and so forth, I hope he has the same zeal in precluding people from participating on an advisory task force that would have a potential conflict of interest or self-dealing because they own a business that would directly be impacted by the recommendations to the Council. Those are my thoughts.

I do want to address something that Councilwoman Whitehead said. I think she was a bit revisionist in her portrayal of the farmers market. The farmers market did not come to City Council and say we want to move. They were forced to move. And I am glad that there's a landing spot for them but to recast it as something that they wanted is false. And if we weren't building an unnecessary parking garage, they would not have been forced to move. Thank you.

Mayor Borowsky: Thank you, Dan. Appreciate that. Tommy Plato. You are next. Thank you and last.

[Time: 02:16:21]

Tommy Plato: Is there any way to get that to show whatever I put under it. Thank you. My name is Tommy Plato. Thank you for having me and thank you to everyone who spoke tonight. I live in Old Town. I own a restaurant in Old Town, and I own property in Old Town. And I'm in support of creating a task force to have a voice between the citizens and the Councilmembers. I think it is a great idea. I put my name in the hat to be a part of that, just because this is my home and it's a neighborhood. I think people kind of forget that. We have a neighborhood, obviously everybody in this room cares about

Scottsdale. I care about it. And I think we need to be smart about how we go. We will lose our identity.

We don't need to be, you know, 1940s west, but we need to carry that in our spirit, and I think we need to be conscious about how we develop. I'm pro-growth but I'm anti getting too dense becoming a homogenized downtown like every other city. When you go to New York, when you go to Miami, when you go to Austin, they all look the same and you get anxiety. I think Scottsdale has a relaxing vibe. I think you can ride your bike from the green belt up to McDowell Mountain Ranch and you can go from the canal to downtown Tempe. That's the spirit that people get. The parking garage will be a contentious issue, but you can't miss the bigger picture. My restaurant is in the heart of what I consider the heart, and I will put it up on the screen here and it touches every artery of what downtown is. And we made that this map, the business owners in this area because where I'm at is six acres slated for development by David Sellers of LGE and I know David, and there's people that come into my restaurant, all of these people. I'm pro doing smart things. But also, you're going to gut the spirit of the arts district too at the same time. And people don't understand, you get caught up in a parking garage when six acres will get torn down and I'm affected by it, but I will adapt just like everybody else. We have to adapt sometimes and that's okay. I think change is inevitable, but you have to be smart in it. There's leather artists in town and blacksmiths and Mike Majory lives in town, he's like the best western artist in the world. He's a Scottsdale resident. So, bringing the community together.

The farmers market is great. I love the farmers market. I'm it was more political than this government is, I swear to got. Getting in there is hard. I think it should be in a larger space. I'm not aware of everything that's gone in the past year. You have been to San Luis Obispo on a Thursday night? It's such a cooler vibe than any farmers market in the world and we have the Main Street to do it which has been a ghost town in the last ten years, in my opinion. So, there are ways to be creative and think outside the box and not get hung up. We all get emotional. We love the city but I think having people that are a part of it on the task force will be a good thing and maybe we can communicate with you guys and meet in the middle somewhere. Thank you, guys.

Mayor Borowsky: Thank you, Tommy. And Tommy, you forgot to say the name of your restaurant. It's amazing! It's The Ends, I know.

[Time: 02:19:48]

Tommy Plato: It's The Ends. I'm not here to promote. It stands for the energy never dies and it's all about community and it's about connection. And I think if you build something for locals, the tourists will come. My restaurant is not for people that are tourists or the bikers on the things and the drunks out there. My restaurant is for the people that live here, and I want to meet you and know you and this is a neighborhood at the end of the day. I know everybody that lives in the waterfront. I'm down here every day riding my bike. It's an amazing place to live and we can do the wrong thing and turn it into every other city or we can be smart about it. I think we need to think about these things.

Mayor Borowsky: Thank you, Tommy for being here, appreciate it. That concludes the speakers on item number two, and I'm going to make a motion to approve the Resolution, 13583. That's my motion, go

ahead.

[Time: 02:20:48]

Councilwoman McAllen: I'm not going to second it because I would like to amend it. I would like to amend a motion to make it the half the size. I agree with Mr. Ishac, we don't do that often, but to make it smaller is, and I would like I was contacted by a woman in Old Town. She's like I invested in living in Old Town because I love Old Town, we should be included in we live in Old Town. I think the possibility of having a member appointed that actually lives in Old Town is very important. So, I would amend the motion to accept it but half the size. Not 15, make it seven. One appointment from each person.

Mayor Borowsky: I'm happy to amend it, because really, I think that's a fair point. And I didn't hear a second for mine. I'm happy to amend a motion to have each Councilmember make an appointment, based on their own judgment of who would be the best fit for the task force as a starting point. That's my motion. Do you want to second that, Councilwoman McAllen.

Councilwoman McAllen: Second.

Mayor Borowsky: Sorry, do I need to finesse that a little bit better?

Luis Santaella: I wanted to confirm is the motion that's on the table one that not own reduces the size, but there's 15 so that would be 7.5. We reduce it to seven, and are we expanding the qualifications to be former business owners and residents?

Councilwoman McAllen: I would like to add residents. So, they are not precluded from being a member of the task force. They don't have to be a business owner. They can live in Old Town. They could be so I think that's very important.

Luis Santaella: Okay. Just clarifying what the vote is for.

Mayor Borowsky: Yes, I'm happy to make that revision to the motion as well. Councilwoman Whitehead.

Councilwoman Whitehead: Yeah, thank you, Mayor. I want to speak to this task force and part of the reason I gave the history is the way the task force is described now, undoes voter approved the General Plan and community input on the Character Area Plan. So again, my caution is I'm not going to support something that undoes thousands of hours and resident voices that got us to where we are today, but I see plenty of work that needs to be done. Some of it I think does need a fast being force, some of it does not. I think we need a parking study and a marketing contract. That doesn't require a task force. What I'm looking for is more time to design, like, do we want a task force that discusses maintenance because again, the city has been good at building things but I agree with whoever spoke about the situation in our current parking garages. And I'm constantly dealing with complaints from merchants when trees die and not replaced. I'm interested in a task force to talk about the nuts and bolts of keeping up our city but not just opening up literally four years of work and voter-approved documents.

So, I don't think we can make those changes to a task force today on the dais but I think it's important that we find a path to do that, we have increased. We have these monthly breakfasts. We are looking for ways to get more input and listen to your voices.

But, again, I think the way this task force is described today is too broad, too much work on the staff and it undoes all the residents that did the work over the last four years. We need to find a way to narrow that down. I like the seven-member idea, and I would support something in the future but I'm not going to support this right now the way it's stated, but I'm glad we're having this discussion. This is important. So, thank you.

Mayor Borowsky: Councilwoman Dubauskas.

[Time: 02:25:26]

Councilwoman Dubauskas: Thank you, Madam Mayor. I wanted to elaborate a little bit on what Councilwoman Whitehead said. Over the course of the last year, we have had a lot of conversations about Old Town, and it's a focus, I think for all of us. We realize that Old Town is a gem. Old Town is special. Old Town's unique charm brings in what brings so many people here. The first picture you see of Scottsdale is typically a picture of Old Town. That's what people think of. They don't necessarily think that Scottsdale goes all the way up to Cave Creek, that we were 31 miles long. A lot of people think of Scottsdale as Old Town. Many of us have been working on this over the course of the last year.

I thought I would highlight some of the things that we have done and then also Councilwoman Whitehead started to address some of the things we are looking to do to listen to residents as well. So, over the course of the last year, the City Manager dedicated \$40 million to capital projects. Not only parking garages, \$7 million to roads and alleys in Old Town, streetscape beautification, \$2 million. There is design work on Second Street. There's sewer improvements. We've got monument signs going in on Fifth Avenue and a Main Street streetscape. So really working on beautification of Old Town and taking that very, very seriously. There's also utility box art installation that we are working through, as well as the Old Town marketing that has been mentioned. That's something that you know when I talked to my friends up in north Scottsdale, and I said to my girlfriend, I said I'm going to Canal Convergence. She says what is Canal Convergence? We haven't done the job to reach our own residents about all the amazing things we have in Scottsdale. That's a big focus for us is this Old Town marketing.

We put \$125,000 into the Gallery Association. They asked for 125. The Tourism Commission said 75 and Council overrode them and we said, no, we will do \$125,000 because we want to make sure that we are giving our partners the opportunity to invest in their marketing plans. And then something that hasn't been talked about is key tonight is our City Manager identified the need for someone to be going down and talking to the merchants. Someone who is boots on the ground. So, the example of the parking garage that needs to be cleaned and the trash that needs to be picked up, who are the merchants? What are your needs? How can we help you on the day-to-day basis. That individual is starting on January 26th. We will have someone whose full-time job is to walk around and talk with all the merchants in Old Town. I hope that they will. I don't know what the plan is. I think one by one, you

should expect to see the individual out walking around Old Town and meeting with you.

We are working on a noise ordinance because that's an issue that has come up in some of the areas. We have a lot of noise and that affects the residents. So that you will be seeing in February.

We have a contract with Scottsdale Arts that is being worked on but also part of that we are planning on investing in the building itself. You will see some upgrades to the theaters, the stage two remodel and the camera security system, the handrails, SMOCA will have updated lighting, and you will see some really neat things over the course of the next year.

Councilman Graham asked for a review of the Old Town Tourism plan, that will be happening in February. We are working on the Strategic Plan for tourism in 2026, as well as the Economic Development Plan. One the things that our City Manager realized is tourism and economic development in Scottsdale goes hand in hand. We bring in 11 million people every single year to the city of Scottsdale with a \$3 billion economic impact. Now we have a new Executive Director of Tourism and Economic Development who will be looking at those things together, thinking not only how can we bring tourists in, but how does that affect our city and maybe what do we need to be doing in the economic development realm that can help with tourism. Tourism pays for 25% of our taxes in this city. It's a wonderful benefit to our residents. We are thinking about tourism in a whole new way, which is really exciting.

So, I wanted to highlight those things. And I also wanted to thank Councilwoman Whitehead for mentioning the work that has been done over the course of the years. As recently as 2024, there were changes made to the Character Area Plan. So, we have been doing a lot of work. We have a lot of work that's in process but also, we now have someone who is going to be reaching out to you specifically. So, I think it's important to continue communicating but also to give this work an opportunity, an opportunity to succeed and then see what else needs to be done. So that we can have so we can all be successful.

But I want, you to know that we genuinely care, we are genuinely working on improving Old Town in a way that honors our historic heritage, but also, you know, really helps the merchants and brings high-quality visitors to our area, but also in a way that our residents are going to be really proud of. We want to bring north Scottsdale residents, Paradise Valley residents into Old Town, to Tommy Plato's restaurant. We want everyone to enjoy Old Town and our western heritage. Thank you.

Mayor Borowsky: Thank you. Councilwoman Littlefield.

[Time: 02:31:25]

Councilwoman Littlefield: Thank you, Mayor. I'd just like to say, I do not believe that another task force creation is necessary right now. I think that would be counteractive to helping the downtown area. For all the reasons that Councilwoman Dubauskas mentioned, we're doing so much right now, another task force is just another layer of bureaucracy. We already have multiple staff members, including the City Manager working with our Council-appointed Tourism Development Commission and they are

developing the Tourism Development Strategic Plan which includes all the downtown, and we'll coordinate with the businesses and the surrounding areas in an updated, cohesive plan to cover the requirements that we in our downtown. I would like to give that a chance. I think it sounds really good, and I think we should be very active in doing it and making sure that continues and have Council get reports back on what's happening, how is it going. How it is progressing and what can we do to make it work. I would like to give that a chance first before we put a legal mandate and all that kind of stuff on it and to me, that just adds another layer of bureaucracy and slows things down. So, I'm in agreement with Councilwoman Dubauskas on this. I think we need to give that a chance first and see how it works. Thank you.

Mayor Borowsky: Thank you, Councilwoman Littlefield. I don't see further questions, and we'll take a vote on the motion but before I take a vote on the motion, but before I do. Referring to having stakeholders involved so we can hear directly from them we can hear directly from them as another level of bureaucracy surprises me, honestly and I certainly couldn't feel more different than that. I think there's an overwhelming sentiment that we are not hearing the residents we're not taking action quick enough on it.

And while it's in the works, hearing from Councilwoman Dubauskas that there's a noise ordinance being drafted is interesting news. I guess that's just coming staff driven. But I personally think the more residents involved in the process, the better. I don't think that will be a nuisance or a drain on our staff resources. I think to the contrary, we can just cut to the chase and get together and make some major improvements.

So, with that, I have heard a lot of I don't think we're going to get vote on it information, but with that, let's take a vote on the motion that's on the table. Thank you.

And that motion does not pass. So, moving right along. We have let's move right along. Thank you very much.

ITEM 3

[Time: 02:34:42]

The last item on the agenda is future action on parking solutions. This item asked the majority of the City Council to direct the City Manager to agendize an item for a future Council meeting, related to actions on downtown parking solutions. I know I heard a few comments my colleagues that a parking study would be a good idea. I think whatever the scope is, since it has not been done since 2015, I think we do need updated information. I will make a motion to agendize for a future meeting have the City Manager agendize that for a future city meeting.

Councilwoman Whitehead: I will second that motion.

Mayor Borowsky: Yes as the agenda item says, to direct the City Manager to agendize a future at a

future City Council meeting, downtown parking solutions discussion.

Councilwoman Whitehead: I second to agendize it at a future meeting, parking solutions, including a study.

[Time: 02:36:10]

Mayor Borowsky: Well, for him to bring forward ideas on how we might address the parking issues that seem to be plaguing the downtown area. And parking study is we can refine it a little bit more to update a parking study if that would make everyone comfortable. I'm happy to do that. Maybe agendize or ask the City Manager to agendize an item involving a parking study for consideration at a future Council meeting.

Councilwoman Whitehead: I definitely second that.

Mayor Borowsky: Does that add more clarity? Is there public comment on this? We're going to have public comment on this. Sorry. It's already a long night. Why don't we pause and have public comment, okay? Is that all right. Oh, city attorney, you want to talk first?

PUBLIC COMMENT

Luis Santaella: Mayor, I was going to point out that we needed to public comment.

Mayor Borowsky: Yes, thank you. That's why we have Dan Ishac. Thank you for keeping me on task. Steve Sutton, followed by Dan Ishac.

Steve Sutton: Mayor Borowsky, I did say what I wanted to say about this at my last time.

Mayor Borowsky: Thank you very much. Appreciate your input. Dan Ishac, followed by Patty Badenoch, Yvonne, Cahill, Rosemary Preisel, and French Thompson and then Tom Frankel.

[Time: 02:37:40]

Dan Ishac: Dan Ishac, address still on record. I don't understand how any elected official can claim to be using taxpayer money appropriately or with any fiscal responsibility, if they make decisions on spending enormous amounts of money without data to support the need. The Bond study did not require a new structure. For example, the money could be used to fix the Third Avenue issues that were raised at this meeting. It could be used to improve signage but the most important thing that this Council needs to do regardless of political affiliation is be good stewards of our money. That requires data. That you do not have and so to proceed without any expenditure without data is mismanagement and inappropriate. That's all I have to say.

Mayor Borowsky: Thank you so much. Patty Badenoch.

Patty Badenoch: I pass thank you.

Mayor Borowsky: Thank you, Yvonne Cahill.

[Time: 02:38:58]

Yvonne Cahill: Dan is taller than me. Yvonne Cahill, address on record. Talking about the Old Town parking garage on Brown. Again, I never had a problem parking in Old Town ever, and I go down there a lot. And I totally agree with Mr. Ishac that there needs to be a study done on the current utilization of the parking. You guys want to spend \$20 million of our money and you don't even know what the utilization is of the current parking situation. It's ridiculous.

And also, we all know that there's an RFP process. We all know that people it will be put out to bid. We all know that everybody will have an opportunity to present and to shut down a speaker who is providing a solution, just to educate us, who doesn't even talk about anything about costs or asking to participate is ridiculous. And I really am disappointed in the city attorney, and I think he just listens to the block and whatever they want, he answers in that direction.

So, for \$20 million dollars, you could buy have an app at the city an all the tourists and you will the residents of Scottsdale could have free Uber rides down to Old Town for like freaking ever. You guys are going to build you are going to waste \$20 million dollars? And you don't even know what the current situation is? I mean, I can't believe it. I mean, start thinking out of the box because \$20 million is just going to buy you a cement box which can't even ever be repurposed for anything else but a cement box. And it's going to ruin that area from its historic look. So, I just want to hopefully have Council think outside the box on that. And if you provided all the citizens and tourists with Uber passes that they could get off the app, they could go shopping for art. They could go eat in the restaurants. They could drink as much as they want. They could stay down there as long as they wanted and it wouldn't be an issue for anybody.

So please try to think about out of the box thinking and don't spend \$20 million of our money on a cement box that's going to be outdated and not utilized because you're way behind the times. Thank you.

Mayor Borowsky: Thank you. Rosemary Preitel. Oh, she's not speaking any more. French Thompson and then Tom Frenkel is the last one.

[Time: 02:42:04]

French Thompson: Good evening, Madam Mayor, City Council, you know, I have come to this City Council meeting hundreds of times. I have sat here and talked about downtown issues, and I haven't seen 99% of you people there when I'm at the City Council talking about the downtown issues. Where the hell have all of you guys been then? I mean literally, you guys are applauding on study things that you know nothing about because you have been brainwashed to believe this. Here, look it. So, you really

are. And besides that, Steve, self-important Steve Sutton over here, you know, you have decorum here. There's not supposed to be any applause and boos and hisses because then everybody goes out and does that. Why don't you guys come back to some decorum, which was Solange Whitehead was in City Councils where that's not happened. This is not public discourse or decorum. You don't do that stuff. You really don't.

I was a merchant on Main Street. I have clients who come into my store, time and time again, that literally say, they couldn't find a place to park. So, they went to Fashion Square, they went to Kierland or the Quarter. So here's another little thing. That parking garage was built when it was built, it was designed to have two more floors and they spent a lot more money to build it so you could have two more floors on it. The city has spent that money. The city has spent \$1.7 million for this garage to be designed. You guys want to have the city throw away another \$1.7 million by not having this thing built. You know what, there was also a study in 2015, a parking study that indicated there was more parking needed. Now there were not a whole lot of places they could put it. It was determined that time, and they put it on the Bond.

So, this bond was passed based on the parking study that was done back then. So, it was designed and built originally to do this, extra money spent. The city doesn't have any other property anywhere else to put in a parking garage. If you guys can show me a city, a city piece of property they can put a parking garage, additional parking, show it to me because I have been looking for a long time. I have done more research on this parking needs than you guys have. I mean, if you guys really believe this, I'm not going to change your mind. I don't really want to change your mind. I don't even want to change their mind.

I just want to bring up facts that I know are true that aren't being buffed out and say it will hurt the Catholic church. No, they have been around for 2,000 years. You won't hurt the Catholic church with a building across the street. The Catholic church owns parking structures.

Mayor Borowsky: Thank you. So, I think that's it with the oh, no, Tom Frenkel. Sorry, Tom.

[Time: 02:45:30]

Tom Frenkel: Mayor, Council, I guess the last speaker, happy new year. I'm a commercial landlord in downtown Scottsdale, primarily but probably in the vicinity of that parking structure own 15 pieces of real estate within a half mile of that parking structure, parcels on Main Street, four parcels in Civic Center park, and I guess I will start also on a wonderful note and the most recent one I'm the landlord for Pinyon Restaurant. And Pinyon Restaurant would not have been built and opened and owned by Buck and Rider. And I have watched it over the last month and a half and watched people who never knew there was a Civic Center park find that there was a Civic Center park and a AZ88 and a hidden gem.

And success to the prior Council and success to this Council, success to staff, to spite all the commotion and all the back and forth and political things do happen that are good. I guess I'm speaking primarily and in addition to the real estate, I own three restaurants, own and operate three restaurants in downtown south Scottsdale. So, I'm a very my daughter has a salon the Civic Center park. I have been

here for 40 years, and I live half a mile from that parking structure.

I have been usually on the side of being lambasted, is that a word? By activists who generally don't like that I do like growth, don't don't necessarily like change. Most recently, own the across from the schoolhouse, the parcel to the south, two or three years ago, I came with a parcel to put or a proposal to put a parking garage and a project there. And I basically had all of Old Town wanting to lynch me and I came to the conclusion, you know what, it's not wanted. I'm not doing it there, I will downsize it. That wasn't, that wasn't something that I necessarily, in my nature but I heard loud and clear.

I would like to speak practically on this parking structure, and I was involved and if I could have a couple more minutes, just I was involved in that Bond process. Was the, this area was looked at as the south side of Old Town. It was designed originally as the prior speaker says to add things. I love the farmers market, I respect the Mission. I respect the Old Town merchants. Practically to all of you there is no one that cannot like those things. If the reason is that everyone is against it because people feel it will destroy treasures and things we use, I agree with you. As a real estate developer, as a business owner as a resident, I don't see it. I lived in Civic Center park through and a half years of construction which destroyed an event venue I had on the park, Clayton on the Park, destroyed my office. It was hell! But guess what, I walked through that park now, that restaurant would have never relocated if the City Council didn't disrupt my life, many people's lives. People didn't like it. The reality is people like it and it works.

[Time: 02:49:42]

You can say the same thing about the canal projects, other things that everything is controversial at some point. Where I really disagree with the people that think it's a mistake to be there. Is this it's very hard to get money to build anything. 188 parking spaces, regardless, if there's capacity let's say it's 50% or three-quarters, the money is appropriated for it. Very hard to do. It's designed, very hard to do. I believe it's needed. I have businesses there. It's not and all respect to the traffic engineer or the systems guy, it's not digital that we have to find where the ample parking is, I don't buy that, okay. Let's give you the benefit of the doubt, it's not needed now. You put \$40 million in a park, it's the most treasured part of the city. Why? If it's not needed now and I don't believe it will kill the Mission. I don't believe it's gonna kill the farmers market. Why would you not invest in the future in that the plans are in place, and Mayor Borowsky, I have a lot of respect for you, you're the last person I would want to have to deal with what you have to deal with, but if there was a better solution, I would love to hear it. I don't think there is.

Mayor Borowsky: Excuse me. Thank you. I so appreciate everything you are saying.

Tom Frenkel: Okay.

Mayor Borowsky: And everyone has a different opinion and that should be respected. The better solution part is probably the biggest point of all. Thank you for speaking for us tonight Tom. I know you have a lot of longevity in the area and we value your input.

Tom Frenkel: Thank you.

All right. Moving right along there's a motion to agendize an updated parking study or to bring back a discussion about agendizing. Yeah. That's what the motion was. And there was a second. So, I don't see any other speakers on. This let's take a vote. All those in favor of an updated parking study and agendizing, this please indicate your vote.

All right, well, thank you very much, everyone for being here. I believe that concludes all of our business and that failed, just so you know. And that's it.

Motion to adjourn. All right. Thank you very much.

ADJOURNMENT

[Time: 02:52:27]