
This document was created from the closed caption transcript of the September 8, 2026 City Council Regular Meeting has not been checked for completeness or accuracy of content.

A copy of the agenda for this meeting, including a summary of the action taken on each agenda item, can be accessed through the City Clerk Archived Documents Search at:

<https://eservices.scottsdaleaz.gov/cityclerk/DocumentSearch>

An unedited digital video recording of the meeting, which can be used in conjunction with the transcript, is available online at:

<https://ww2.scottsdaleaz.gov/scottsdale-video-network/Council-video-archives/2026-archives>

For ease of reference, included throughout the transcript are bracketed "time stamps" [Time: 00:00:00] that correspond to digital video recording time.

For more information about this transcript, please contact the City Clerk's Office at 480-312-2411.

CALL TO ORDER

[Time: 00:00:03]

Mayor Borowsky: Good afternoon. I would like to call the September 8, 2026 City Council Regular City Council Meeting to order. Clerk Ben Lane can we have a roll call.

ROLL CALL

City Clerk Ben Lane: Thank you, Mayor. Mayor Lisa Borowsky.

Mayor Borowsky: Present.

Ben Lane: Vice Mayor Maryann McAllen.

Vice Mayor McAllen: Present.

Ben Lane: Councilmembers Jan Dubauskas.

Councilwoman Dubauskas: Here.

Ben Lane: Barry Graham.

Councilman Graham: Present.

Ben Lane: Councilmember Adam Kwasman.

Councilman Kwasman: Yo.

Ben Lane: Kathy Littlefield.

Councilwoman Littlefield: Here.

Ben Lane: And Solange Whitehead.

Councilwoman Whitehead: Here.

Ben Lane: City Manager Greg Caton.

City Manager Greg Caton: Here.

Ben Lane: City Attorney Luis Santaella.

City Attorney Luis Santaella: Here..

Ben Lane: Acting City Treasurer Anna Henthorn.

Acting City Treasurer Anna Henthorn: Here.

Ben Lane: Acting City Auditor Lai Cluff.

Acting City Auditor Lai Cluff: Here.

Ben Lane: And the Clerk is present. Thank you, Mayor.

Mayor Borowsky: Thank you. Tonight we have Scottsdale Police Sergeant Coor and Officers Shollack and Savage as well as Scottsdale Firefighters Mark Mintz and Paul Downing here if you need their assistance please let a member of our staff know. For the Pledge of Allegiance, I would like to call on Councilman Graham to lead us.

PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

[Time: 00:01:00]

Councilman Graham: It would be my pleasure, Mayor Borowsky.

I pledge allegiance to the flag of the United States of America, and to the Republic for which it stands:
One nation under God, indivisible, with liberty and justice for all.

Mayor Borowsky: Thank you. And for the invocation, Councilwoman Dubauskas.

INVOCATION

[Time: 00:01:32]

Councilwoman Dubauskas: Thank you, Madam Mayor. For the invocation, I invited our Pastor from Scottsdale Bible Church, but I don't see Pastor Ryan here. Pastor Ryan, are you here? Okay. Thank you.

We'll just take a moment here and if you would like, bow your heads with me. Father God we thank you for this wonderful city, the beautiful opportunity to serve these wonderful residents and we ask that each and every person here have an opportunity to live safely and live happily in our city. Lord, we ask that each person, as we depart at the end of this meeting drive home safely and we ask for you, for your peace and for your guidance and for your love. And we ask you to bless this beautiful city of Scottsdale. We thank you. We love you. Amen.

MAYOR'S REPORT

Mayor Borowsky: Thank you very much. Lots to report in the Mayor's Report this evening. Last week, I joined fellow Arizona Mayors and economic development leaders on a visit to Taiwan, also in attendance was Councilwoman Dubauskas, and the purpose of the visit for the Arizona delegation, which was 100 strong this time around, was to strengthen international partnerships and explore new opportunities for Scottsdale and the region overall.

As part of an Arizona Commerce Authority and GPEC, Greater Phoenix Economic Council delegation, I had the opportunity to meet with the Taiwanese Minister of Economic Affairs, the small business and small and medium-business and start-up economic I forget the title, it's called SMESA for sure. And it's the equivalent of the Small Business Administration in the U.S. Those meetings were highly informative and extremely productive. To say that Taiwan has made a commitment to Arizona is a dramatic understatement. I was unprepared for it.

We know that TSMC is a big investment in the valley, the northeast valley and we have ASM here which is part of their supply chain. I think it's a 3 point something, \$2 billion investment already. I was unprepared for the gravity, really, of what their commitment to Arizona means. They have banks that are backed by the government. They have three government-backed banks, owned banks. They

have collectively endorsed and committed \$250 million, excuse me, to investment in Arizona.

And at one meeting we met, I would say 50 business owners that are interested and being part of the push to come to Arizona, and it's almost like a shark tank, you know? All they have to do is apply to get the funding from the bank and qualify. So, they're all very eager to participate and get here. And part of TSMC, if you haven't already heard this, they're the biggest fish in Taiwan, no question about that. So, they have a lot of pull and sway in that country to where the next investment goes and they have definitely selected Arizona. But part of their requirements for suppliers, because they're such a big corporation, a big entity, a lot of them have a lot of suppliers and people who want to work with them. A lot of companies want to work with them. Their suppliers, vendors need to be within 25 minutes is the rule of a drive to their facility. I understand in Arizona from the local Taiwanese Economic Affairs Office that they are increasing that somewhat because of how widespread our city is geographically. And so, Scottsdale is an ideal location.

We were not there trying to get semiconductor or data centers, just so everybody is clear on that. We are certainly in the market to attract, for example, City Business Bank, commercial bank, their headquarters. That's one group that we talked with. And I could see that being a great fit, and another and any other suppliers that kind of fit the mold of ASM would be great additions on top of being a perfect place for executive housing, you know, staffing, restaurants, they're going to have an entire lifestyle investment here. We've already seen that. We have Din Tai Fung, even though I visited the one at Scottsdale Fashion Square and they are just so excited that we have, you know, Din Tai Fung here in Arizona.

So, stay tuned. I think there's going to be a lot to report from our visit. I was delighted to meet with the deputy Mayor of Taipei and they couldn't have all been nicer. It's a country that is genetically very nice people and very, very friendly. So, looking forward to what comes next.

And I don't see Kevin Burke in the audience. But he was fantastic in putting this together and I'm thrilled that the city of Scottsdale decided to attend and support this mission over to Taiwan for the Semicon Conference. So, lots to talk about in the future with that.

[Time: 00:07:32]

Also, this evening, I'm honored to present a proclamation recognizing September as Ovarian Cancer Awareness Month here in Scottsdale and throughout many other cities in the state and across the country. I'm especially pleased to welcome Rachel Sackett Putman, a Scottsdale resident. Is Rachel here? I will have you come up in a minute. Rachel, thank you, you're a Scottsdale resident, ovarian cancer survivor and dedicated advocate. We appreciate you sharing your story and for your advocacy to help educate our community about this serious disease. Please join me at the podium to accept the proclamation on behalf of all of those working to raise awareness and support survivors and their families. Come on up.

And WestWorld is lit up in teal, which you're wearing, which is the color for ovarian cancer. So terrific.

Thank you to WestWorld for doing that.

[Time: 00:10:03]

Rachel Sackett Putman: This is on? Is this on? All right. There we go. My name is Rachel Sackett Putman and I'm here as a proud Scottsdale resident of the past 20 years and Adopt-a-Road coordinator, former Chair of the Housing Advisory Commission and Old Town Ambassador, but most importantly as a stage 3 ovarian cancer survivor. Thank you, Mayor Borowsky and the City Council, for recognizing this ovarian cancer. Arizona is where I built my adult life, and my career and my survivorship and so receiving this proclamation from the City of Scottsdale is deeply meaningful.

Ovarian cancer is one of the deadliest cancers affected women but is most underfunded least understood. Over 21,000 women will be diagnosed in the U.S. this year and more than 12,000s will lose their lives a staggering 60% mortality rate. Most women are diagnosed in advanced stages because symptoms are vague and there's still no early detection test. For many of us that lack of awareness is the difference between catching cancer early and fighting for our lives. I was diagnosed at 38, with a rare subtype called low grade serous ovarian cancer, a chronic disease with no standard of care, an 85% recurrence rate and chronic disease.

Like many women, I lost my ability to have biological children, dreams my husband and I hadn't yet fulfilled and this year I suffered some very deep losses to this disease, losses that weigh heavily and remind me why awareness is so urgently needed. Every teal light, every social media message and every proclamation, including yours helps someone recognize symptoms earlier and brings much needed awareness to this insidious disease. It truly saves lives and honors the women lost far too soon.

I'm so grateful that with the help of City Manager Greg Caton, we're also illuminating the WestWorld horse's teals in honor the Ovarian Cancer Awareness Month and I urge all residents and survivors do check them out during the month of September. Thank you for standing with survivors, honoring the women he would lost and protect the families across the city of Scottsdale and the great state of Arizona. I appreciate the opportunity to stand before you and share my comments which are not only critical in the community setting but can truly make a difference in this city. Your continued leadership makes a real and lasting difference. We can shine a light on this gravely overlooked disease and give hope to the women and families who need it most.

Mayor Borowsky: Thank you. Thank you for being here, Rachel.

EXECUTIVE SESSION

[Time: 00:12:54]

All right. As is always the case during tonight's meeting, the Council may make a motion to recess into Executive Session, if legal advice is needed on any applicable agenda item, if authorized by the Council, the Executive Session will be held immediately, will not be open to the public and this meeting would

resume immediately following.

MEETING MINUTES

Meeting Minutes, next we have approval of the minutes unless there's any revisions, I will entertain a motion to approve Regular Meeting and Work Study Session Minutes of July 1, 2026, Regular Meeting and Work Study Session Minutes of July 2, 2026, and Special Meeting Minutes of August 3, 2026.

Councilwoman Littlefield: So moved.

Councilman Graham: Second.

Mayor Borowsky: Please indicate your vote. Thank you. On the Consent Agenda...

Ben Lane: Mayor, I apologize, we have a presentation tonight, in related to the employee recognition program.

Mayor Borowsky: Oh, yes. I thought that was my proclamation plugged in there.

PRESENTATION/INFORMATION UPDATES

[Time: 00:13:48]

City of Scottsdale is proud to recognize employees with 20 or more years of service as of September 2026. With that, I will turn it over to Holly Peralta Communications Senior Director.

Communications Senior Director Holly Peralta: Thank you, Mayor Borowsky, good evening. As I'm here every month and you know, we take a moment each month to recognize employees who reach service anniversaries. Tonight we have employees with us who reached 20 years of service or more and I would love to have those who are with us this evening come up and join us for recognition. We have Anna Berry, she's reached 20 years of service. Marcos Perez. Ramona Higera, she has 25 years of service and Jose Montero, with 25 years of service. Please come forward and let us acknowledge you for those years of dedication.

Mayor Borowsky: All right, now on to the oh, congratulations to everyone and there were more on that board. So, thank you for your years, decades, actually, as it turns out, of service. Thank you.

CONSENT AGENDA

[Time: 00:16:40]

Next, we have Consent agenda items number 1 through 11, and unless the City Council has any questions on the Consent Agenda or wishes to remove one of the items I'm going to go ahead and yeah.

Got it. And before we take a motion or after, whichever the case might be, doesn't matter I know. I'm getting to the speaker. We have Carla, is Carla here? Oh, there you are. And she's primed and ready to go. Come on up. And this is on agenda item number 10.

Carla: Thank you very much. I don't want to make you wait. Carla peaceful valley resident and long-time trolley user. I'm here on item number 10 about the lease for the new trolley company. And before you consider this lease, I want to share a few things with you. Rumors are rampant that the trolley is going to be cut way back and there's letters and posts suggesting that it even be ended, because they say it's empty all the time. Yes, certain times of the day, it does look empty, especially when you don't have the student rush, but the reality is there's a steady stream of people who cannot drive who are users. Most of them seniors like me. And it's essential to our lives.

Dial-a-Ride is suggested as alternatives. I can tell you from personal experience that if and I can tell you, it's a really big if, if they do show up, those rides, you're lucky it's one to two hours late. It's just not functional. The city cab voucher program does help a lot for short rides within a 5-mile radius, but beyond that, for example, there's a medical specialist that has relocated all of its doctors up to Raintree and the freeway. Even with the voucher program to get here to there, it's a \$40 round trip fee, which if you're on set Social Security, it's very hard to do. But instead, you can take both trolleys and get exactly up there for free. So, the trolleys are a huge help.

There is a lot of wonderful things that Scottsdale has, but sometimes I wish that every one of you who has to take actions on transportation issues like this, would have to go a month without being able to drive and then you would understand the challenges and perhaps think differently when you vote. We're fortunate to live in Scottsdale. There's so many wonderful amenities and services and some of those amenities, like the art museums, are somewhat subsidized. And for decades, Scottsdale has helped people who need extra help through Scottsdale cares, through the Paiute neighborhood center, through our wonderful senior centers. Well, the trolley program is a service like that also.

There was an article in the paper today about how Arizona is aging, and it talks about the things that we're going to have to seriously address, and one of them is transportation. So, whomever gets this contract and I understand there's a court case, or whoever gets this lease, I would ask you to direct them and make sure that they respect this need and keep this commitment, especially to your seniors. Thank you.

Mayor Borowsky: Thank you, Carla. We appreciate your input.

[Time: 00:20:32]

Councilman Graham: Mayor.

Mayor Borowsky: I see you. Councilman Graham, before we move on. Go ahead.

Councilman Graham: Mayor, thank you. I will probably ask the city manager just real quick, that's the

first I heard about sharp cuts to the trolley service. Are you aware of any such sharp cuts that are coming?

City Manager Greg Caton: Madam Mayor and Councilman Graham, and actually this item, although it talks about the service, it's really an office space. But to answer your question for the record, no. We're not aware of any significant we are evaluating. We often evaluate the service.

Councilman Graham: I was on transportation commission for seven years and we always, we always looked at the routes and tweaked them and this route wasn't getting used, you know, this route was and so we always need to be open minded about rerouting and to serve more customers but I wasn't aware of any sharp, deep cuts. Thank you, city manager. Thank you, Carla. Thank you, Mayor.

Mayor Borowsky: All right. I don't see any other speakers. There's no other speakers on the Consent Agenda items I will entertain a motion for items 1 to 11.

Councilwoman Littlefield: Move to approve.

Councilwoman Whitehead: Second.

Mayor Borowsky: Okay. Please indicate your vote.

REGULAR AGENDA – ITEM 12

[Time: 00:22:06]

Thank you, moving on to the Regular Agenda. First is Number 12, the Police and Fire Department's Veterinary Professional Services Contract will be presented by Chief Joe LeDuc, our Chief of Police. Welcome.

Chief of Police Joe LeDuc: Good evening. Thank you, good evening, Madam Mayor and members of Council. I'm here to talk about a contract involving the veterinary services for police and fire working canines. Our requested action is to adopt Resolution 13757 to authorize, approve and direct the Mayor to execute contract number 2026-139-COS with Svoboda Veterinary Services LLC, doing business as Hayden Road Animal Hospital for working canines within the police and fire departments. And authorize the city manager or designate others to execute such other documents and take such other actions necessary to carry out the intent of the resolution.

So just for some background, Hayden Road Animal Hospital is located at 818 North Hayden Road within the city of Scottsdale and it's a full veterinary service clinic that was established in 2014. I'm pleased to actually say that we have been our canines, our working canines have been clients of them since 2014. They offer not only normal dental services, I'm sorry, veterinary services to include, including dental services, and they have equipment on site that's important for immediate diagnosis, especially when working with canines that are working in special capacities like ours are.

In addition to that, the veterinarians that are at the clinic see about 90% the working dogs, police working dogs within the valley. They have an expertise on how to take care of the special needs of these dogs and they have availed themselves to be reachable by cell phone any given day, any given hour, which is extraordinary for us. The canine programs that are supported through this contract are patrol canine unit, the police crisis intervention services unit, the school resource canines and the search and rescue dogs, many of which you all several weeks ago had the opportunity to meet. So that supports 17 dogs throughout both the police and the fire department.

The estimated annual spend is about \$60,000. It's a cost per year and it includes all medical evaluations and any emergency care that they would need to receive, including nutritional needs and things like that. They do we are looking for an initial one-year contract with the ability to sign four additional one-year renewals. We believe this funding is sufficient to support our ongoing needs. There's no additional staffing required and there's no cost recovery options for this.

So, our recommendation is the adoption of Resolution 13757, approving contract number 2026-139-COS for veterinary services for the working canines of police and the fire departments. There's no significant issues to be addressed at this time. With that, if you have any questions, I'm happy to answer them.

Mayor Borowsky: Thank you so much, Chief LeDuc. Councilman Kwasman.

[Time: 00:25:40]

Councilman Kwasman: Thank you. Chief, I have no questions for you. I mean, this there's no question in terms of that the canines need veterinary care. My question is for the city manager, asking why wasn't this in the budget? It was in the budget. This is just the final adoption of it, am I correct on that?

City Manager Greg Caton: Yes.

Councilman Kwasman: Was all four years in the budget? The renewal aspect of it. That's what I was asking.

City Manager Greg Caton: Madam Mayor, Councilman Kwasman, this is the contract. So, the funding is available for this contract. We bring forward the contract and we felt to bring this forward this was so much love for the four-legged employees that we have, we call them canines and we wanted to bring this forward for your hands on approach to the contract as we look to their veterinary care.

Councilman Kwasman: Right, but the question I'm asking is in terms of the renewal aspect of it. My understanding is that this is this is giving this is allocating the police department the ability to renew this, which is which, again, I understand that is was that aspect of it already allocated in this fiscal budget where are we catching up? Are we proactively funding future contracts or are we going to retroactively put them in the budget without a vote? This is kind of my that's my question here. Where is the...

City Manager Greg Caton: Madam Mayor and Councilman Kwasman, I hope not to protract this any longer, this awkward situation. It's pretty straightforward item, we're looking forward. So, this is in the budget and it's the contract that we bring forward for your consideration. It does have some automatic renewals in there, but this is a contract that we would bring forward for your consideration.

Councilman Kwasman: Thank you. No other questions.

Mayor Borowsky: Vice Mayor McAllen.

[Time: 00:27:39]

Vice Mayor McAllen: Thank you, Mayor. With that I move that we adopt Resolution number 13757, authorizing contract number 2026-139-COS professional services contract with Svoboda Veterinary Services LLC.

Councilwoman Whitehead: Second.

Mayor Borowsky: Thank you. And I have no public speakers on this item. So, let's go ahead and register our votes. Thank you, Chief LeDuc.

Chief LeDuc: Thank you.

Mayor Borowsky: Sorry, can you step back up. Councilwoman Littlefield has a question.

Councilwoman Littlefield: Thank you, Mayor. I just wanted to know when the I fully approve of this and the medical care for the dogs and all this, but when the dogs retire, is there any kind of medical ongoing care that we give the retired dogs in their older age or is that then left to the handler to take care of?

Chief LeDuc: Madam Mayor, Councilwoman Littlefield, that's an excellent question, and it actually was brought up when we had the presentation with the dogs and got us thinking about that. So, as it exists now, we don't have ongoing medical care for the handlers would take the dog who take the dogs with them, it's the responsibility of the handler. We started looking at how we can implement something to help support them. We found out that there are some legal impediments to supply stipends for retired dogs because there's a gift clause in there, however, what we have identified as a mechanism through foundations to support the dogs after retirement and so the actually, he's here. Sergeant Pitt has been working through a process for that and we look forward to getting that implemented in a very short time, probably within a month to put those structures up and make sure the handlers do get some compensation for the care of their dogs. It was an idea that was born here that we are following up on.

Councilwoman Littlefield: Thank you very much. I would like to hear what you find.

Chief LeDuc: Thank you.

Mayor Borowsky: Thank you. So much.

ITEM 13

[Time: 00:29:54]

Moving right along to item 13. This is the U.S. Customs and Border Protection Services item at the Scottsdale Airport. It involves a memorandum of agreement and I have Rick Wielebski, Aviation Director. It's been a while since I said your last name, Rick.

Aviation Director Rick Wielebski: You almost got it right this time, Madam Mayor.

Mayor Borowsky: This time? What have you got for us?

Rick Wielebski: Madam Mayor, members of Council, thanks for having us back this evening to talk about Resolution number 13746, requesting authorization of Contract 2026-145-COS. This is a memorandum of agreement with Customs and Border Protection and the city of Scottsdale, the Scottsdale Airport and really what it is, is adding a third officer to our already office of two, officer for customs and border patrol at the airport.

A little bit of history. Customs and Border Protection was established at Scottsdale Airport in 1999, and basically just to meet international arrivals to Scottsdale Airport. Prior to 1999, if they arrived at the airport, they would have to clear for customs they would have to clear at another airport and then relocate to Scottsdale. It was set up as a user fee facility, instead a port of entry. Basically, it's an agreement that the city has with customs and border protection and at that time, it was one officer there five days per week.

In by 2013, operations had grown to 450 uses per year, and there was a need demonstrated for seven days a week coverage and 2013, City Council authorized an updated memorandum of agreement with to to two officers for seven day coverage. In 2018, we built the new aeronautical business center with you new modern customs and border protection facilities and since 2013, since the latest MOA, it's grown to over 2,000 international operations per year.

Now, in 2026, we have seen an increase in business travel arrivals that have more than 10 passengers on an aircraft. So periodically we will look out a window and see a typical business jet come in and maybe they have more people on the aircraft with more than ten people. Typical customs and border protection policy is to have two officers to clear with more than 10 people on board. And JSX also you are aware, said they will supply service to Cabo. So, they supplied us with international schedule and this will require us to have another officer so we have two officer coverage for some flights as needed. Not just for those Cabo flights but also you can imagine an aircraft that holds 30 passengers, it takes a little longer to clear. So, as we have other international arrivals coming in we will need that extra officer to have to keep the operations moving.

So, a quick look at the P&L on this, with the schedule that they gave us, that JSX gave us, that they are booking flights for today, they are about \$427,000 in annual revenue and about \$317,000 in expenses between labor and some other items that come with international arrivals and that makes revenue gains versus expenses of \$110,000 per year. We do anticipate more locations in Mexico to be announced in the coming months, and some more resort destinations. So that revenue number will only grow. With that, I'm happy to answer any questions.

Mayor Borowsky: Thank you. Councilman Graham.

[Time: 00:33:55]

Councilman Graham: Thank you for your presentation. This doesn't change the size of the planes coming in and out. It just changes the frequency and the category?

Rick Wielebski: Councilman Graham, that's correct. It doesn't change anything like that.

Councilman Graham: Thank you.

Mayor Borowsky: All right. Rick, I don't see any other questions, and we don't have any speakers on this item. And I think it sounds like a great idea. So, with that, I will make a motion to approve item number 12.

Councilwoman Whitehead: Second.

Mayor Borowsky: Oh, 13. Where did my sheet go here? I will make a motion to approve item number 13 and that is the U.S. Customs and Border Protection Services at Scottsdale Airport M.O.A.

Councilwoman Whitehead: Second.

Mayor Borowsky: Thank you. Please indicate your vote. There we go. Thank you so much.

Rick Wielebski: Thank you very much.

Mayor Borowsky: All right. That concludes our Regular Agenda items. That was quick.

PUBLIC COMMENT

Now we turn our attention to public comment announcement, public comment is reserved for Scottsdale citizens, business owners and/or property owners to comment on non-agendized items that are within the Council's jurisdiction. No official Council action can be taken on the items the speakers address and they are each limited to three minutes a piece.

So, if you haven't already signed up and you wish to, please see our city clerk and he will add your name, otherwise, I have Dan Ishac and Andrew Wollman are the only two speakers.

[Time: 00:35:36]

Dan Ishac: I will need the overhead, please. Dan Ishac, address on record. Mayor and Council, thank you. At the last meeting, I and another speaker spoke about a couple of the untrue statements that Barry Graham has made as a Councilmember. I thought for public record, I would actually list what I consider Barry's biggest lies so far and whether it has to do with the Axon election timing or the parking garage in Old Town or the cost of canceling the roundabout, et cetera, Barry has been proven to not speak the truth. He also was found guilty of violating ethics by trying to remove funding for a sidewalk for a blind senior citizen.

So, what is Barry's response when residents actually point out his misstatements and lies? Well, the first thing he does is block them on social media. Whether it's Facebook or Nextdoor, there have been dozens of people that Barry has blocked so that he can continue making false statements. If that doesn't work, he attacks them using his surrogate Scott Dalevoter, and Yes to Scottsdale. If that doesn't work, well, he voted to move public comment to the end of meetings so fewer and fewer residents would actually hear people pointing out his lies. When that doesn't work, he attacks those people by having in-person comments at Council meetings like at the last meeting, one of his supporters, I think his name is Trollman spoke about my posts on Facebook.

Now, it's interesting that Barry and Adam repeatedly call points of order when things are outside ever the purview of the Council. And, in fact we had our city attorney say that things must be in the purview and he went on record to say if it's not something the Council can vote on, then technically outside the purview. So, I don't understand how a private residents' posts on Facebook can be allowed at a Council meeting.

Barry then chooses to repeat his lies and he also plays the victim, oh, Axon is attacking me because I stood up to them. And then he also can chooses to intimidate his opposition by using the police, whether it's by claiming that he feels threatened and has the police go speak to private citizens or asks them to be removed from City Hall. All of these behaviors are reprehensible. Barry Graham is a liar. He's a coward. Thank you.

Oh, sorry one other thing. Still waiting for that work study session on water, which was delayed because August and September are so busy. Three meetings, very short. Why are we not discussing the water issue? Thank you.

Mayor Borowsky: Thank you, Dan. Next and last, we have Andrew Wollman.

[Time: 00:38:57]

Andrew Wollman: Mayor, Councilmembers here we go. Hang on. Dan must be a little taller than I am.

Mayor, Councilmembers, I'm here today, I'm probably good time to be here. I'm asking for clear and consistent of rules governing public comment. For months several speakers, including the last one have repeatedly used public comment to attack one City Councilmember who is a candidate for City Council. It's focused on Barry Graham. He has no practical opportunity to answer during public comment. Meeting after meeting, in a seemingly coordinated manner, this has occurred.

Four Councilmembers decided to move the public comments to the end of the meeting without restraining or changing the amount of time each person has to speak. So, they didn't eliminate the speaking opportunity. This was a procedural vote and is now being used as a weapon as portraying it as proof that Barry Graham doesn't want to hear the public. The attacks have helped cause the change and now the change is another attack.

[Time: 00:40:21]

If the Council prohibited advocacy for or against candidates during public comment, what objective rule is being used to enforce that rule? Is criticism of a candidate fair game during election season simply because it's described as criticism? Does this repeated pattern, including using Council procedure rule response as campaign ammunition cross the line of advocacy against a candidate? Calling a statement criticism does not become an automatic loophole.

The Council must consider words, repetition, timing, target, and the purpose and the effect and the influence on our election. The same standard must be applied to every speaker and every candidate. If this is a legal question, I welcome clarification from the city attorney. If it can not be answered tonight, please place it on the agenda for a formal interpretation.

Impartiality. The Mayor publicly urged people not to vote for Barry Graham and is now promoting this procedural vote as a political issue. This creates a reasonable question about impartiality if the Council must decide whether comments attacking him violate the rules. I asked the Mayor to disclose her decision and recuse herself from any decision about whether advocacy against Mr. Graham occurred. I'm not claiming recusal is legally required. I'm asking how the Council will ensure the future. Election rules mean little if enforced selectively. The public deserves a clear standard, applied evenly at every future meeting.

A good example is on August 25th, Melissa Kay said that this issue would become a nonissue on November 30th. She clearly was referencing the election. So, this is all electioneering and we should stop it. Thank you.

Mayor Borowsky: Thank you, Mr. Wollman. We appreciate your input. I don't see any other public comments for non-agendized items, and as a result, we're going to move right along to petitions, Citizen Petitions which we have none. So that actually concludes our Regular Agenda business, and I will now open it up to Councilmember Reports. Anybody? Any takers? Councilman Kwasman.

COUNCILMEMBER REPORTS

Councilman Kwasman: Thank you, Madam Mayor. Two quick things. It was a pleasure to be at today's Board Meeting for the Scottsdale Museum of the West, and the board is I can assure you the board is one that looks towards Scottsdale as a true partner and I am looking forward to reporting back to this Council not wait until I get a couple board meetings under me to see where we're going and having private meetings with Councilmembers. Not immediately but at the right time. So, there's that.

And second, very happy new year, shana tova for anybody celebrating Rosh Hashanah this weekend.

Mayor Borowsky: Thank you. Vice Mayor McAllen.

[Time: 00:43:29]

Vice Mayor McAllen: Thank you, Mayor. I just wanted to say I had the pleasure of attending last week the city's premier of "Diamond in the Dust", a documentary about 75 years in Scottsdale, that our very own public affairs office, our PIO Gayle Bass, I know she did the most of it. She did the emceeing of it, but there was also Bruce Wall and the IT and the technical team and video channel 11 and all the work but Holly Peralta, your team rocked it. It was a wonderful documentary.

It was a packed house and on top of that, this Thursday, I wanted to invite the public to Civic Center Library, 6:00 p.m. There will be a book signing. It's a continuation of the celebration of 75 years of Scottsdale. We're 75 local residents took part in writing a book called "Hands on Scottsdale." And that was written predominantly and created by Joan Fudala and Bruce Wall who is a staff person here and that's another 75 years of our celebration and I'm really looking forward to Thursday night.

Mayor Borowsky: Thank you. Councilman Graham.

Councilman Graham: Mayor, thank you. I hope everyone had a good Labor Day weekend and we have, for the 25th Anniversary of 9/11 on Friday, at I believe it's 6:45 or 6:00 a.m., we will be reading the names of the fallen out here on Civic Center, Scottsdale's Civic Center. So, I'm sure it will be a solemn experience and we hope to see you there.

And I also wanted to share that I was honored to and it the funeral of former Councilman Wayne Ecton at the Messinger Mortuary on Pinnacle and it was a very nice service. Councilman Ecton served on the Council for two terms from 2002 to 2010. And I got to meet his grandchildren and his kids and his grandchildren, and we got to celebrate his life.

And then also I was going to mention Thursday, but the Vice Mayor mentioned that. So, I'm looking forward to that. There's a lot coming up and we are very excited about that. Thank you, Madam Mayor.

Mayor Borowsky: Thank you and I should have mentioned this in the Mayor's Report. The Scottsdale Rodeo is this weekend at WestWorld. It's a big deal. I'm glad I was just reminded to announce that. It's

Friday, Saturday and Sunday and you can go to Scottsdalerodeo.com to check the schedule and get your tickets.

I would encourage all of you to attend. It's quite an event. So, thank you all for being here tonight and with that, I will move to adjourn.

Councilwoman Whitehead: Second.

Mayor Borowsky: Thank you. We are adjourned.

ADJOURNMENT

[Time: 00:46:34]